

# ASSESSMENT OF ASEAN COUNTRIES' CONCRETE SDG IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS:

# POLICIES AND BUDGETS REPORTED IN THEIR 2016-2020 VOLUNTARY NATIONAL REVIEWS (VNRS)

Mark Elder

August 2020 IGES Policy Report



## Assessment of ASEAN Countries' Concrete SDG Implementation Efforts: Policies and Budgets Reported in Their 2016-2020 Voluntary National Reviews (VNRs)

Mark Elder

**IGES Policy Report** 

Copyright © 2020 Institute for Global Environmental Strategies. All rights reserved.

#### **Institute for Global Environmental Strategies (IGES)**

2108-11, Kamiyamaguchi, Hayama, Kanagawa, 240-0115, Japan

Tel: +81-46-855-3700 Fax: +81-46-855-3709

E-mail: iges@iges.or.jp URL: http://www.iges.or.jp/

ISBN:-978-4-88788-246-1

IGES is an international research institute conducting practical and innovative research for realising sustainable development in the Asia-Pacific region.

No parts of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from IGES.

Although every effort is made to ensure objectivity and balance, the publication of research results or translation does not imply IGES endorsement or acquiescence with its conclusions or the endorsement of IGES financers. IGES maintains a position of neutrality at all times on issues concerning public policy. Hence conclusions that are reached in IGES publications should be understood to be those of the authors and not attributed to staff members, officers, directors, trustees, funders, or to IGES itself.

## ASSESSMENT OF ASEAN COUNTRIES' CONCRETE SDG IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS:

# POLICIES AND BUDGETS REPORTED IN THEIR 2016-2020 VOLUNTARY NATIONAL REVIEWS (VNRs)

Mark Elder

### August 2020 IGES Policy Report

#### **Abstract**

This report assesses to what extent the national governments of ASEAN countries have made concrete domestic efforts to implement the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in terms of policies and budgets as listed in their Voluntary National Reviews (VNRs). Methods used by this report are similar to those used by a comparable study of the G20 countries. Existing assessments of countries' VNRs have not systematically analysed policies and budgets but instead focused on levels of achievement, processes of SDG implementation and VNR preparation, and how various specific topics are addressed in VNRs. Despite discouraging overall assessments of SDG progress around the time of the 2019 HLPF, this report found that the 9 ASEAN countries which reported VNRs listed many policies but only a few specific budget allocations. The types of policies ranged widely including laws, major thematic and sectoral action plans and strategies, and mandatory regulations as well as voluntary programs and small initiatives. The analysis suggested that most countries probably underreported their policy efforts, especially countries which listed fewer policies. In the future, countries should indicate the budget amounts which are linked to the policies listed in their VNRs. Since the countries listed many substantial policies, the actual budget amounts allocated to SDGs probably are also substantial. SDGs are very broad and cover most policy areas, so a majority or possibly most government spending could be related to SDGs, with some exceptions such as interest payments and military spending. To gauge the potential scale of government spending on SDGs, this report presents government expenditures as a percentage of GDP. This report cannot assess how well the policies were implemented, nor to what extent the policies and budgets contributed to SDG progress. However, this compilation does provide some indication of each country's priorities, so hopefully it may provide a foundation for further analysis of the policies' appropriateness and effectiveness. The key recommendation is that VNRs should emphasize which efforts are new and/or additional, and how they are linked with progress on outcomes. Thus, policies and budgets should be more systematically reported and linked together in VNRs, and countries should clearly indicate which policies and budgets are existing, continuing, and/or new. Myanmar has not submitted a VNR, but this study examined its Sustainable Development Plan (2018-2030) which has a format is similar to a VNR, and its elements are mapped to SDG targets. It lists a range of major policies and strategies, although not as many as other ASEAN countries, and it also does not include specific budget amounts.

#### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

1.	INTE	RODUCTION	2
:	1.1	Objective	2
:	1.2	Review of Existing Research	3
:	1.3	Outline of This Report	6
2.	MET	HODS	7
3.	ANA	LYSIS OF INDIVIDUAL COUNTRIES	9
3	3.1	Brunei Darussalam	9
3	3.2	Cambodia	19
3	3.3	Indonesia	25
3	3.4	Lao PDR	37
3	3.5	Malaysia	41
3	3.6	Myanmar	47
3	3.7	Philippines	49
3	3.8	Singapore	54
3	3.9	Thailand	69
3	3.10	Viet Nam	76
4.	CON	IPARATIVE ANALYSIS	82
4	4.1	Comparison of Countries' Overall Strategy and Approach to VNRs and SDGs	82
4	4.2	Policy Comparison	82
4	4.3	Budget Comparison	85
5.	CON	ICLUSIONS	87
RE	FEREN	CES	89
ENI	DNIOT	2	92

#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

The author would like to express sincere appreciation and thanks to Peter King, Eric Zusman, Bindu Lohani, Kazuo Matsushita, Hidefumi Imura, Vong Sok, Tri Sulistyo Saputro, Natalia Derodofa, Nobuaki Ito, Hirotaka Koike, Gemma Ellis, and Oliver Turner for their timely and valuable comments which were very helpful in improving this report. The author would also like to thank IGES President Kazuhiko Takeuchi and Executive Directory Hideyuki Mori for their strong support of IGES work on SDGs, including this report.

### **TABLES**

Table 1: VNRs of ASEAN Countries	7
Table 2: Policies Mentioned in Brunei Darussalam's VNR	9
Table 3: Budget Items Listed in Brunei Darussalam's VNR	17
Table 4: Policies Mentioned in Cambodia's VNR	19
Table 5: Policies Mentioned in Indonesia's 2017 VNR	26
Table 6: Policies Mentioned in Indonesia's 2019 VNR	29
Table 7: Budget Items Listed in Indonesia's 2019 VNR	36
Table 8: Lao PDR's NSEDP Outcomes and Targets Mapped to SDGs	37
Table 9: Policies Mentioned in Lao PDR's VNR Classified by SDGs	38
Table 10: Comparison of Malaysia's Eleventh National Plan and SDGs	41
Table 11: Policies Mentioned in Malaysia's VNR	43
Table 12: Policies Mentioned in Myanmar's Sustainable Development Plan (2018-2030)	48
Table 13: Policies Mentioned in the Philippines' VNR	49
Table 14: Policies Mentioned in Singapore's VNR	54
Table 15: Budget Items listed in Singapore's VNR	68
Table 16: Policies Mentioned in Thailand's VNR	
Table 17: Budget Allocations Mentioned in Thailand's VNR	75
Table 18: Concrete SDG Implementation Policies Listed in Viet Nam's VNR	76
Table 19: Overall Situation and Strategy for Reporting SDGs in the VNRs of the ASEAN Count	ries 82
Table 20: Comparison of Number of Policies by SDG for ASEAN Countries	84
Table 21: Total Number of Policies of ASEAN Countries by SDG	85
Table 22: Number of SDG Policies Compared to GDP, GDP per capita, and Government Reve	nues and
Fxpenditures/ GDP	86

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1 Objective

This report assesses to what extent the ASEAN countries are making concrete domestic efforts to implement the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The main "efforts" examined by this report are national government policies reported in the countries' Voluntary National Reviews (VNRs) which were presented at the High-level Political Forum (HLPF) from 2016-2020. This report also examines Myanmar's Sustainable Development Plan (2018-2030) even though it was not submitted as a VNR. It was also intended to examine national budget allocations for SDGs, but there was very little discussion of budget amounts in any of the VNRs published by the ASEAN countries. Instead, since SDGs are very broad and cover most policy areas, this report looks at total government spending to gauge the potential scale of government spending on SDGs, as a rough proxy. A majority of government spending is probably related to SDGs, excluding areas such as debt payments and military spending.

SDGs generally cannot be implemented without policies; certainly, strong policies would greatly strengthen and accelerate implementation. There are other means such as budgets, development assistance, etc., but policies provide direction and are one of the key means of implementation used by national governments. National governments made the final decision to adopt the SDGs and are responsible and accountable for their implementation and monitoring, even if major contributions are made by other stakeholders. SDG 17 on means of implementation does not mention policies. Nevertheless, some ASEAN countries explicitly mentioned the importance of policies in general, and all countries indicated a range of specific policies in their VNRs.

Efforts by non-governmental stakeholders, especially businesses, are also important, but assessing them is beyond the scope of this report. Assessing national government policies is already a major project, and fortunately, governments included information on them in their VNRs. Most VNRs include some information on other stakeholders, but this is generally limited to a few examples, and comprehensive data are not easily available. Still, most ASEAN governments reported some policies to promote stakeholder participation, so these policies were included in the compilation for this report.

Overall, this report found that the 9 ASEAN countries which submitted VNRs listed a substantial number of policies, ranging from 77 to 270. Myanmar also listed 34 major policies and strategies, a solid number though fewer than the other ASEAN countries. All countries which submitted VNRs reported a variety of types of policies ranging from broad framework plans and strategies to small-scale, narrowly focused policies and programs.

This report cannot assess how well the policies have been implemented, or to what extent they contributed to SDG progress. However, this compilation does provide some indication of each country's priorities, and it is also hoped that this report could provide a foundation for further analysis of the policies' appropriateness and effectiveness.

This report follows a previous report by the author on SDG implementation efforts by the G20 countries, and it uses similar methods (Elder and Bartalini 2019). However, this report does not compare the ASEAN and G20 countries' VNRs because the report on the G20 countries does not include information from the 2019 or 2020 VNRs.

Now is a good time to conduct this assessment, since the first phase of the review of VNRs by the HLPF has finished, and all 17 SDGs have been highlighted in the first round of VNR

reporting between 2016 and 2020. Of the 10 ASEAN countries, 9 have submitted VNRs. Two countries (Indonesia and the Philippines) submitted 2 VNRs, while the other 7 countries each submitted 1 VNR. The results of this report can help to understand the overall progress of the countries on the SDGs as well as provide insights for possible improvement of the VNRs.

Moreover, overall assessments of SDG progress around the time of the 2019 HLPF were rather discouraging, despite a certain amount of progress. UN Secretary General Antonio Guterres stated that "despite considerable efforts these past four years, we are not on track to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals by 2030. We must dramatically step up the pace of implementation," in his Foreword to the Global Sustainable Development Report 2019. In the Preface to the same report, Under-Secretary General Liu Zhenmin added that "the report makes clear that we are at risk of irreversibly degrading natural systems that sustain us" (Independent Group of Scientists 2019). The conclusion of UNESCAP's assessment of SDG progress in Asia and the Pacific is even more worrying: the region "will not achieve any of the 17 SDGs by 2030." It noted that while "progress has been made towards some SDGs... the rate of progress is insufficient," and "for more than half the SDGs, progress is stagnant or heading in the wrong direction" (UNESCAP 2019).

There was little change in the assessment of SDG progress in 2020. In the Global Sustainable Development Report 2020, UNSG Antonio Guterres concluded that "change was still not happening at the speed or scale required," even before the COVID-19 pandemic (United Nations 2020). The Asia-Pacific region may have made more progress than some regions (Sachs, J., Schmidt-Traub, G., Kroll, C., Lafortune, G., Fuller, G., Woelm 2020). Nevertheless, UNESCAP's SDG progress report concluded that the region "is not on track to achieve any of the 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) by 2030," and "without extra efforts, the region is likely to miss all 17 goals by 2030." The report adds that the region is "going backwards" on SDGs 12 and 13 (UNESCAP 2020).

Therefore, a major issue for further study is how to reconcile the apparent significant policy efforts of the ASEAN countries with the overall lack of progress on SDGs. Unfortunately, it is not possible for this report to assess the effectiveness of ASEAN countries' policies. Simply compiling the policies listed in the VNRs was a major task. Nevertheless, this study provides a good basis to enable future research on the effectiveness of these policies. Then, how the level of SDG achievement is related to policy efforts could be assessed later.

#### 1.2 Review of Existing Research

Major previous assessments of SDG implementation were reviewed by Elder and Bartalini (2019), who observed that "previous assessments ... have mainly focused on the level of countries' readiness for implementation, level of achievement (including the countries' starting point, the extent to which the goals were already achieved), and implementation structures. Other areas of focus have included stakeholder engagement, progress on data and indicators, and attention to specific topics such as 'leave no one behind.' Certainly, these are key points which need to be assessed. However, the degree of effort, especially national level policies and funding from national budgets, has been missing from these assessments, which have mainly mentioned selected examples rather than examining efforts more systematically" (p. 1). The previous review included the Synthesis Reports on VNRs and other related reports prepared by the UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UN DESA 2017, 2018c, 2018b), two broad reviews (CCIC - Canadian Council for International Co-operation 2018; Together 2030 2017), one example of a review of specific topics (Sarwar and Nicolai 2018), and data collection efforts (UNESCAP 2019). Another study (Wagner 2018) reviewed major efforts to

monitor national progress on SDG indicators (UN Secretary General 2017; Bertelsmann Stiftung and Sustainable Development Solutions Network 2018).

Since then, some additional studies have been published, which are reviewed separately here. The synthesis report of the 2019 VNRs prepared by the UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA) provided examples of countries' plans, policies, and strategies, and it discussed the extent of integration of SDGs into national plans and budgets (UN DESA 2019). However, there was no broader or systematic analysis of policies. The importance of national budgets and the efforts of some countries to increase domestic resource mobilization were mentioned, but there was no focused or detailed analysis of budgets or listing of examples. Overall, the discussion of policies and budgets in the 2019 report was similar to the discussion in the 2018 report (UN DESA 2018c) as reviewed by (Elder and Bartalini 2019).

The 2019 edition of the SDG Index and Dashboards report (Sachs et al. 2019) maintains its focus on degree of attainment of targets and indicators, but it also includes a section on "government efforts to implement the SDG transformations." It proposes three ways to measure efforts: 1) "high-level public statements," 2) "strategic use of public practices and procedures for the goals (coordination mechanisms, budget, procurement, human resource management, data and audits)," and 3) "content of government strategies and policy actions" (p. 4). However, it only collects data on a limited number of countries, including only 2 ASEAN countries (Indonesia and the Philippines), and it only collects data on the first measure, and partially for the second, but not the third. The third measure is also the main focus of this study on ASEAN countries. And regarding budgets, the Index and Dashboards report looks at central government documents, while this report on ASEAN looks at reporting in the VNRs.

The 2020 edition (Sachs, J., Schmidt-Traub, G., Kroll, C., Lafortune, G., Fuller, G., Woelm 2020) maintains a similar focus on attainment of targets and indicators. One new recommendation that it makes is that "outcome data" (the main focus of the report) "should be complemented by other, more qualitative, assessments of policy efforts and other actions in support of the goals." Of course doing this would be very challenging, but they contend that analyzing "the content of government strategies and policy actions" ... "provides the most actionable and valuable information on governments' efforts to achieve the SDGs," and they recommend the use of policy trackers (p. 49). This report on ASEAN VNRs itself is not a policy tracker, but its compilation of policies could support the development of policy trackers in various areas.

Of course, the UN's main Sustainable Development Goals Report 2020 (United Nations 2020) continues its core focus on goal and target attainment as well as the need for data innovations. And like previous versions, it does not address countries' SDG policies or budgets.

Another recent review conducted a comparative analysis of the 2019 VNRs (Partners for Review 2019). This review covered a wide range of topics, and unlike past reviews, it also included some discussion of policies, plans, and budgets. Regarding policies and plans, the report noted that a majority of the 2019 VNRs highlighted a broad range of relevant sectoral plans, policies, and strategies, and about 30 percent of the VNRs (15 countries, including 2 ASEAN countries, Indonesia and the Philippines) indicated that the SDGs were incorporated into their national development plans (p. 23) or other "strategic frameworks, plans, or roadmaps" (including Indonesia) (p. 24). In addition, 9 countries (including one ASEAN country, Indonesia) adopted new legal and constitutional provisions relating to SDG implementation (p. 21). Regarding budgets, it noted that "approximately 30 percent of the 2019 VNR reports (including 2 ASEAN countries, Cambodia and Indonesia) included specific details about the

budget for SDG implementation, which in most cases is incorporated in the national budget (p. 20), "although cost analyses of the SDGs only feature in a few VNR reports (p. 21)." This trend of reporting plans, policies, and strategies was observed from Partners for Review's first analysis of the trends of the 2017 VNRs, which highlighted that these policies tended to be existing ones, often relating to specific sectors (Partners for Review 2018a). Their subsequent analysis of the 2018 VNRs showed increasing numbers of new plans, policies, and strategies, as well as greater linkage with overall national development strategies (Partners for Review 2018b).

In contrast to the analysis by Partners for Review, this report compiles specific information on the plans, policies, and strategies, and budgets of each country, providing a more detailed view of their level of effort. Moreover, this report has a narrower geographic focus on ASEAN (not global), and includes countries' VNRs for all years, not just 2019.

Some assessments focus on specific topics or SDGs, for example SDG 7 on energy (UN DESA 2018a). The International Labour Organisation issued a report covering all the elements of SDG 8 on economic growth, decent work, and environmental integrity (ILO 2019).

Several reports and studies of SDGs have focused on the Asia-Pacific and/or ASEAN. Nevertheless, like other studies, they are focused on attainment of goals and targets and data issues, and do not address national policies or budgets. UNESCAP's Asia and the Pacific SDG Progress Report 2020 is the key example of this (UNESCAP 2020). Another major report identified many complementarities between the ASEAN Community Vision 2025 and the SDGs, and suggested some ways to take advantage of them (UNESCAP, Kingdom of Thailand, and ASEAN 2017), while another report discussed progress on the follow-up (ASEAN-Thailand 2018), but these did not discuss the VNRs of individual countries. A report by the IMF and ASEAN examined the IMF's role in promoting progress on SDGs in ASEAN (IMF 2018). In addition to looking at ASEAN's progress on selected SDG indicators, it also examined the key issue of spending needs, and it recommended, in general, comprehensive country-specific policies in the context of national development plans. It also discussed the potential for ASEAN countries to strengthen domestic revenue generation. However, it did not discuss current policies or spending related to SDGs.

It is important to clarify that this report looking at ASEAN countries' VNRs does not examine ASEAN as an international organization. Rather, it only examines individual countries based on their self-reported VNRs.

To summarize this discussion, most existing assessments of VNRs still focus on issues such as the level of achievement, implementation structure, data development and collection, and the VNR reporting structure and processes, especially stakeholder participation, and specific topics or specific SDGs. Many also check whether countries include text indicating the "importance" of various topics. Certainly, it is important and worthwhile to assess these elements.

However, if the SDGs are "not on track," and if implementation "needs to be accelerated," as noted above, then it is also important to analyse the level of efforts to examine why they are not sufficient in order to develop ideas for how to help get implementation on track. Therefore, current assessments of VNRs, which do not address efforts, do not provide a sufficient basis to support recommendations for improvement. It is necessary to analyse the status of implementation efforts in order to explain why they are not producing "on track" results. Thus, assessments of VNRs should put more focus on concrete implementation efforts.

This report takes the first step to compile the policies and budgets listed in the ASEAN countries' VNRs to establish a baseline for the level of their domestic efforts. Unfortunately,

the VNRs do not provide much information about the degree of implementation of most policies, so it is not possible to address it in this report.

#### 1.3 Outline of This Report

The rest of this report is organized as follows. Section two discusses the methods. Section three compiles each individual country's national government policies on SDGs and budget examples and summarizes them in the context of the country's VNR. Section four presents three comparative analyses of a) overall strategy on SDGs, b) countries' SDG-related policies, and c) countries' SDG-related budgets. Section five concludes.

#### 2. METHODS

The methods used by this report are similar to those used in a previous report on SDG implementation efforts by the G20 countries (Elder and Bartalini 2019). The list of policies was developed exclusively from the countries' VNRs (and, in the case of Myanmar, its Sustainable Development Plan). All sections of each VNR were searched to identify policies and budgets, not only sections specifically designated as relating to them. The text used for listing each policy was taken as much as possible directly from the VNR, but it was edited and shortened in many cases to focus on the concrete contents. Other text was omitted such as statements about the rationale. Also, the scope of this report is limited to domestic policies and budgets, so policies related to international cooperation were not included.

One major difference is that the G20 report included a larger focus on budgets, since some G20 countries included significant budget-related discussions in their VNRs. However, this report on ASEAN countries includes very little specific information on budgets since the ASEAN countries included very little information about budgets in their VNRs. Another difference is that this report on ASEAN contains less discussion on the overall strategy of the VNRs. The G20 countries varied considerably in their overall approach to the SDGs and VNR reporting, so it was more difficult to compare and analyse their efforts. Some G20 countries created SDG plans which were organized quite differently from the 17-goal structure of the SDGs, while others reported on individual SDGs. In contrast, the ASEAN countries all reported on individual SDGs in their VNRs, even countries with overall national development plans which are structured differently from the SDGs. Some countries addressed all 17 SDGs while the others addressed only the SDGs highlighted at the HLPF in the year that the VNR was presented.

The goal structure of Myanmar's Sustainable Development Plan is considerably different from the structure of the SDGs, and Myanmar's Plan was not reported as a VNR. However, the Plan was examined here since it directly references SDGs, its timeline matches SDGs (up to 2030), and the style is similar to a VNR.

Eight of the ten ASEAN countries published a VNR between 2016 and 2019. As shown in Table 1, in 2016, the Philippines was the first ASEAN country to issue a VNR. By 2018, 7 of the 10 ASEAN countries had published a VNR. Two of the first three ASEAN countries to publish a VNR (in 2016 and 2017) published a second one in 2019 (Philippines and Indonesia). Myanmar has not announced a plan to prepare a VNR (it is not clear why), but it issued the "Myanmar Sustainable Development Plan (2018-2030)," which has been mapped to the SDGs (Government of the Union of Myanmar 2018).

Table 1: VNRs of ASEAN Countries

	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	Not Planned
Country	Philippines	• Indonesia • Thailand	<ul><li> Lao PDR</li><li> Malaysia</li><li> Singapore</li><li> Viet Nam</li></ul>	<ul><li>Cambodia</li><li>Indonesia*</li><li>Philippines*</li></ul>	Brunei Darussalam	Myanmar
Number	1 country	2 countries	4 countries	3 countries	1 country	1 country
SDGs highlighted at HLPF	None	1,2,3,5,9,14	6,7,11,12, 15	4,8,10,13,16		

<sup>\*</sup> Indonesia and the Philippines published two VNRs

This report adopted a broad definition of policy including general plans and strategies as well as detailed regulations. Nevertheless, the intention is to focus on concrete policies or measures, excluding general principles or statements about a topic's "importance," although determining "concreteness" is not easy. "Concrete" policies include plans, strategies, projects, initiatives, laws, revisions of laws, funds, hotlines, etc. While some degree of hierarchy could be implied by the titles of the policies, there is no reliable way to analyse systematically their relative importance.

This compilation includes a range of types of policies, both broad and narrow. These different types of policies are not strictly comparable, and there is no easy way to make them comparable. Most countries listed a range of types of policies. Policies with multiple components were counted as one policy, although concrete components were itemized in the description. In some cases, small and closely related policies or programs were clustered together and counted as one policy. Governments repeated some policies under more than one SDG. This report counted the policy each time it was listed under a different SDG, so there is some double counting. This seems justified since these policies usually are major policies with multiple components. Moreover, duplication indicates that countries are thinking in an integrated manner, at least to some extent, so some policies address more than one SDG. Some duplication may be partially offset by some clustering of smaller policy components into one policy.

The time period of each policy (such as the starting and/or ending date) could be determined in some cases, but not always. Therefore, it was not possible to comprehensively or systematically distinguish between existing and new policies, so all policies for each country, including existing and new ones, were compiled together. It was also not possible to systematically check the dates of the policies using sources other than the VNRs, partly due to the large number of policies but also because some policies are not necessarily available online or with English translations.

Planned future policies were included only if the VNR indicated concrete progress towards developing them. General expressions of intention to develop a new policy were not included.

Regarding budgets, the text of each VNR was searched to find anything with a specific monetary amount, regardless of the time period, or even whether the time period was indicated. Some countries discussed aligning their budgets with SDGs.

All the information on policies and budgets came only from the official VNRs. It was not possible to systematically check for items left out of the VNRs. It was also not possible to check the accuracy of the information in the VNRs, including the actual approval/implementation status or contents of policies or budgets.

#### 3. ANALYSIS OF INDIVIDUAL COUNTRIES

This section summarizes the VNRs of each selected ASEAN country in terms of its overall strategy, specific policies, and budgets to implement SDGs as indicated in the country's VNR. Overall strategy means the country's approach to structuring its VNR.

#### 3.1 Brunei Darussalam

Strategies: The Government of Brunei Darussalam published its first VNR in 2020 (Government of Brunei Darussalam 2020). It conducted in depth reviews of all 17 SDGs. Its national vision, Wawasan Brunei 2035, was begun in 2008, and Brunei's VNR noted that some SDGs are directly linked to it. The VNR explained that "a multi-stakeholder 'Special Committee for the Implementation of the SDGs' comprising senior officers from relevant ministries and agencies was established in 2016 to facilitate the inclusion of SDGs indicators in Brunei Darussalam's development plans as well as to ensure and monitor the implementation of the SDGs in line with national priorities " (p. 3). The VNR further noted that the country has taken an "inclusive and whole nation approach" to the SDGs, "collaborating and engaging with relevant stakeholders, namely the private sector, non-governmental organisations (NGOs), researchers and academia." The "whole nation approach" and inter-ministerial engagement were reiterated in the discussions of specific policy areas.

**Policies:** Brunei Darussalam listed the most policies of any ASEAN country, 270, perhaps partly because its VNR was the most recent (2020). These policies are listed below in Table 2. Like other countries, it listed a range of broad strategies as well as narrow focused policies, although most of the policies appeared to be the latter. The largest number of policies was listed for SDGs 1, 8, and 16 (27, 31, and 34, respectively), while the fewest policies were listed under SDGs 6 and 7 (3 and 9, respectively). All the policies listed under SDG 17 related to international cooperation; there were no domestic policies. There was a mix of existing and new policies. The VNR featured 15 policies related to COVID-19 under SDG 8 focusing on assistance for small and medium enterprises, job security, and employee welfare.

The extent to which policies may have been omitted from the VNR is unclear; Brunei is not included in various surveys of environmental policies in ASEAN countries (UNEP 2012; Drafting Committee 2018; Ministry of the Environment of Japan and IGES 2018), but one study noted an air quality standard which was not listed in the VNR (Elder 2015).

Table 2: Policies Mentioned in Brunei Darussalam's VNR

SDGs	Policies
SDG 1	• Integrated Plan of Action on Poverty Eradication (revision to be implemented by July 2020).
	Ten strategies: skills training; education; employment; entrepreneurship; finance; infrastructure
	(housing); infrastructure (transportation); mindset; childcare; as well as policy, legislation and
	guidelines.
	o Various corporate social responsibility (CSR)-related programmes and volunteer activities
	targeting poverty eradication are included.
	Comprehensive & centralized national welfare system (Sistem Kebajikan Negara [SKN]) to be
	implemented from July 2020.
	Monthly Welfare Assistance (BKB)
	• Zakat (by Zakat Collection and Distribution Section under the Brunei Darussalam Islamic
	Religious Council -MUIB). Obligatory Muslim religious donations distributed to poor Muslims
	• Old Age Pensions (since 1955). Total payments from April 2019 to March 2020:
	B\$110,984,750.00.

- Disability pensions and allowances (since 1955). Revised in Jan. 2018 to include allowances for people under 15 years old. Total allowances from April 2019 to March 2020: B\$10,140,434.00.
- Revised in Jan. 2018 to include allowances for people under 15 years old.
- Other safety net programs. Financial Year (FY) 2019/2020: B\$25,330,000.00.
- Micro grants under the Development Assistance Programme as well as the Youth Entrepreneurship Enhancement Programme. MCYS has allocated B\$30,000.00 annually under the Development Assistance Programme to provide assistance to at least 10 entrepreneurs since FY 2019/2020.
- Capacity building programs for entrepreneurship and training.
  - Employment Plan Programme (260 welfare recipients/ beneficiaries in 2019)
  - o Community Empowerment Programme (PPK)
  - o Micro-grant Empowerment [B\$30,000 annual budget since FY 2019/2020.]
  - o Business from Home (BDR), support entrepreneurship for housewives.
  - o 'Special Underprivileged Mothers Empowerment Entrepreneurship Development' programme (BIBD SEED) introduced in Oct. by *Bank Islam Brunei Darussalam* (BIBD).
  - Visionary Youth Innovation Programme (PIIB).
- TEKAD Pekerjaan is a program targeted at welfare recipients who are able-bodied and able-to-work within the age group of 18 59 years old, and have been receiving monthly welfare benefits for more than four cycles. Started in July 2019, participants will receive additional financial assistance if remain employed for a period of six months.
- Pelan Pekerjaan is a program implemented since 2018 to assist welfare recipients and dependents who are able to work but unemployed to find employment.
- Skills Development Programmes for training Persons with Different Abilities (PWDs), focusing on living and social skills, basic vocational and work skills.
- Programs to promote entrepreneurship and employment -- MUIB. (3 subprograms listed)
- National Housing Program (Also listed under SDGs 10 and 11.)
- Temporary housing shelters. From April 2019 March 2020, 354 families with a total amount of B\$284,367.00 were assisted for disaster relief and home improvements.
- Sultan Haji Hassanal Bolkiah Foundation (Yayasan Sultan Haji Hassanal Bolkiah) (established 1992) implemented projects on welfare, microfinancing, supporting PWDs, youth development projects, socio-cultural activities, housing, etc.
- The Brunei Council on Social Welfare (Majlis Kesejahteraan Masyarakat) implemented projects complementing government programs targeting various vulnerable groups, including basic needs, education, women's empowerment, legal advice, etc.
- Programs of several NGOs are mentioned.

- New planting areas have been developed, such as the Agricultural Development Area of Kando.
- Field research and trials of different varieties of rice from Indonesia, Myanmar and China, to test their suitability to Brunei Darussalam's climate and soil conditions.
- Policies and legislation on safety standards, including Wholesome Meat Order 2011, Quarantine and Prevention of Disease Act (Cap. 47) (1984 Ed), Brunei Good Agricultural Practice. These policies are aimed at sustainable agriculture.
- Giving Every Child the Best Start in Life has adapted the World Health Organization (WHO)'s global targets for identifying priority areas in maternal, infant and young child nutrition.
- 'National Strategy for Maternal, Infant and Young Child Nutrition (MIYCN) in Brunei Darussalam 2014-2020' (Also under SDG 3.)
- Brunei Darussalam promotes exclusive breastfeeding for the first six months of life, and recently launched an initiative to provide free breast pumps for newly expecting mothers. Also provided are free breastfeeding classes for expecting mothers as well as a dedicated hotline for those who need breastfeeding advice.
- Prices of milk formula are controlled through the Price Control Act (Cap. 142).
- Excise taxes on food products with high sugar and monosodium glutamate (MSG) contents from 2017.
- Healthier choices in schools are promoted through the 'School Canteen Guidelines' and the 'Drinking Water Policy'.
- 'National Nutrition and Physical Activity Guidelines for Child Care Centres' 2019.
- Healthier Choice Logo (from 2017) to encourage healthier choice products by food industries, particularly food manufacturers and food suppliers (international or local).

- "Feeding Scheme" school food programs from 1954.
- The 'Program Harapan dan Anak Harapan', developed in June 2018, targets the most disadvantaged 41 primary schools (to supplement the Feeding Scheme) and 5 secondary schools to provide meal plans.

#### SDG<sub>3</sub>

- Ministry of Health's Strategic Plan 2019-2023 prioritises 5 key goals: i) Excellence in healthcare services; ii) Prevention and control of Non-Communicable Diseases (NCDs); iii) Protection of public health through effective policies and regulations; iv) Sustainability through resource optimisation and innovation; and v) Transparent and proactive governance.
- Quality and accessible medical, dental and health care continues to be provided at a nominal fee of B\$1 for citizens. (Also listed under SDG 10.)
- Maternal and Child Health (MCH) services in Brunei Darussalam has expanded throughout the country and there are currently 14 health centres, three health clinics, three travelling clinics and two flying medical services.
- Women and Children Centre, completed in 2014, provides enhanced holistic care and integrated services.
- 'National Strategy for Maternal, Infant and Young Child Nutrition' (MIYCN) to improve the health and nutritional status of mothers and mothers-to-be, infants and young children. (Also under SDG 2.)
- The Mental Health Order 2014, implemented from 1 November 2014, aims to ensure equality, non-discrimination and shared responsibility of stakeholders when addressing the care and treatment of mentally disordered persons.
- "Talian Harapan 145," a national mental health helpline.
- Anti bully programme, "Bully Free Brunei" (Brunei Bebas Buli), focuses on children, particularly in schools (from 2018).
- Several mental health promotion programmes organized by MOH. The 'i-Mind Programme', this initiative focuses on the wellbeing and emotional resilience of the workforce. "Mind Your Mind" (Jaga Minda Kita) campaign aims to raise public awareness has been carried out annually since 2014 in public places.
- "National Multisectoral Action Plan for the Prevention and Control of NCDs (BruMAP-NCD) 2013-2018" to prevent and control NCDs. Now evaluating results.
- Policies on prevention and control of NDCs: establishment of the Multisectoral Taskforce on Health, National Health Screening Programme, increase in excise duty for food and beverages with high sugar and msg, no importation and sales of tobacco since May 2014, Healthier Choice Logo, School Canteen Guidelines, Drinking Water Policy for schools, development of the National Nutrition and Physical Activity Guidelines for Child Care Centres, Workplace and Health Programme (WAH) to support healthy workplaces.
- Senior Citizens Action Plan (from 2017)
- Brunei Darussalam AIDS Council (BDAIDSCOUNCIL) aims to educate the public about HIV and AIDS, including a youth division (Penyinar Club), HIV Awareness Programme for Peers and Youth (HAPPY), Life Skills Training (LESTARI), World AIDS Day programmes, National Workshop on reproductive health, anonymous HIV testing.

- Ministry of Education's (MOE) Strategic Plan for 2018-2022, holistic education mission.
- Free, compulsory basic education for 12 years.
- National Education System for the 21st Century (SPN21) from 2009.
- School and Family Engagement (SAFE) Programme from 2014, in all preschools.
- Assistant Teacher Volunteer Programme to assist pre-school teachers
- Model Inclusive Schools Project (from 2008) in selected primary and secondary schools, with the aim of improving access and participation for students with special needs.
- Two Centres of Excellence for students with special needs established in the Temburong District by MOE in Jan. 2019.
- Brunei Darussalam Literacy and Numeracy Standard (from 2016) provides a national benchmark for all schools implementing the SPN21 curriculum. There is a related Literacy and Numeracy Coaching Programme.
- Lifelong Learning Centre (L³) and several others established by MOE.
- Politeknik Brunei (PB) was established to cater to the needs of young Bruneians with Level 5
  Diploma qualifications. Also, Brunei Darussalam's Technical Education Transformation
  resulted in the establishment of the IBTE.

Educational scholarships for further education in both local and overseas institutions are offered by the Government and private sectors. Additionally, an education loan facility is also made available to provide support for students ineligible for scholarships. Brunei Teacher Standards. The Brunei Darussalam Teachers Academy (BDTA) aims to provide continuous and quality professional development programmes that develop and build teachers' capacity. Teacher Performance Appraisal The MOE has newly established the Department of Educators Management to ensure the Ministry is supplied with highly skilled and successful human resource (teachers, school leaders and specialists). Science, Technology and Environmental Partnership (STEP) Centre provides a value-added platform for schools and assists teachers to encourage and increase the involvement of students in quality STEAM (Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts and Mathematics) activities and programmes. One initiative was Green School Gardening (GSG). Since the introduction of SPN21, the MOE has incorporated topics on Global Citizenship Education in formal curriculum at different levels, both in the classroom and extra-curricular activities, to educate students about global matters. Government scholarships for international students to pursue higher education in Brunei. The UBD Graduate Research Scholarship is for both domestic and foreign students. Programs of some NGOs and civil society organizations are also mentioned. SDG 5 The "Plan of Action" for women's issues is currently being revised. Universal access to quality education from 1953. There is no gender discrimination with regards to ownership of land, businesses or other forms of assets. (In terms of land ownership, Section 23 of Brunei Land Code (Cap. 40).) Several laws protect women and girls including: The Penal Code (Cap. 22) Women and Girls Protection Act (Cap. 120) The Islamic Family Law Act (Cap. 217) and the Married Women Act (Cap. 190), amended in 2010, include provisions addressing 'dharar syarie' (domestic violence). The Authority for Info-Communications Technology Industry of Brunei Darussalam (AITI) has implemented several programmes to nurture women's early interest in information communication technology (ICT). The private sector has also implemented initiatives to encourage women's development. Several ICT programs for youth also included women. Policies, legislation and regulations to promote gender equity in employment include: The Employment Order 2009 The Workplace Safety and Health Order 2009 The Maternity Leave Regulation 2011. Some initiatives by the private sector and NGOs were mentioned. SDG 6 The Government is in the process of implementing a new water tariff system and a new Unified Smart Metering System, in which the new rates are based on a tiered structure for residential, commercial, and raw water. In Brunei Darussalam, wastewater treatment service is provided at no cost to the public. Through ministerial projects as well as projects under the National Development Plans, 93% of the population has access to sanitation. SDG 7 One (of 2) power grid providers is: Dep't of Electrical Services under the Min. of Energy. To raise general awareness, the Ministry of Energy (ME) continues to conduct nationwide promotion of plans and programmes related to Energy Efficiency and Conservation (EEC) and Renewable Energy (RE) including: Standards and Labelling Orders EEC Building Guidelines for various sectors Appointment of Energy Managers RE deployment, especially solar Deployment of Green Transportation 30 MW solar farm at Sungai Akar is planned. Bilateral power interconnection project with Malaysia is planned to support RE. SDG 8 The Manpower Planning and Employment Council (MPEC) established under the Prime Minister's Office, replacing the previous Manpower Planning Council in Jan. 2020.

- I-Ready Apprenticeship Programme, a three-year programme to help equip unemployed graduates with industry skills and enhance employability and marketability.
- The 11th National Development Plan (NDP) (2018 2023) supports economic diversification by strengthening the private sector, including the provision of infrastructure and utilities and ensuring workforce needs.
- Ministry of Primary Resources and Tourism (MPRT)'s Strategic Plan (2016-2020).
- The Tourism Development Department has launched promotional packages highlighting places of interests and distinctive niche activities that are offered in a sustainable manner.
- In 2016, Darussalam Enterprise (DARe) was set up to support medium & small enterprises. Initiatives include 'Industry Business Academy', 'Accelerate Bootcamp Programme', 'Micro Bootcamp Programme', 'Brunei Mentors for Entrepreneurs Network'. Other ministries, Univ. Brunei Darussalam (UBD) also have supporting programs.
- To further promote industrial development, the Government has also established industrial sites, some of which cater to specific industries such as Pulau Muara Besar for oil and gas downstream industries; and Digital Junction for ICT and high-tech industries.
- In 2018, the Government established the Bank Usahawan to provide accessible financing for medium and small enterprises. Private banks also implemented supporting programs.
- Various regulatory measures to improve the market conduct of financial service providers and enhance the financial consumer protection network.
- National Financial Literacy Council
- Maritime and Port Authority Brunei Darussalam was established in 2017
- The Muara Port Company was formed in 2017 through a joint venture to operate the Muara Port Container and Conventional Terminals.
- Digital Economy Council established to provide national direction on digital economy.
- The Department of Labour (DoL) works closely with other ministries and enforcement agencies on any suspected labour and trafficking cases. The DoL enforces the minimum employment conditions as provided in the Employment Order 2009, which applies to all workers in the private sector and provides for the payment of wages, rest days, medical leave, maternity leave and other such rights.
- The Safety, Health and Environment National Authority (SHENA), which is a statutory body, was established in 2017 to regulate and enforce all matters pertaining to workplace safety and health, environment and radiation.
- National Chamber of Commerce and Industry Brunei Darussalam (NCCIBD) various initiatives.

#### Policies related to COVID-19:

- For small and medium enterprises:
  - o Deferred employers' contributions to pensions
  - o Government will pay pension contributions in advance, finance them for self employed
  - Temporary discounted rental rates of government buildings in targeted sectors, electricity and water bills, corporate income taxes; salary subsidy to local employees.
  - Temporary exemption of customs and excise duties on personal hygiene products
  - o Removal of rental markets for wet and dry markets
  - o E-platforms for business matching
  - o Corporate social responsibility initiative "Community for Brunei"
  - o "Buy Local Produce Campaign"
  - O DARe to expand Co-matching grants initiative
- Job security and employee welfare
  - Extension of contracts under the I-Ready Apprenticeship Programme and Extension of the I-Ready Apprenticeship Programme
  - o Various training programs
  - o Upgrading the Job Centre Brunei (JCB) Portal
  - Various monetary measures on financing and loans such as deferment of principal payments, restructuring, conversion of credit card balances to term loans, waiver of various loan fees and charges

- Brunei Muara Temburong Bridge construction began in 2014 and opened in March 2020. It is Southeast Asia's longest overseas bridge with a length of 26.3 kilometres.
- Brunei International Airport upgrade projects.
- The Digital Economy Council was established in 2019 to provide national direction on digital economy initiatives.

- Five-year strategic plan of the Ministry of Transport and Infocommunications (MTIC), MTIC 2025, launched in April 2020, with its vision "Connected Smart Nation."
- The establishment of the Brunei Research Council aimed to further promote sustainable development and investment in scientific research and innovation.
- The Ministry of Primary Resources and Tourism (MPRT) earlier this year developed a facility for a Genetic Development and Selective Fish Breeding Programme.
- Some initiatives of the private sector and educational institutions were mentioned.
- Several innovation awards were mentioned.
- The Brunei Intellectual Property Office (BruIPO) was established on 1 June 2013, with a mission to increase an effective IP awareness, promote IP management and commercialisation, deliver an efficient IT infrastructure and to improve IP services. BruIPO also administers laws and policies related to Intellectual Property such as Trademarks Act (Cap 98), Patent Order 2011, Industrial Designs Order 1999, Copyright Order 1999, Layout Designs Order 1999, and Plant Varieties Order 2015.
- Darussalam Enterprise provides 25 readily prepared industrial sites with good access to roads, with utilities provided at competitive rates.

- The Government provides quality and comprehensive healthcare and services for its citizens for a nominal fee. (Also listed under SDG 3.)
- The National Housing Programme aims to ensure citizens are able to own homes. (Also listed under SDGs 1 and 11.)
- Welfare assistance programs. (Also listed under SDG 1.)
- Skill provision programs. (Also listed under SDG 1.)
- Programs to encourage entrepreneurship. (Also listed under SDG 8.)
- Ministry of Education programs to support disadvantaged students. (Also under SDG 4.)
- Employees Trust Fund (TAP) introduced in 1993 (government matches voluntary contributions of self-employed people).
- Supplemental Contributory Pensions (SCP) introduced in 2009 (government matches voluntary contributions of self-employed people).
- The National Council on Social Issues (MKIS) is implementing the Plan of Action under the Special Committee on the Elderly and Persons with Different Abilities (PWDs).
- In 2019, nine workshops on 'Braille, Orientation and Mobility' were conducted
- MOD issued the Different Abilities Design Guidelines under the Building Control Order in 2018.
- Skill training (job coaching) centers (Pusat Bahagia) under the Department of Community Development, were established in each of Brunei Darussalam's 4 districts.
- In 2019, the Youth Development Centre (YDC) organised 'Program Pendedahan Kemahiran OKU', for differently-abled youth to take short term skills training courses.
- The Community Based Rehabilitation Unit under the MCYS also works with strategic partners to provide work placements for three months and job matching for PWDs.
- As part of the MOE's mission to deliver holistic education to achieve fullest potential for all, it adopts an inclusive education policy where there is no segregation of schools for those with special needs. These students are provided with special education programmes, at both primary and secondary mainstream government schools.
- The National Education System for the 21st Century (SPN21), which commenced in 2009, provides students, including PWDs, with multiple pathways. (Also under SDG 4.)
- Model Inclusive Schools (MIS) project introduced in 2008
- Set up two Centres of Excellence for students with special needs in the Temburong District in 2019.
- Selected primary and secondary schools have also been allocated additional funding and support to ensure they have the necessary school facilities, special learning equipment or resources, specialist support services, and teacher training programs to provide quality inclusive education for a wide range of students with diverse learning needs.
- Several programs are provided by the Religious Special Education Unit, Religious Schools Division, MORA.
- Some programs of civil society organizations are also listed.

- National Land Use Master Plan, District Plans, Local Plans and Planning Schemes establish guidelines for land use.
- National Housing Program (from 1976). (Also listed under SDGs 1 and 10.)

- Piawaian Brunei Darussalam 12:2017 Building Guidelines and Requirements (from 2017)
- Environmental Protection and Management Order (EPMO) 2016. Activities with environmental impacts and identified as Prescribed Activities are required to submit Written Notification, together with Environmental Impact Assessments (EIA) and/or Environmental Management and Monitoring Plan (EMMP). (Also listed under SDG 15.)
- Hazardous Waste (Control of Export, Import and Transit) Order (HWO) 2013.
- The Department of Environment, Parks and Recreation (JASTRe) policies:
  - o Environmental Acts and Guidelines
  - o Pollution Control Guidelines for Industrial Development
  - o Environmental Impact Assessment
  - Recycle 123 Handbook
- Solid Waste Management Strategy
- Air pollution related action plans include:
  - Environmental protection and management for industries and construction activities to take proper air quality preventive and mitigation measures under the EIA
  - o Strengthen regulations and enforcement against illegal activities that pollute air quality and address air pollution from vehicular emissions.
- River quality monitoring for all major rivers by the Sewerage Laboratory, monitoring of effluent discharge by sewage treatment plants.
- Taman Mahkota Jubli Emas (park) was "officiated" in 2017 for recreational activities in the capital city.
- Closure of selected roads in the capital Bandar Seri Begawan to traffic from 6 am until 10 am every Sunday for the weekly Bandarku Ceria.
- Integrated flood risk reduction approach
  - o Real time early warning flood detection system
  - Drainage Act to provide the Department of Drainage and Sewerage with authority to carry out enforcement duties against non-compliance
  - o Flood mitigation projects through National Development Plans
  - o Proactive drainage maintenance
- Strategic National Action Plan for Disaster Risk Reduction
- Disaster Preparedness Coordinator programme trains community and grassroots leaders

- Various policies and initiatives to reduce plastic use.
- Excise duties on plastic products were increased in 2017.
- The Municipal Department is also strictly enforcing proper waste disposal especially in public areas, imposing heavy penalties for those found to be illegally dumping their waste.
- Various policies on sustainable use of natural resources. Sector specific policies:
  - Brunei Good Agricultural Practice
  - Good Animal Husbandry Practices
  - o Good Aquaculture Practices
  - o Control and Prevention of Overfishing
  - o Brunei Selection Felling System
  - o Quota system in forestry production.
- Regulatory measures to prevent over fishing include zoning systems, and the fisheries Maximum Sustainable Yield (MSY), allocation of fishing licenses according to available quota, specific allowable types of fishing gear, and ban on trawlers. (Also under SDG 14.)
- The community based One Village One Product (OVOP) initiative helps villagers to promote their handicrafts and their ethnic cultural show performances to tourists.
- Various measures to promote environmental awareness were mentioned.
- Various activities of NGOs were mentioned.

- Brunei National Climate Policy (BNCP)
- Policies to promote renewable energy development
- Smart electricity tariff system and smart meters to promote energy efficiency
- Energy management in government and commercial sectors
- New electricity tariffs for commercial and industry sectors
- Energy Efficiency and Conservation (EEC) Building Guidelines for Non-Residential sectors
- Ministry of Energy's strategic actions include rejuvenation projects within the oil and gas industry facilities for GHG emissions abatement, both onshore and offshore mainly from venting and flaring activities.

- Forest plantation programme
- Awareness raising programmes
- Online carbon footprint calculator for the public

- The Fisheries Order 2009 governs the protection and management of marine biodiversity including the establishment and management of the marine reserves and parks. (Also listed under SDG 15.)
- Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) established in Jan. 2015.
- Enforcement of zoning systems with license quotas for both commercial and small scale fishing. Includes a moratorium on fishing in Zone 1. (Also listed under SDG 12.)
- Enforcement of allowable types of fishing gear (Also listed under SDG 12.)
- Banning of trawlers is expected to take effect by 1 Jan. 2021(Also listed under SDG 12.)
- Banning any catching of endangered species, such as all shark species, from Brunei Darussalam's waters and their sale in domestic markets, as well as import and trade of shark products.
- National Plan of Action to Prevent, Deter and Eliminate Illegal, Unreported and Unregulated Fishing was launched in 2011.
- Fishery Limits Act (Cap. 130) (Also listed under SDG 15)
- Maximum Sustainable Yield (MSY) (Also listed under SDG 12.)
- Activities of NGOs are also mentioned.

#### **SDG 15**

- Forest Act, enacted in 1934, revised in 2013 (Cap. 46).
  - National Forestry Policy 1989
  - Wild Life Protection Act 1978
  - Wild Fauna and Flora Order 2007
  - Land Code
  - Land Acquisition Act
  - Antiquities and Treasure Trove Act
  - Fishery Limit Act (Cap. 130) (Also listed under SDG 14.)
  - Fisheries Order 2009 (Also listed under SDG 14.)
  - Town and Country Planning Act
  - Environmental Protection and Management Order 2016 (Also listed under SDG 11.)
  - Three separate forest reserves, Pulau Selirong Forest Reserve, Ulu Temburong National Park and Berakas Forest Reserve, were dedicated to the Queen's Commonwealth Canopy.
  - The government regulates the entry of potential invasive species.
  - Brunei Selection Felling System (BSFS), adopted since 1986, is aimed at enhancing the overall timber productivity of the forest.
  - Various public awareness programmes, including with NGOs, are listed.
  - Promotion of research to determine and identify new and unknown species.
  - Activities of NGOs are also mentioned.

- Women and Girls Protection Act (Cap. 120)
- Islamic Family Law Act (Cap. 217)
- Married Women Act (Cap. 190)
- Children and Young Persons Act (Cap. 219)
- Prevention of People Smuggling Order 2019
- Anti-Trafficking in Persons Order 2019
- De facto moratorium on the death penalty
- The Syariah Court in May 2018 commenced the implementation of the Sulh or reconciliation process for family cases as a form of alternative dispute resolution that is private, less formal and speedier than court litigation.
- National Plan of Action on Children
- The amendment to Section 103 of the Employment Order 2009 prohibits children from being employed in any industrial undertaking
- Penal Code (Cap. 22) protects children against any sexual exploitations and was further amended in 2017 to broaden the definition of rape, and to enhance penalties and punishments for various offences against a woman or children under 14 years of age.
- The Government has also set up hotlines as a form of direct communication with the public, specifically children.
- National Framework on Child Protection, expected July 2020.

- Expanded victim protection measures during judicial proceedings
- Strengthened investigations into alleged labour abuses that amount to trafficking.
- Amended the Criminal Procedure Code in 2016 to allow live video evidence. Five Technology courts were established to implement it.
- Training programs for labour and immigration officials and NGOs.
- Awareness campaigns related to trafficking.
- MYCS provides shelter and care to victims of TIPs (Trafficking in Persons).
- Births and Deaths Registration Act (Cap. 79)
- National Registration Act (Cap. 19)
- Brunei Nationality Act (Cap. 15)
- Certificate of Identity issued to stateless persons.
- Awareness campaigns related to legal identity.
- Prevention of Corruption Act was revised in 2019.
- Anti-Corruption Bureau (ACB) implemented capacity building for its officers.
- The Penal Code (amended Oct. 2018) increased penalties for criminal breach of trust.
- Government expenditure for ministries and departments are published annually; budget proposals, policies, and development plans are deliberated publicly in the annual Legislative Council meetings. (Transparency)
- Client's Charter (Tekad Pemedulian Orang Ramai TPOR) facilitates ministries and departments to improve the quality of their service delivery.
- Public Sector Performance Grading Programme
- The Customer Satisfaction Survey in the Public Sector (Kajian Selidik Tumpuan Pelanggan KSTP enables the public to provide feedback on service delivery quality.
- The Government provides several platforms to submit complaints and grievances.
- Talian Darussalam 123' (TD123) is an all-purpose national call centre which centralises and directs public complaints and requests for information onto one main platform.
- Online Public Service Commission Recruitment System (PSCR) was introduced in 2015.

**SDG 17** (Mostly international cooperation and NGO initiatives are discussed.)

Source: (Government of Brunei Darussalam 2020)

**Budget:** Brunei Darussalam's VNR listed several budget items, but only for SDG 1. These are listed below in Table 3. The total amount was over USD 118 million, about two-thirds of which was for old age pensions. The second largest item was for other safety net programs. Presumably, the policies listed under the other SDGs also received some funding from the government budget, but the funding was not mentioned in the VNR.

Table 3: Budget Items Listed in Brunei Darussalam's VNR

Policy	Budget (B\$)	Budget (USD)
• Monthly Welfare Assistance (BKB) (From April 2019 to	13,049,685	9,395,773
March 2020)		
• Zakat (2018)	5,200,000	3,744,000
• Old age pensions (From April 2019 to March 2020, the total	110,984,750	79,909,020.00
amount of payments)		
• Disability pensions and allowances (From April 2019 to	10,140,434	7,301,112
March 2020, the total amount disbursed)		
• Other safety net programs. (Financial Year 2019/2020)	25,330,000	18,237,600
• Micro grants under the Development Assistance	30,000	21,600
Programme as well as the Youth Entrepreneurship		
Enhancement Programme. (Annual amount since FY		
2019/2020.)		
• Temporary housing shelters (April 2019 – March 2020)	284,367	204,744
TOTAL	165,019,236	118,813,850

Note: Exchange rate: B\$ = 0.72 USD

Source: (Government of Brunei Darussalam 2020)

**Overall:** Overall, Brunei Darussalam appeared to be making a substantial effort to implement the SDGs. It listed many laws and policies for all the SDGs, more than other ASEAN countries. It indicated specific budgets for some policies under SDG 1, and presumably other policies also had corresponding budgets which were not mentioned in the VNR.

#### 3.2 Cambodia

Strategies: The Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) published its first VNR in 2019, and all SDGs were addressed (Kingdom of Cambodia 2019). The VNR conducted an in-depth review of the 6 SDGs which were highlighted at that year's HLPF, while shorter, "summary" reviews were conducted on the others. Cambodia has created a "fully localized framework," called the "Cambodian SDGs (CSDGs)" with 88 nationally relevant targets and 148 globally and locally defined indicators. Like the Lao PDR, Cambodia also added a 18<sup>th</sup> CSDG on clearing landmines and unexploded ordinance. Cambodia uses a "whole of government approach," and the VNR was developed using a "wide consultative process" (p. viii). The VNR explained that "the SDGs fully align with the RGC's long-term development vision as articulated in Vision 2050, and in its medium-term instruments – the RS-IV [Rectangular Strategy Phase IV] and the NSDP 2019-2023." Therefore, "the CSDGs have been fully integrated within planning and policy-making...through their inclusion in the NSDP's Monitoring and Evaluation framework, where around 40 percent of the indicators have been adopted; and via ministry and agency Budget Strategic Plans, where the CSDGs will provide the performance measures of budget outcomes" (p.ix).

**Policies:** Cambodia mentioned a significant number of specific policies in its VNR. These policies are listed below in Table 4. There is a range of types of policies including national plans and strategies as well as more specific ones from individual ministries. Some of the policies mentioned appeared to be not very concrete, more of a statement of a goal or general direction, so these were not included. Nevertheless, most of the policies listed in the VNR were specific enough to be included. Some plans and strategies were started before the SDGs, while others started after.

The number of policies listed for each SDG varied widely, ranging from 14 for SDG 5 but only 1 for SDG 7. It is not clear whether these differences represent the real situation, differences in the efforts to prepare the VNR, or differences in interpreting how to classify cross-cutting policies. Some policies were listed under more than one SDG, although this seems justified since the policies are generally cross-cutting. However, other cases of apparent cross-cutting policies were not cross listed with related SDGs, so there may also be some undercounting of policies. For example, the National Strategic Plan on Green Growth was listed under SDG 14 (on oceans), but not under more directly related SDGs such as 8, 9, or 12, while the Sub-decree on Water Pollution Control was mentioned in SDG 14 but not SDG 6. The National REDD+ strategy was mentioned under SDG 14 (oceans) but not SDG 13 (climate). Readers not familiar with the country may wonder whether renewable energy, energy efficiency, and energy access were in fact not included somewhere in the National Climate Change Strategy, the Industrial Development Policy, or the National Strategic Plan on Green Growth.

Table 4: Policies Mentioned in Cambodia's VNR

SDGs	Policies
SDG 1	<ul> <li>National Social Protection Policy Framework 2016-2025 (NSPPF), a strategic plan to ensure income security, reduce economic &amp; financial vulnerability (Also under SDG 10.)</li> <li>National Social Security Fund for Civil Servants (NSSFC)</li> <li>National Social Security Fund (NSSF)</li> <li>National Fund for Veterans (NFV)</li> <li>People with Disabilities Fund (PWDF)</li> <li>National Population Policy 2016-2030 reflects efforts to continuously improve the people's</li> </ul>
	well-being and solidarity in society, aims at maximum reduction of poverty.
SDG 2	National Fast Track Roadmap for Improving Nutrition (2014-2020)
	National Action Plan for Zero Hunger Challenge in Cambodia 2016-2025

National Strategy for Food Security and Nutrition (NSFSN) 2014-2018 NSFSN 2019-2023 preparations Agriculture Sector Strategic Development Plan 2014-2018 accelerates agriculture including enhanced agricultural productivity, diversification commercialization, promotion of livestock farming and aquaculture, land reform, sustainable management of natural resources. SDG 3 Health Strategic Plan 2016-2020 (HSP3) The Cambodian Health Equity Fund (HEF) provides access to free healthcare to people who are categorized as poor (also listed under SDG 10) RGC's 2013 seven-point policy on HIV/AIDS and the RGC's 2019 policy circular 2013 are being implemented. National Strategic Plan for a Comprehensive and Multi-sectoral response to HIV/AIDS (2019-2023) is under development. SDG 4 National Education 2030 Roadmap for CSDG4, provides overarching framework for a longterm holistic sector-wide approach for the development and delivery of education services, sets priorities & strategies. Systematically increasing the coverage of early-childhood care and education to reach 82%, primary completion to 91.1%, lower-secondary completion to 61.1%, upper-secondary completion to 45%, TVET GER to 35% and Tertiary GER to 25% by 2030. Systematically implemented teacher reforms on recruitment, training, deployment, continuous professional development, mentoring/on-site support, career pathways. Providing institutionalized in-service training for teachers at all levels in line with the MOEYS CPD policy of 100 hours per year, and training on Inquiry-Based Learning Methodology in the context of the 21st century skills. Scaling-up Early Grade Learning (EGL) to enhance reading, writing and mathematics to provide solid foundations for learners to succeed in higher grades. Strengthening implementation and monitoring of inclusive education policies, including provision of targeted scholarships for learners from all disadvantaged groups. Bringing educational reforms in classrooms by enhancing the capacities of the school principals, management committees and stakeholders through training and implementation of school-based management. Reforming and revising the curriculum to integrate the 21st century skills including inquirybased learning, communication skills and problem solving. Conducting systematic assessment of student learning at grades 3, 6, 8 and 11 to monitor learning of students as per the curriculum objectives. Introducing and expanding flexible learning opportunities and academic equivalency programs, particularly at the secondary level to enable young people to continue learning and skilling themselves using ICTs. Consistently improving and increasing the budget allocation to the schools to meet the needs of teaching and learning in the classrooms and strengthening capacities for financial management and accountability. Strengthening internal and external quality assurances in higher education and encouraging learners to enrol in STEM education in tertiary and higher education. MOEYS, Cambodia, and the United Nations Volunteers (UNV) launched 3 youth volunteering pilot programs: 1. volunteering for community services, 2. volunteering for social entrepreneurship, 3. volunteering on school holidays. SDG 5 The MOWA's [Ministry of Women's Affairs] five-year Strategic Plan for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment 2014-2018, Neary Rattanak IV (with Neary Rattanak V for 2019-2023 being developed), aims to strengthen institutional capacity to promote gender equality, including comprehensive strategies to strengthen MOWA's role as catalysts, policy advocates, advisors and facilitators for promoting gender equality. Formulation of the first National Gender Policy to provide a longer-term policy framework for gender equality. The National Action Plan to Prevent Violence Against Women sets out key priorities and actions for effective prevention of and response to GBV across multiple sectors. The Strategic Plan on Gender, Climate Change, Green Growth, and Disaster Risk Management have been integrated into the Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan 2013-2022 along with its implementation budget.

Gender is integrated into other key strategies and policies such as Population Policy, NSDP, and National Social Protection Framework. National Program for Public Administrative Reform 2015-2018 mainstreams gender issues in the civil service, including mandatory training and improvements in the training curriculum for new recruits, current civil servants, and senior management. Gender Mainstreaming Action Plan (GMAP) for the Civil Service Phase III 2014-2018 of the Ministry of Civil Service (MCS) promotes gender equality in the civil service. Gender Mainstreaming Action Groups work to mainstream gender across sectors. By 2018, 30 of 31 line ministries and institutions developed GMAPs to guide their actions. Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) is a tool for gender mainstreaming across sectors and to engage with the MEF. In 2016, 28 government ministries and institutions received funds from the national budget and development partners to implement GMAPs, up from 16 in 2013. Secretariat of Anti-Human Trafficking (NCCT) budget increased to 3,815 mil. riels in 2016. The Minimum Standards for Essential Services for Women and Girl Survivors of Gender-Based Violence (GBV) was drafted in 2017 under the 2nd National Action Plan to prevent Violence Against Women 2014-2018 (NAPVAW II). It covers 10 standards including mediation as part of legal protection, health, counselling, referral and case management. Multi-sectoral Coordinated Response Mechanism (CRM) networks, involving relevant government departments and officials, were established in 8 provinces in 2016 & 2017 to facilitate effective, efficient and timely responses for GBV survivors, and service providers have been trained in relevant service standards. Action Plan to Prevent and Respond to Violence against Children 2017-2021 SDG 6 Integrated Water Resource Management (IWRM) implementation: MOWRAM manages water quality while the MOE has a range of responsibilities including monitoring. National Strategic Plan on Water and Rural Sanitation 2011-2025 First National Action Plan for Rural Water Supply, Sanitation and Hygiene 2014-2018 Second National Action Plan for Rural Water Supply, Sanitation and Hygiene 2019-2023 Ministry's Rural Development Strategic Plan 2019-2023 SDG 7 The Ministry of Mines and Energy (MME) is updating the Power Development Master Plan and continues to develop additional power generation capacity, transmission substations and distribution networks. SDG8 Industrial Development Policy (IDP) 2015-2025, about 100 measures (also in SDG 9) National Employment Policy (NEP) 2015-2025 "China Ready" policy (2016) One Village One Product (OVOP) Skills Development Fund (SDF) (also in SDG 9) In 2018, The RGC issued a Sub-Decree to provide tax break to small and medium enterprises (SMEs) for up to 5 years SME Bank and Entrepreneurship Development Fund and Entrepreneurship Promotion Centre were created by Ministry of Economy of Finance, expected operational in 2019. (also in SDG Working group formed in 2019 to formulate a 'digital economy policy framework' with an aim to instigate and facilitate the growth of technologies in the Cambodian economy. RGC has started to mainstream technologies in addition to gender and climate change adaptation in development projects financed by development partners. SDG 9 Industrial Development Policy (IDP) 2015-2025, about 100 measures (also in SDG 8) A package of 17 reform measures aimed at improving Cambodia's competitiveness, promoting SMEs and attracting foreign direct investment, was presented by the Prime Minister in March 2019 ranging from reducing logistics costs to lowering electricity tariffs, improving labour law, increasing financial access to SMEs, and to finalizing the amendment of the Law on Investment, and Law on Special Economic Zones (SEZs). Five-Year SME Development Plan (for small and medium enterprises) Skills Development Fund (SDF) (also in SDG 8) Strategic Action Plan on SME Development (SAP-SMED) 2016-2025 SME Bank and Entrepreneurship Development Fund and Entrepreneurship Promotion Centre were created by Ministry of Economy of Finance, expected operational in 2019. (Also in SDG 8)

- In late 2017, the MEF set up a PPP Unit aimed at boosting PPP projects that are predominantly financed by private firms in nature.
- Sub-Decree on Mechanism on implementation of Universal Service Obligation issued in 2017 is an important tool to boost the connectivity to all corners of the country.

- National Policy on Housing and Policy on Incentives
- National Program for Affordable Housing Development
- Built a number of affordable houses in Phnom Penh and Kandal provinces.
- Developed information technology (IT) system for the management of property construction data connecting to Geographical Information System (GIS) of Google Maps.
- Granted land titles, social land concessions.
- Built houses for families of soldiers, police officers, deceased soldiers, veterans with disability who are living in poverty without land/houses currently based along the borders.
- Cambodian Health Equity Fund (HEF) provides access to free health care to those people who are categorized as poor (also listed under SDG 3).
- National Ageing Policy 2017-2030
- National Social Protection Policy Framework 2016-2025 created strategic plan to ensure income security, reduce economic & financial vulnerability (Also under SDG 1.)
- To ensure wider access to social justice, the RGC in February 2019 ordered the establishment of volunteer group of lawyers to defend poor women, who cannot afford to pay for representation. The new legal team would not use the national budget, but initial funding of \$500,000 will come from the Prime Minister's personal budget and will cover living and food expenses, with additional money for lawyers on missions in rural areas.
- RGC established Techo Voluntary Youth Doctor Association (TYDA) in 2012, and since then around 3,600 medical doctors and health practitioners have become volunteers.

#### **SDG 11**

- The MOE has transferred 6 functions to sub-national level on the collection of solid waste, the management of drainage system, and natural resource protection.
- MOE took actions including monitoring & inspecting pollution sources, monitoring polluting sources from factories, piloting reporting system on the emission and movement of pollutants from other sources and inspecting environmental pollution violence.
- The MOE worked to raise awareness on plastic bag use. It worked with supermarkets and shopping centres in Phnom Penh to charge consumers who request plastic bags.
- The Ministry of Public Works and Transport prepared a master plan on wastewater & sewage system management for major cities as a response to the RS-IV.
- National Policy on Spatial Planning
- Law on Land Management, Urban Planning and Construction
- National Policy on Spatial Planning; sub-decree on Urban Planning, Capital, Municipality and Urban Areas
- Participatory guidelines for Master Plan and Land Use Plan making, and some Capital Province Master Plans
- District/Khan Land Use Planning and Approved Commune Land Use Planning 80; finalizing 90 Commune Land Planning.
- Sub-Decree on Municipal Solid Waste Management (also in SDG 12)
- Sub-Decree on Social Environmental Fund (also in SDG 12)
- Sub-Decree on the Management of Electrical and Electronic Waste (also in SDG 12)
- Sub-Decree on Plastic Bag Management (also in SDG 12)
- Sub-decree on the Management of Sewage System & Water Treatment (also in SDG 12)

- The MOE has regularly checked pollution from factories/industries, provided guidance and implemented a pilot project for a reporting system on the emission and movement of pollutants, and inspected the environmental pollution. The MOE also monitors the quality of air to check the acidic levels at 7 sites throughout Cambodia.
- Sub-Decree on Municipal Solid Waste Management (also in SDG 11)
- Sub-Decree on Social Environmental Fund (also in SDG 11)
- Sub-Decree on the Management of Electrical and Electronic Waste (also in SDG 11)
- Sub-Decree on Plastic Bag Management (also in SDG 11)
- Sub-decree on the Management of Sewage System & Water Treatment (also in SDG 11)
- Sustainable Consumption and Production is integrated into the Environment and Natural Resources Code under the Environmental Management and Sustainability Mechanisms.

<b>SDG 13</b>	•	The National Council for Sustainable Development is coordinating SDG 13. Established
		Climate Change Technical Working Group (CCTWG) including all concerned ministries and
		agencies, as well as provincial authorities.
	•	Climate change is integrated into the Rectangular Strategy IV 2018-2023.
	•	Climate change is integrated into the National Strategic Dev. Plan (NSDP) 2019-2023.
	•	UNFCCC Nationally Determined Contribution (NDC), including 13 priority actions
		National Environment Strategy and Action Plan (NESAP) (Also in SDG 14)
	•	
	•	Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan 2014–2023 (CCCSP) (also in SDG 14)
	•	Environment and Natural Resources Code has been finalized and will be approved soon.
	•	Technical guidelines are gradually being introduced in concerned ministries e.g. to climate-
		proof water and road infrastructure, or to improve the capacities of health professionals to
		prevent and treat climate-sensitive diseases.
<b>SDG 14</b>	•	National Strategic Plan on Green Growth 2013-2030
	•	RS-IV (Rectangular Strategy) aims to improve the effectiveness of environmental protection
		and conservation of natural resources, ecosystems, biodiversity, forests & wildlife sanctuaries
		as well as climate change adaptation, and reinforcing the management of solid waste, waste
		water, gas and lethal substances by implementing the 'reduce, reuse, recycle and non-use'
		principles & strengthening pollution monitoring & control mechanisms.(Also in SDG 13)
	•	Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan 2014-2023 (CCCSP) (also in SDG 13)
	•	National REDD+ Strategy (also in SDG 15)
		Sub-decree on Water Pollution Control (1999)
	•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	•	National Environment Strategy and Action Plan 2016-2023 (Also in SDG 13)
	•	National Adaptation Plan Financing Framework & Implementation Plan in 2017
	•	Strategic Planning Framework for Fisheries 2010-2019
<b>SDG 15</b>	•	In 2015, the country established and implemented 6 policies, strategies and regulations on
		ecosystem services. In 2016, 2017 and 2018, the number of policies, strategies and regulations
		issued and implemented exceeded the CSDG targets.
	•	National Protected Area Strategic Management Plan 2017-2031
	•	National REDD+ Strategy 2018-2028 (also in SDG 14)
	•	Strengthened environmental education activities through environmental extension, updated
		environmental statistics and environmentally friendly programs for a better biodiversity
		conservation and sustainable use of natural resources (relevant to SDG4)
<b>SDG 16</b>	•	Law on Access to Information
	•	Strengthen education to avoid corruption through the inclusion of anti-corruption lessons in the
		general education curriculum from grades 4 to 12; disseminate information on anti-corruption
		laws at public institutions, and via private sector, academia and media avenues; and organize
		public events and competitions on anti-corruption to encourage public participation.
	_	Prevent corruption through monitoring the implementation of public services and produce other
	•	anti-corruption materials; issue warnings letters to those suspected of corruption; and stricter
		monitoring of examinations at all levels, from high school to public servant recruitment exams;
		and ensure effective oversight of processes for procurement, and asset and liability declarations.
	_	Enforce the law through the establishment and implementation of a convenient corruption
	•	
		complaint mechanism; enable investigation of cases where there is solid evidence and
		formulate cases and take perpetrators of corruption to court.
	•	One-Window Service is being considered/rolled out currently and is an effective governance
		mechanism initiated to simplify administrative processes and ensure timely delivery of public
GD G 45		services to all citizens, including businessmen, and small entrepreneurs.
<b>SDG 17</b>	•	Development Cooperation and Partnership Strategy for 2019-2023
	•	Cambodia has increased the national budget for national surveys and the conduct of the 2019
		the General Population Census of Cambodia
	•	Law on Associations and Non-Governmental Organizations (LANGO) (2015) aims to
		strengthen cooperation between RGC and international NGOs.
<b>SDG 18</b>	•	National Disability Strategy Plan (NDSP) 2019-2023
	•	National Mine Action Strategy (NMAS) 2018-2025
	•	Risk Education Messages have been well implemented as planned
L		

Source: (Kingdom of Cambodia 2019)

**Budget:** Only one budget item was mentioned in the VNR. Under SDG 5, it is stated that, "the budget for the Secretariat of Anti-Human Trafficking (NCCT) increased to 3,815 million riels in 2016" (about USD 950,000). However, since a significant number of national laws and policies were mentioned, and these policies are presumably linked to the national budget, it is likely that a significant share of the national budget can be similarly linked to the SDGs.

**Overall:** Cambodia's VNR concluded that "despite its early stage, Cambodia has made good progress on many fronts, and for both the six priority goals and the full set of CSDGs, most targets are on or above track" (p. 94). Moreover, the compilation of related policies here, as well as the discussion in the VNR's discussion of individual SDGs, indicates that the country has made considerable efforts. Nevertheless, the VNR acknowledged that the degree of progress varied among different SDGs, and it emphasized the importance of prioritization. Moreover, the VNR noted that Cambodia's investment still relied considerably on funds from official development assistance (ODA) and NGOs, and it worried that these will become more difficult to obtain as Cambodia succeeds in raising its level of development to middle-income country status. The VNR further noted that government revenues already amounted to more than 20 percent of GDP, implying that it may be difficult to increase further (p. 89).

#### 3.3 Indonesia

**Strategies:** Indonesia presented its first VNR at the 2017 HLPF, addressing only the goals highlighted at the HLPF that year (Republic of Indonesia 2017). It also emphasized the integration of the SDGs into the national planning process and the national coordination mechanism as well as the use of participatory approaches.

Indonesia's second VNR was presented at the 2019 HLPF (Republic of Indonesia 2019). It addressed all SDGs, with a more detailed analysis of progress on the 7 goals (including SDG 17) highlighted at the HLPF that year. The 2019 VNR emphasized the trends of highlighted indicators over time, addressing challenges, and indicating future plans to improve SDG achievement. Indonesia's 2019 VNR was the longest of all the ASEAN countries, at 281 pages.

Indonesia has thoroughly integrated SDGs into national plans and policies and extensively used multi-stakeholder consultation processes. As explained by the 2019 VNR, "For the Republic of Indonesia, implementing national development agenda is implementing SDGs. The SDGs are institutionalized from the highest national level to subnational entities and integrated into national and subnational development planning. This is a massive and collaborative endeavour between government and non-state actors." More specifically, "The SDGs have been mainstreamed into the National and Subnational Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN, RPJMD), which is further elaborated in the National and Subnational Annual Work Plan (RKP, RKPD)" (p. 237). There was also a National SDGs Action Plan (RAN) 2017-2019, and 19 of 34 provinces have developed their own SDG action plans (RAD). One indicator of Indonesia's strong commitment to the SDGs is that "President of Indonesia leads the implementation of SDGs as the Chair of the Steering Committee, whereas the Minister of National Development Planning/Head of BAPPENAS is the Implementing Coordinator" (p. 31).

**Policies**: Indonesia's policies related to SDGs from its 2017 VNR were compiled by a previous study on the VNRs of the G20 countries which is reproduced below in Table 5. According to this analysis, Indonesia reported a total of 89 policies related to 6 SDGs highlighted at that year's HLPF (Elder and Bartalini 2019). There were probably additional policies which were part of the overall national plan RPJMN 2015-2019 which might not have been mentioned under specific SDGs. Moreover, there were undoubtedly additional policies related to the implementation of the SDGs not addressed in the 2017 VNR, so the total number of actual policies was certainly much larger than 89.

Policies reported in Indonesia's 2019 VNR are reported below in Table 6. In the 2019 VNR, specific policies, efforts and good practices were a major focus of the discussion of each of the 7 highlighted SDGs (including SDG 17), which also addressed trend analysis (status of goal achievement) and challenges. However, the detailed discussion only focused on a few selected indicators for each of the highlighted SDGs, not all indicators. The discussion of the other SDGs was much less extensive, and no specific policies were mentioned for the non-highlighted SDGs.

A comparison of Indonesia's 2017 and 2019 VNRs reveals that the list of policies in the 2019 VNR was clearly not comprehensive. For example, in the 2019 VNR, only one policy was linked to SDG 1, while in 2017, 23 policies were listed. However, in many cases, the policies listed in 2017 probably continued in 2019. Some of the policies in the 2017 VNR appear to be permanent policies, such as the National Social Security System, while others clearly extend into the review period of the 2019 VNR, such as the 2015-2019 National Medium Term Development Plan. For the SDGs which were the focus of the 2018 HLPF (for which Indonesia did not submit a VNR), Indonesia did not mention any policies for SDGs 6, 7, 11, or 15, and only one policy was mentioned for SDG 12 in the 2019 VNR. This does not mean that

Indonesia did not have any policies related to these SDGs, it is just that they were not included in the VNR. Some policies listed under other SDGs clearly seem related, such as a water related policy (WASH) which was listed under SDG 4 on education.

Many policies, especially major ones, probably should probably be listed under more than one SDG or even several SDGs.

Table 5: Policies Mentioned in Indonesia's 2017 VNR

SDGs		Policies
SDG 1	•	National Social Security System (Sistem Jaminan Sosial Nasional/SJSN).
2231	•	2015-2019 National Medium Term Development Plan (Rencana Pembangunan Jangka
		Menengah Nasional/RPJMN), a social scheme carried out through the development of the SJSN
		and an integrated structuring of social assistance
	•	National Health Insurance (Jaminan Kesehatan Nasional/JKN) (2014), which issued the
		Healthy Indonesia Card (KIS)
	•	Act No. 40 of 2004 regarding SJSN and Act No. 24 of 2011 regarding Social Security
		Administration Board (BPJS)
	•	Employment Social Security scheme (mid-2015), covers the Occupational Accident Benefit,
		Death Benefit, Old Age Benefit, and Pension Benefit
	•	Premium Assistance Beneficiaries Program (Penerima Bantuan Iuran/PBI*) which provides
		health insurance to the poor
	•	Government issues Healthy Indonesia Card (Kartu Indonesia Sehat/KIS) for JKN participants.
	•	Improvement of the Unified Database (Basis Data Terpadu/BDT), increase of the targets of
		several social assistance programs, reforming the non-cash social assistance distribution
		method
	•	An integrated card includes Family Hope Program (Program Keluarga Harapan/PKH -
		Conditional Cash Assistance) Non-Cash Food Subsidy, a reformed electricity and gas energy
		subsidy program.
	•	Family Development Sessions (FDS) to improve the capacity of PKH
	•	Child's Road to Health Card, for immunization (Kartu Menuju Sehat/KMS)
	•	"Take home birth certificate after delivery" program
	•	SMP/MTs/Equivalency Program and the SMA/SMK/MA/Equivalency Program, for increasing
		net enrolment rate
	•	Direct transfers of government funds to the sub-national level (Block Grant, Specific Allocation
		Grant and Village Fund) are increased.
	•	Presidential Decree No.38 of 2015 provides alternative funding source based on Cooperation
		between Government & Business Entities for Infrastructure Development
	•	Based on Law No. 40 of 2004 on National Social Security System (Sistem Jaminan Sosial
		Nasional/SJSN) and Law No.24 of 2011 on Social Security Administration Body, to achieve
		universal coverage, efforts were made to provide health insurance paid through the Premium
		Assistance Beneficiaries Program Penerima Bantuan Iuran/PBI* Independent Registration Mechanism (Mekanisme Pendaftaran Mandiri/MPM) helps poor,
	•	vulnerable groups self-register for basic services
		Presidential Decree on National Strategy of Civil Registration and Vital Statistics (CRVS)
	ľ	2017-2024
		Government assistance for natural disaster victims. The number of victims who received
		government assistance increased from 66,625 in 2010 to 200,000 in 2014. Increased the number
		of trained pioneer staff from 100 to 295 between 2010 and 2014.**
	•	Indonesia Electrification Program (Program Indonesia Terang/PIT) (2016)
	•	Specific Allocation Grants (Dana Alokasi Khusus/DAK) to support national priorities for
		general services, infrastructure development, basic services at district level.
	•	Develop a public expenditure advocacy model to strengthen poverty alleviation programs.
	•	Presidential Decree No.15 of 2010 on Poverty Alleviation Acceleration, revised by Presidential
		Decree No.96 of 2015, established a National Team for the Acceleration of Poverty Reduction
		(Tim Nasional Percepatan Penanggulangan Kemiskinan/TNP2K) coordinated by the Vice
		President
	•	Social Protection Program Data Collection by BPS-Statistics Indonesia.

- Child Delivery Insurance (Jampersal) integrated with the SJSN
- Implementation of Health Sector Minimum Service Requirements (SPM)
- Draft national and regional food and nutrition action plan and a Food Security and Vulnerability Atlas (FSVA)
- Consume Fish Movement (GERMARIKAN) to increase awareness of fish consumption.
- First 1000 Days of Life Movement (Gerakan 1000 Hari Partama Kehidupan/HPK)
- Policy on nutrition improvement that focuses on Gerakan 1000 HPK under the Presidential Decree No 42 of 2013
- The National Action Plan on Food and Nutrition (Rencana Aksi Nasional Pangan dan Gizi/RAN-PG) formulated for 2005-10; 2011-15, 2015-19.
- Regional Action Plan on Food and Nutrition (Rencana Aksi Daerah Pangan dan Gizi /RAD-PG) at the provincial and district levels
- Presidential Decree on Strategic Policy on Food and Nutrition (Kebijakan dan Strategi Pangan dan Gizi/KS-PG) is being drafted.
- Government Regulation No. 33 of 2012 on Exclusive Breastfeeding
- Indonesia has developed and implemented the SUN platform.
- National Community Empowerment Program for Healthy and Smart Generation (Program National Pemberdayaan Masyarakat Generasi Sehat dan Cerdas/PNPM-GSC)
- Prestasi Family Hope Program (PKH)
- Non-cash food subsidy
- Government Regulation No. 17 of 2015 concerns policies on food reserves, food diversification and nutrition information systems.
- Presidential Decree No.48 of 2016 concerning assignment to BULOG for Food Security (The National Logistic Agency also Badan Urusan Logistik/BULOD)
- Village Security Program (desa Mandiri Pangan)
- Home-Food Gardening Program (Kawasan Rumah Pangan Lestari)

#### SDG 3

- Prevention Mother to Child Transmission (PMTCT) program for AIDS
- 2015-2019 National Medium Term Development Plan (Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional/RPJMN)\*
- National Health Insurance (Jaminan Kesehatan Nasional/JKN) Coverage
- Special Allocation Fund (Dana Alokasi Khusus/DAK) for medicine, vaccines
- Service Delivery Insurance (Jaminan Persalinan/Jampersal), (2011) to provide free service to poor pregnant woman from poor
- Planned Generation (Generasi Berencana/Genre) to reduce Age Specific Fertility Rate
- HIV/AIDS screening, ARV treatment and TB diagnosis
- Presidential Instruction (Inpres) No. 1 of 2017 concerning Healthy Lifestyle Community Movement (Gerakan Masyarakat Hidup Sehat/Germas\*
- Minimum Service Standard (Standar Pelayanan Minimal SPM)
- Specialist education program (Program Pendidikan Dokter Spesialis/PPDS)

- Presidential Instruction (Inpres) Number 9 Year 2000 on Gender Mainstreaming (Pengarusutamaan Gender/PUG)
- Law Number 39, 1999 on human rights
- Law Number 23, 2004 on elimination of domestic violence
- Law Number 12, 2006 on nationality
- Law Number 21, 2007 on eradication of human trafficking
- Law Number 2, 2008 on political parties
- Law Number 42, 2008 on general elections
- Law Number 36, 2009 on health. Article 136, 137 on reproductive health
- Law Number 8 Year 2012 on general elections, which guarantees the engagement of women in the General Election
- Law Number 6 Year 2014 on villages. Regulates citizen participation in the planning process, implementation and monitoring of village development
- Law Number 13 Year 2014, (revision of Law Number 23 Year 2002) on Child Protection
- Presidential Decree Number 65 and 66, year 2005, which established a National Commission on Violence Against Women
- Campaign on 16 Days of Activism Against Gender Violence
- Education Program (Angka Partisipasi Kasar/ APK/SMA/SMK/MA/sedarajat)

- Gender equality program
- Law Number 36 Year 2009, ensures provision of information and education on sexual and reproductive health to adolescents
- Family Planning
- Harmonization of legislation related to child issues i.e: Marriage Law, General Election Law, and Population Law as well as Child Protection Law, and revision of Marriage Law to increase first age of marriage.
- Gender Budget Statement (GBS) in 2007 or later called Gender Responsive Budget Sheet (Anggaran Responsif Gender/ARG Sheet). This acceleration program of Gender Responsive Planning and Budgeting (Perencanaan dan Penganggaran Responsif Gender/PPRG) was officially adopted as policy in the RPJMN 2010-2014
- Women Development Planning Meeting at District Level (Musayawarab Perencanaan Pembangunan/Musrenbang), initiative to implement Presidential Instruction Number 9 Year 2000 on Gender Mainstreaming in National Development

- Sea Toll Program of 2014-2019 for easing the flow of goods from the West of Indonesia to the East regularly.
- Lamong Bay Terminal is an innovative infrastructure development that adopts environmentally friendly principles.
- Significant budget to increase for engineering education facilities.
- Increase the number and improve quality of vocational training and skills centres (Balai Latihan Kerja/BLK)
- Coordinate research and development institutions' activities to apply technology in specific sectors.
- Require all foreign contractors, consultants and supporting industries to cooperate with similar domestic industries and employ local engineers
- Simplify and harmonize certification of engineers.
- Sustainable Financial Roadmap as a new standard for financial service institution to sustainable principles.
- The Multi Kusuma Cemerlang, a joint venture of domestic and foreign investor, invested Rp 500 billion rubber processing industry in Samarinda, East Kalimantan.
- Oleochemical Indonesia launched in Sei Mangke Special Econ. Zone (2015).

#### **SDG 14**

- As of 2016 Indonesia has declared 165 Marine Protected Areas (MPAs).
- Ocean Act 32 of 2014, the basis for Indonesia's marine spatial planning
- National Marine Spatial Plan (RTRLN)
- Marine and Fisheries Affairs Ministerial Regulation No. 18/2014 established 11 Fisheries Management Areas (Wilayah Pengelolaan Perikanan/WPP). A Fisheries Management Plan must be developed by each WPP.
- Act No. 31/2004 jo Act No. 45/2009 aims to reduce IUU fishing
- The establishment of an information system for vessels, including vessel licensing, illegal vessels, illegal trading, and human trafficking
- Management Effectiveness for Marine Protected Area (E-MPA) to evaluate the effectiveness of the MPA management.
- Act No.7/2016 mandates the Government of Indonesia to provide partial contribution to insurance premium for fishermen since 2016.

Source: (Republic of Indonesia 2017) compiled in (Elder and Bartalini 2019)

<sup>\*</sup> Some policies were listed under more than one SDG.

<sup>\*\*</sup> Note: this policy was not included in the compilation by (Elder and Bartalini 2019).

Table 6: Policies Mentioned in Indonesia's 2019 VNR

SDGs	Policies
SDG 1	• Family Hope Program (Program Keluarga Harapan/PKH -Conditional Cash Assistance)
	ensures that families with lowest socioeconomic status have access to basic services like
	education and health. In 2018, the coverage of PKH recipients was increased to 10 million poor
CDC 1	families with budget of IDR 17.42 Trillion.
SDG 2	[None listed]
SDG 3 SDG 4	
3DG 4	<ul> <li>School Grant Policy: School Operational Assistance (Bantuan Operasional Sekolah, or BOS).         Affirmative BOS grants (BOS Afirmasi) help schools in the most disadvantaged rural areas.         Achievement BOS grant (BOS Kinerja) is for high performing schools.</li> <li>Educational Cash Transfer for Poor and At Risk Students Program: Smart Indonesia Card</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Special Allocation Fund (SAF) for Education Infrastructure (to local governments)</li> <li>Inclusive Education Program for All</li> </ul>
	Graduates Teaching in Outermost, Frontier & Underdeveloped Areas (SM3T) Program (2011)
	<ul> <li>Back-to-School Movements (Gerakan Kembali Bersekolah/GKB) centred on implementation of a Community Based Development Information System (Sistem Informasi Pembangunan Berbasis Masyarakat/SIPBM) to gather data on out-of-school children at the community level.</li> <li>2013 Curriculum, target to apply it to all schools by 2019</li> </ul>
	Professional Development Program to improve teacher competence
	Teachers' Work Group/Forum for Subject Teachers involvement in preparing National Standard School Examinations
	Improvement of undergraduate (S1/DIV) degree qualification
	National Literacy Movement (2016) to coordinate literacy activities by relevant units
	WASH in School (improving access to clean water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH))
	Rumah Belajar (online learning platform developed by Ministry of Education & Culture)
	• Tanoto Foundation Basic Education Program in partnership with the Ministries of Education
	& Culture (MOEC), Religious Affairs (MORA), and Research Technology and Higher Education (MORTHE) and with 14 districts and 10 Teacher Training Institutes (TTIs), reaching over 500 schools.
	Diversity Teacher School (2016)
	Education Budget Literacy School
	Empowerment of Community Learning Centre  Figure 1
	<ul> <li>Entrepreneurship training program and proficiency for non-schooling population</li> <li>Expansion of Indonesia Smart Program (Program Indonesia Pintar/PIP) to cover higher level of education and vocational courses</li> </ul>
	Mustahik Entrepreneur Program
	• Sekolah Perempuan (The Women's School) is one model of empowering poor women through a lifelong process of learning education
	• The Paradigta Academy is a structured and affirmative education and training program, for women in rural and poor urban areas, especially women heads of households, disability groups, and marginal groups.
	Several programs to improve participation in pre-primary education.
	• Minister for Education Regulation No. 70 Year 2009 concerning Inclusive Education for children with disabilities, special intelligence, special talents
	• Minister for Research, Technology and Higher Education Regulation No. 46 Year 2017
	concerning Special Education and Special Service Education
	Universal Secondary Education (Pendidikan Menengah Universal/PMU) program built new
	schools, especially in frontier regions, to broaden access to senior secondary school.
	• Indonesia Smart Card (KIP) program for children 6-21 years old from poor or vulnerable families, including children currently not in school but wishing to return to school.
	• To prevent children from being unable to continue school, the government increased the
	<ul> <li>amount of School Operational Funds (BOS) for formal &amp; non-formal schools of all levels.</li> <li>Strengthened the implementation of One Roof (SATAP) program in rural and remote areas to</li> </ul>
	ease the transition to junior secondary school.
	Reduction of Child Labour – Hope Family Program (PPA-PKH) was implemented to return child laborers to education suited to their level.

	• The government has also broadened the implementation of Inclusive Education program to			
	facilitate the provision of educational service for children with special needs.			
SDG 5	[None listed]			
SDG 6	[None listed]			
SDG 7	[None listed]			
SDG 8	• Established a special taskforce under Coordinating Ministry of Economic Affairs to lead			
	deregulation efforts.			
	• As of 2018, the government has introduced 18 economic policy packages which consist of tax			
	incentives, liberalization, facilitation, and regulatory harmonization.			
	Drastically cut fuel subsidies to fund infrastructure development			
	Palapa Ring Project (broadband connection to connect 514 regencies and cities) by 2019			
	Village fund to reduce underdeveloped villages (also in SDG 10)			
	<ul> <li>Strategic Partnership to benefit 1,000,000 smallholder farming households 2019-2023.</li> </ul>			
	Gender Equal Wage Equalization Guidelines in the Workplace			
	Task Force for Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) established			
	Creative Economy Agency (Bekraf) to advance & develop the creative economy sector			
	Making Indonesia 4.0 to increase economic growth and revitalize manufacturing, focused on			
	food and beverage, textile and apparel, automotive, electronics, & chemicals.			
	Presidential Instruction no. 9 the (2016) to revitalize vocational high schools			
	Training and certification programs (673,920 and 557,060 participants respectively 2018)			
	E-Commerce Roadmap to facilitate e-commerce development			
	In 2015, the government has published a roadmap to fully eradicate child labour in 2022			
	National Program for Reducing Child Labour			
	Forum Sosial Dialog is led by Konfederasi Serikat Buruh Sejahtera Indonesia (KSBSI) with			
	Apindo and Local Government started in 2014. Through this forum, KSBSI reached an			
	agreement to establish Mutual Agreement with some big companies in Bandung, Subang and			
	Bogor to improve work conditions and worker productivity. There are 71 companies and 80,073			
	workers in the garment and agriculture sectors.			
	<ul> <li>Workers in the garment and agriculture sectors.</li> <li>Employment Policy Forum to facilitate discussions on labour related policies in Indonesia</li> </ul>			
	Develop 10 Tourism Priority Destinations, with integrated promotion programs, and relaxation			
	of immigration and visa policy.			
	New policy in 2018 on microlending named KUR (Kredit Usaha Rakyat) and launched Kredit			
	UMi for SMEs.			
	• The government launched an apprenticeship program; 10,790 workers joined as of 2018.			
SDG 9	• Increased Microlending (Kredit Usaha Rakyat/KUR) distribution, with as much as Rp120			
	trillion distributed by 31 December 2018.			
<b>SDG 10</b>	• In the 2015-2019 National Medium-Term Development Plan, efforts to achieve equitable			
	development, reduce inequality between income groups include the following policies:			
	o (1) Development of a comprehensive social security system			
	o (2) Improvement of basic public services for the poor			
	o (3) Development of sustainable livelihood for the poor through employment distribution			
	and entrepreneurship			
	Universal health coverage			
	• Social assistance programs including the Family Hope Program, Smart Indonesia Program,			
	Rice for the Poor, Non-Cash Food Assistance.			
	National Social Security System			
	• Village Fund (2014) (also in SDG 8)			
	Desk Papua, established by the Ministry of National Development Planning, formulated the			
	2018-9 National Action Plan (NAP) for planning, implementation, monitoring & evaluation of			
ana 11	government programs & activities			
SDG 11	[None listed]			
SDG 12	• The company performance rating program (Proper) is a program to assess the level of			
CDC 42	company's role in environmental management.			
SDG 13	DRR (Disaster Risk Reduction)			
	• All 34 Provinces have adopted a Disaster Management Plan (RPB), while at the district/city			
	level the proportion is 30%.			
	• As an initial step, DRR policies are internalized into 2015-2019 Government Work Plan,			
	implemented by 32 Ministries/Institutions through 68 programs. These plans strengthen the			

- capacity of disaster management implementation in the regions. Disaster management is set as a Minimum Service Standard for the implementation of regional governance.
- Disaster risk research and mappings were conducted in 34 provinces & 170 districts/cities.
- Established Tangguh Bencana Village in 594 villages in 186 districts/cities. A Tangguh Bencana Village has a capability to adapt and deal with disasters and recover immediately
- The Government continuously supports capacity building on regional disaster management through education and training for regional government officials in collaboration with the Training Agency in all provinces, forming and training Rapid Response Teams in 34 provinces and 136 districts/cities, providing technical guidance in damage assessment and recovery planning and community resilience building.
- To improve disaster management capacity, the Government also provides support for local governments and communities in improving disaster awareness culture and preparedness in facing disasters.
  - This support includes disaster relief equipment distributed to the districts/cities level, logistical assistance for basic needs, logistical support and equipment assistance during disasters.
  - O To build a culture of awareness, the Government has also provided information system assistance integrated with operational control centres (Pusdalops) in 30 provinces and 104 districts/cities, disaster awareness culture campaigns, and disaster management public relations services.
- Disaster Management Priority Program focuses on 136 priority districts, including strengthening disaster management capacity, increasing disaster facilities and infrastructure, emergency management and post-disaster recovery, and strengthening disaster management.

#### Climate Change Adaptation

- 15 pilot areas for the National Action Plan for Climate Change Adaptation (RAN-API)
- The API-PRB convergence process aims to reduce the adverse impacts of disasters due to the increase of variability and climate change. That convergence will encourage the policy and institutional reform to accommodate API and DRR.
- Conservation Agriculture programs have been adopted by some provinces to assist climate adaptation, and 2 provinces have integrated it into the local mid-term development plan (RPJMD) allocating funds from their budgets.
- Farmers Field Schools program

#### Climate Mitigation

- PR No. 61 (2011) on Greenhouse Gas Action Plan (also under SDG 17)
- PR No. 71 (2011) on GHG emissions, with special emphasis on climate mitigation (also under SDG 17)
- Government Regulation (GR) No. 46 (2016) on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) included climate actions (also under SDG 17).
- Policies in the form of mitigation actions in the fields of forestry and peat land include: (1) Control of forest and peat land fires; (2) Forest and land rehabilitation; (3) Moratorium and postponement of new permits to primary forests and peat lands; (4) Decrease in deforestation; (5) Increase in implementation of sustainable forest management principles, both in natural forests (decreasing forest degradation) and in plantations; and (6) Peat land restoration.
- The mitigation policies in the agriculture sector include: (1) The application of agricultural cultivation technology through the Rice Intensification System, integrated crop management, and the use of low emission rice varieties; (2) Utilization of organic fertilizers and biopesticides in the form of subsidized organic fertilizer and procurement of Processing Units Organic Fertilizer (UPPO); and (3) Utilization of manure/urine and agricultural waste for biogas.
- Mitigation policies that have been carried out by the Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources consist of 5 main activities: (1) The improvement of energy efficiency through the mandatory implementation of energy management for energy-intensive users, increased efficiency of household appliances and LED street lighting construction; (2) The development of new and renewable energy through new renewable power plants, energy-saving solar power lamps (LTSHE), solar street public lighting, utilization of biogas and biodiesel; (3) The development of low carbon fuels through transportation fuel switching (RON 88 to RON 90 and 92), petroleum to LPG conversion program, natural gas-fuelled urban public transportations and an increase in household natural gas pipeline connections; (4) The implementation of clean technology through the use of clean coal technology and cogeneration at power plants; and (5) Post-mining land reclamation.

- Industry Sector. Mitigation actions in the industrial sector consists of, among others, the implementation of energy conservation/diversification and the application of modifications in the process and technology in the cement industry. Energy conservation/diversification implementation activities consist of 4 (four) activities, namely: (1) Energy conservation in energy-consuming industries; (2) Implementation of EnMS and system optimization in energy-wasteful industries; (3) Implementation of EnMS and energy efficiency in pulp & paper, steel, textile and food industries; and (4) Conservation of energy in the cement industry.
- Transportation Sector. The mitigation policies carried out by the Ministry of Transportation include actions in the land, sea, air and railway transportation sectors, such as, (1) Provision of bus stimulus assistance for several cities; (2) Installation of ATCS (Area Traffic Control Systems) in national road segments; (3) Optimization of aviation efficiency; (4) Rejuvenation of Performance Base Navigation (PBN) of air transport; (5) Reforestation and utilization of new and renewable energy in of airport environments; (6) Construction of solar cell technology on shipping navigation aid instrument (SBNP); (7) Construction of dual railroad lanes along northern Java, in Jabodetabek urban area, and the Trans Sumatra railway line.
- Waste Management Sector. Climate change mitigation policies in the waste management sector have been focused in 2 (two) subsectors, namely (1) Waste water, with the construction of infrastructure including off-site and on-site systems such as WWTP, IPLT, and MCK++; and (2) Waste, with the construction of landfills and an integrated Reduce, Reuse, Recycle (3R) waste management system.
- Indonesia Climate Change Trust Fund (ICCTF) (2009)
- 'Low Carbon Development Initiatives' (LCDI) implemented 2 pilot projects working with subnational governments. First, the Indonesia Climate Change Trust Fund (ICCTF) project in Central Java. The project combines climate action with income generation through investment in bio-digesters which produce bio-slurry and compost that could improve the quality of soil and ecosystem. Second, the signing of sustainable province commitment by the West Papua provincial government on International Conference on Biodiversity, Ecotourism and Creative Economy held in Manokwari, West Papua (2018).

- During 2015-2018, marine protected areas increased from 17.3 to 19.3 million ha.
- There are 11 Fisheries Management Areas (WPP) based on the Minister for Maritime Affairs & Fisheries Decree No. 18 (2014). Fisheries Management Plans (RPP) for all WPP has been determined through the Ministerial Decree of Marine & Fisheries Affairs

#### SDG 15 [None listed]

#### **SDG 16**

Access to Justice for All

- National Strategy on Access to Justice (Strategi Nasional Akses pada Keadilan, SNAK) and later amend in 2013, and Legal Aid Law No. 16 (2011).
- Until 2018, the national legal aid fund helped thousands of poor and vulnerable people
- Established an information management system for prisons and detention centers between 2015 and 2017, to increase transparency and accountability.
- 2015 MoU between 8 line ministries on the Acceleration on the Ownership of Birth Certificate for Child Protection and Ministry of Home Affairs Decree No. 9 Year 2016 on the Acceleration of the Birth Certificate Ownership. These regulations facilitate registering birth certificates.
- Government is currently developing a comprehensive strategy for Civil Registration & Vital Statistics, including accelerating birth registration, esp. for marginalized groups.

Peaceful and Inclusive Societies for Sustainable Development

- Amendment of the Marriage Law, especially concerning the minimum age of marriage and development of a national strategy for the prevention of child marriage in 2019.
- Efforts to shift local discriminatory by-laws and regulations in line with the national legal framework include: a) Adopted a Joint Ministerial Regulation between the Ministry of Law and Human Rights and the Ministry of Home Affairs setting human rights parameters for formulating bylaws and local regulations; b) Consultations between the Ministry of Law and Human Rights and local governments regarding new by-laws.; and c) Enhancing capacity and knowledge on human rights for state apparatus in provinces and cities.
- Since the establishment of Indonesia's Human Rights Commission, various state agencies have been created, such as the Judicial Commission (Komisi Yudisial, KY) and General Elections Commission (Komisi Pemilihan Umum, KPU), Public Information Commission (Komisi Informasi Publik, KIP) and Corruption Eradication Commission (Komisi Pemberantasan Korupsi, KPK).

Policies & strategies to prevent and reduce violence to children and homicide include:

- Law No.17 Year 2016 on the Implementation of PERPPU No. 1 Year 2016 on the Second Amendment to Law No. 23 Year 2002 on Child Protection to Emphasizing the Punishment for Perpetrators of Sexual Violence Against Children. Also, the Minister of Education Decree No. 82 Year 2015 on Prevention & Control of Violence in the Educational Environment
- 2016-2020 National Strategy for the Elimination Violence Against Children (Strans PKtA) (cross-sector guidance through comprehensive intervention)
- Creating Children Friendly City.

Strategic development programs to prevent and reduce violence of children & homicide:

- The improvement of Forum Anak's (Children Forum) role as a pioneer and informant on violence prevention
- Telepon Sahabat Anak and Telepon Pelayanan Sosial Anak (Call Centre for Children TeSA and TepSA), operating 24 hour 7 days a week to received complains on violence, mistreatment, exploitation, and neglection of children
- Increasing human resource capacity of institutions addressing prevention, handling and rehabilitation of victims of violence, exploitation, neglect and mistreatment, and developing and strengthening children social welfare programs
- Strengthening the Integrated Service Centre for Women and Children (P2TP2A) supported by the Taskforce for Women and Children Protection (Satgas PPA)
- Development of programs to prevent violence against children in schools by promoting the use of positive discipline for teachers and the development of anti-bullying prevention programs
- Strengthening the capacity of families and societies for the prevention and early detection of violence, mistreatment, exploitation and neglect through increasing the role of business community, mass media, and public to strengthen family-based care and the Community-Based Integration Child Protection (PATBM)
- Increasing public participation, including children, through development of Child Friendly District/City.

Effective, Accountable, and Inclusive Institutions at All Levels

- National Strategy for Prevention of Corruption (STRANAS PK)
- To strengthen management and prevention of corruption, the Indonesian Government implemented a technology-based system of procurement (e-procurement).
- Law No. 14 Year 2008 on Public Information Transparency
- Legal requirement of 30% quota for women to run for Parliament for each political party

### SDG 17 Tax\*

- Law No. 11 Year 2016 on Tax Amnesty and its technical elaboration in Regulation of the Ministry of Finance 118/PMK.03/2016 was used to increase tax mobilization.
- Enactment of Government Regulation in Lieu of Law ('Peraturan Pemerintah Pengganti Undang-Undang', Perppu) No. 1 Year 2017 on Access to Financial Information for Tax Purposes. The 'Perppu' oversees access to financial information in implementing national and international tax regulations.

### Tariffs

• Weighted mean tariff rates in 6 Free Trade Agreement (FTA) partner countries—Australia, China, India, Japan, New Zealand, and South Korea—declined significantly from 6.1 (2017) to 4.4 (2018) compared to 9.3 and 7.9 in 2015 & 2016, respectively.

#### **Economic Policies**

- Sound macroeconomic policies (prudent monetary and fiscal policy)
- "Remarkable" increase in government spending on physical infrastructure, about 17% per year during 2015-2018
- The government released at least 16 policy packages since 2015 (almost once each quarter) covering a huge number of activities at the micro-economic level. They promoted industrial competitiveness, business climate, law enforcement, investment attraction, interest rates, etc. resulting in positive effects on markets for goods and services.
- The packages include also included policies directly addressing equality issues.
  - One is a special credit scheme for SMEs called Kredit Usaha Rakyat (KUR). The previous interest rate of 22% was significantly reduced to 12%. The KUR also expanded the eligible beneficiaries beyond SMEs to include 3 categories of Indonesia's migrant workers: those who work abroad, those who return home, and the worker's families.
  - The tax rate for SMEs was reduced from 1% to 0.5% of total sales by a new Government Regulation (GR) No. 23 Year 2018 replacing GR No. 46 Year 2013.

 Indonesia developed a wide range of non-traditional mechanisms to mobilize funds for development (innovative financing (IF)). Relatively large scale IF initiatives include the Non-State Budget Investment Financing ('Pembiayaan Investasi Non-Anggaran Pemerintah', PINA) and the Government Cooperation with Business Entity ('Kerja Sama Pemerintah dan Badan Usaha, KPBU). PINA finances infrastructure projects yielding Internal Rate Return (IRR) above 13%. PINA also facilitates cooperation among investors and investees from domestic and international markets.

#### **Innovative Financing**

- The KPBU is a type of infrastructure financing. Projects include line ministries, state-owned enterprises, and local governments. Up to now, there are 19 KPBU projects, and 13 projects totalling about USD 8.9 billion have been funded through the solicited scheme. These 13 projects are the part of National Strategic Projects ('Proyek Strategis Nasional', PSN) that include construction of toll road, energy, telecommunication, and water provision. One of the successful stories is Drinking Water Provision System ('Sistem Penyediaan Air Minum', SPAM) in Umbulan, East Java.
- PT SMI is a state-owned enterprise (SOE) mandated to accelerate infrastructure development and support implementation of Public Private Partnership (PPP) schemes.
- PT SMI issued the first green bond in Indonesia in 2018. This follows another previously issued bond, called 'Sustainable Sukuk Bond I of SMI'—an Islamic shari'a financing.
- Financial Services Authority's (OJK) comprehensive Sustainable Finance Roadmap, includes 19 medium and long-term activities to be conducted between 2015 and 2024 of all financial services institutions to implement sustainable finance.
- For example, in July 2018, a special book explaining fikih zakat on SDGs (literally, legal basis for contribution to SDGs for Muslim) was published, the first achievement in the world of Islamic financing. This guideline was initiated by the National Amil Zakat Agency (BAZNAS) in collaboration with Baznas, Indonesian Ulama Majlis, Indonesian Philanthropy, Islamic State University of Syarif Hidayatullah, supported by the Ministry of National Development Planning of Bappenas and the Ministry of Religious Affairs. The guideline is implemented through a blended finance scheme among the Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources, BAZNAS, Jambi Bank and UNDP to build a Micro Hydro Power Plant in Jambi Province in Sumatera, which provides electricity to four remote villages for 803 households, impacting 4,448 people.

#### Climate Action

- Climate action policy started from PR No. 61 Year 2011 on Greenhouse Gas Action Plan and PR No. 71 Year 2011 on GHG Emission, emphasizing climate mitigation.
- Bappenas' National Action Plan on Climate Adaptation (2014) on climate adaptation (also under SDG 13)
- Government Regulation (GR) No. 46 (2016) on Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) was established under Law No. 32 (2009) on Environmental Protection and Management. Under SEA, the Minister of Home Affairs issued MR No. 7 (2018) instructing subnational governments to incorporate SEA in their RPJMD and spatial plan of RTRW.

#### Communication Technology

- 'Palapa Ring' connects about 500 districts & cities through a large broadband network
- The Presidential Instruction (Instruksi Presiden, Inpres) No. 9 Year 2015 on Public Communication Management has made established connectivity among the country's islands ensuring equality of access to information to narrow the country's digital divide.
  - This Inpres supports GR No. 96 Year 2014 on National Broadband 2014 -2019, further elaborated in Joined Circular Letter (Surat Edaran Bersama, SEB) of the Ministry of Communication and Informatics and the Ministry of Home Affairs on Joined Development and Utilization of Passive Telecommunication Infrastructure with possible involvement of sub-national governments.
  - Minister of Finance Regulation (Peraturan Menteri Keuangan,PMK) 129/PMK.08/2016 replacing 265/PMK.08/2015 on Preparation and Implementation KPBU Infrastructure Project facilitates financing for sub-national parties to join.

#### **Institutional Capacity**

- Law No. 8 Year 2008 on Public Information Openness
- Regulation of the Ministry of Home Affairs No. 8 Year 2014 on Information System of Subnational Governance (Sistem Informasi Pemerintahan Daerah, SIPD) has provided a solid foundation for e-planning and e-budgeting.

- Regulation on e-procurement has also been in place since 2010 through PR No. 54 Year 2010, then later replaced by PR No. 4 Year 2015. Later, the legal foundation of e-procurement was established by PR No. 16 Year 2018 on Government Procurement of Goods and Services.
- Open Government Indonesia (OGI). PR No. 13 Year 2014 on the Determination of Indonesia's Membership in Open Government Partnership.
- Layanan Aspirasi dan Pengaduan Online Rakyat or 'LAPOR!' ('Report it!' or Public's Online Complaint and Aspiration Service) was officially established as a National Public Service Complaint Management System (Sistem Pengelolaan Pengaduan Pelayanan Publik Nasional/SP4N) through PR No. 76 Year 2013. This is further accompanied by regulation of the Ministry of State Apparatus and Bureaucracy Reform 13/2017 on Public Services Information System (Sistem Informasi Pelayanan Publik/SIPP).
- Action plan on Open Government 2018-2020. (5<sup>th</sup> action plan since joining the OGP)
- President released GR No. 54 Year 2018 on National Strategy on Corruption Prevention

Source: (Republic of Indonesia 2019)

**Budget:** As explained by (Elder and Bartalini 2019), "Indonesia's 2017 VNR mentioned that each SDG has a corresponding program, a responsible line ministry, contributing non-state actors, and a state budget allocation. However, the VNR did not include the budget for the goals. Under SDG 5, the VNR explained that in the effort to eliminate all forms of discrimination, gender-responsive budgeting has been developed. It also stated that local governments have allocated funds for SDGs in their budgets. In general, the 2017 VNR considered financing as a major challenge for achieving the SDGs. Thus, the VNR explained that even though the Government of Indonesia has allocated funding for implementing the SDGs, it is insufficient, and it is recommended to explore other funding sources, especially private fund mobilization and foreign cooperation."

Indonesia's 2019 VNR explains that the country "seeks as much as possible to find a variety of financing sources to fund SDGs implementation, both conventional and innovative financing schemes" (p. 33), although it also acknowledges that "undoubtedly, tax is the fuel that allows the government to implement the SDGs" (p. 171), and "until now, tax is still a dominant source of development financing" (p. 174). The VNR highlighted that Indonesia has been able to significantly increase the amount of tax revenues, from Rp 835 trillion in 2013 to 1,251 trillion in 2017, an increase of almost 50 percent (p. 172). However, tax revenue has not increased harmonically with GDP, so the tax/GDP ratio declined slightly from 11.3 percent to 10.2 percent between 2013 and 2018 (p. 172).

Specific budget items were only mentioned in 6 SDGs covering a total of 9 budget items in Indonesia's 2019 VNR. These are listed below in Table 7. Clearly these are only selected examples and do not indicate the total amount of government spending on SDGs.

<sup>\*</sup> Other categories were included under SDG 17 and "means of implementation" but were not included here because concrete policies were not listed.

Table 7: Budget Items Listed in Indonesia's 2019 VNR

SDG		Budget Item		Amount
SDG 1	•	Family Hope Program (2018)	•	17.42t IDR
SDG 4	•	Special Allocation Fund (SAF) for Education Infrastructure (2018) Teachers' Work Group/Forum for Subject Teachers involvement in preparing National Standard School Examinations	•	635m USD 900m Rupiah
SDG 8	•	Infrastructure budget 2019 Palapa Ring project (broadband connection) Village fund to reduce underdeveloped villages (2019)	•	415t IDR 1.6b USD 73t IDR
SDG 9	•	Microlending (Kredit Usaha Rakyat/KUR) distribution (2018)	•	120t IDR
SDG 13	•	Conservation Agriculture Programs (budgets of 2 provinces in 2019) 5b IDR + 6b IDR	•	11b IDR
SDG 17	•	Government spending on physical infrastructure (2018) including Special Allocation Fund ('Dana Alokasi Khusus', DAK) on infrastructure, Village Fund ('Dana Desa') on infrastructure, and General Transfer ('Transfer Umum')	•	410t IDR

Source: (Republic of Indonesia 2019)

**Overall:** Poverty reduction was a key focus of Indonesia's 2017 VNR, while inclusiveness and equality were key focuses of the 2019 VNR. SDGs have been extensively integrated into Indonesia's development plans. Significant concrete efforts were being made in all the 13 SDGs highlighted in both VNRs, especially in terms of policies. Significant funding for the SDGs has been provided by the Government of Indonesia from the government budget, and major examples were cited in the 2019 VNR for 6 SDGs. In addition, Indonesia has made significant efforts to obtain a range of other sources of funding. Efforts are being made at all levels of government.

### 3.4 Lao PDR

**Strategies:** Lao PDR issued its first VNR in 2018 (Lao PDR 2019). It covered all 17 SDGs, unlike some larger countries which only addressed 6 or 7. A National Steering Committee for SDG implementation was created. It is chaired by the Prime Minister with members from all related ministries, agencies, and mass organizations. The National SDG Secretariat is led by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of Planning and Investment. The VNR "was developed based on the principle of leaving no one behind," and explains that "the VNR process included concrete feedback from civil society organizations" (p. 3).

The SDGs have been embedded in the Eighth National Socio-Economic Development Plan (NSEDP). According to the VNR, "The Government of Lao PDR is implementing the SDGs through the NSEDPs and the sector development plans of each ministry" (p. 6). The VNR explained "nearly 60 percent of the Eighth NSEDP indicators are linked to SDG indicators," while the remaining ones will be integrated into the Ninth and Tenth NSEDPs (p. vi). Lao PDR added an 18<sup>th</sup> SDG, "Lives safe from unexploded ordinance (UXO)" which remains a serious problem left over from the Indochina War. The VNR also explained its methodology, process, and inputs, including stakeholder feedback and consultation.

The VNR mapped the SDGs with the 3 NSEDP Outcomes as indicated in Table 8.

Table 8: Lao PDR's NSEDP Outcomes and Targets Mapped to SDGs

	NSEDP Outcomes and Outputs	Related SDGs
Outcome 1	Sustained inclusive economic growth, reduced economic vulnerability	
Output 1	Sustained and inclusive economic growth	8, 10
Output 2	Macroeconomic stability	16, 17
Output 3	Integrated development planning and budgeting	9, 17
Output 4	Balanced regional and local development	1, 7, 9, 10
Output 5	Improved public/private labour force capacity	4, 8, 12
Output 6	Local entrepreneurs are competitive in domestic and global markets	8, 9
Output 7	Regional and international cooperation and integration	8, 9, 17
Outcome 2	Human resources developed, workforce capacity upgraded, poverty in all ethnic groups reduced, equal access to quality education and health services, the unique Lao culture promoted, protected and developed, and political stability maintained with social peace and creden justice and transparence.	
Output 1	Improved living standards through poverty reduction	1, 3, 4, 6, 7, 10, 18
Output 1 Output 2	Ensured food security and reduced incidence of malnutrition	2
Output 2 Output 3	Access to high quality education	4
Output 4	Access to high quality lealth care and preventive medicine	3, 6
Output 5	Enhanced social protection	1
Output 6	Protection of traditions and culture	8, 11, 12
Output 7	Maintain political stability, social peace, order, justice, and transparency	5, 16
Outcome 3	Natural resources and the environment protected and sustainably	3, 10
	managed, green growth promoted, disaster preparedness enhanced and climate resilience developed	
Output 1	Environmental protection and sustainable natural resource management	11, 13, 15
Output 2	Preparedness for natural disasters and risk reduction	1, 11, 13
Output 3	Reduced instability of agricultural production	2, 13
	Cross-cutting outputs contributing to all Outcomes	5, 17
Output 1	Public governance and administration enhanced	16
Output 2	Local innovation and use of science, technology and telecommunications promoted, information and communication technologies (ICT) enhanced	17
Output 3	Gender equality and empowerment of women and youth	3, 4, 5, 8

Source: (Lao PDR 2019) pp. 10-11

**Policies:** The discussion of individual SDGs focused mainly on the level of progress, including both areas of good and limited progress, challenges, and data issues. There was also a major focus on future plans and the way forward. However, there was no systematic discussion of policies. In some cases, specific policies were identified as having contributed to progress, and these are listed below in Table 9. Sometimes existing policies were mentioned in the discussion on the way forward, focusing on how these policies would be revised. However, for some SDGs, the VNR did not mention any policies that contributed to the progress. Some policies were also mentioned in other parts of the VNR, and these are also mentioned in Table 9, but there was no systematic discussion. It is likely that Lao PDR implemented more policies related to the SDGs, but they simply were not mentioned in the VNR due to the focus on measurement of progress and the way forward. Moreover, the NSEDP is a comprehensive development plan which is related to all SDGs, but it is not repeated under each SDG in Table 9. Some policies are listed twice, especially some climate related policies are listed under both SDG 13 and 15.

Table 9: Policies Mentioned in Lao PDR's VNR Classified by SDGs

SDGs	Policies			
SDG 1	Expansion of rural infrastructure, roads, and services			
SDG 2	National Zero Hunger Challenge 2015			
	Agricultural Development Strategy 2020			
	National Nutrition Strategy and Plan of Action			
SDG 3	Immunization programs			
SDG 4	(No specific policies mentioned.)			
SDG 5	• The Constitution of the Lao PDR guarantees equality between men and women in politics,			
	economy, culture, and society, as well as in the family			
	• The Lao Women's Union (LWU), established in 1955 is mandated to represent women of all			
	ethnic groups, to protect women's rights and benefits. It has three campaigns: "Good Citizen,			
	Good Development, and Good Family." and reaches out to women from the national,			
	provincial, district and village levels.			
	• The National Commission for the Advancement of Women, Mothers and Children, established			
	since 2003, is mandated to define related national policies, strategies, and programmes, and it			
	implements national policy for the advancement of women as well as mainstreaming gender in			
	all sectors.			
	• The Women Parliamentarians Caucus (formed in 2002) organizes female leadership training			
	and gender training workshops for parliamentarians.  • 2016-2020 Women's Development Plan			
	2016-2020 Women's Development Plan			
	National Gender Equality Development Plan			
	Second National Strategy on Gender Equality (2016-2025)			
	• Implementation of the Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against			
	Women (CEDAW).			
	National Law on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Children  National Law on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Children  National Law on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Children  National Law on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Children  National Law on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Children  National Law on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Children  National Law on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Children  National Law on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Children  National Law on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Children  National Law on Preventing Against Women and Children  National Law on Preventing Against Women and Children  National Law of Children  Nationa			
	National Action Plan on Eliminating Violence against Women and Children  National Action Plan on Eliminating Violence against Women and Children  National Action Plan on Eliminating Violence against Women and Children			
	Noi 2030 Framework – Achieving Gender Equality & Empowerment of Adolescent Girls			
GD C	Hotline, counselling and protection services for women and child victims of violence			
SDG 6	• Updated Water and Water Resources Law (updated in 2017). New provisions on water rights			
	and use, including waste-water discharge permits, wetlands and water-resource protection,			
	ground-water management, and river-basin management. Additionally, the law expands the			
	terms and conditions of large, medium, and small-scale uses  Notional Pivor Regin Development Strategy 2020 and Five Year Action Plan (2018, 2022)			
	National River Basin Development Strategy 2030 and Five-Year Action Plan (2018-2022)      Figure diagrams I consist in The Covernment is scaling up milet initiatives in Champach, and			
	• Expanding rural sanitation. The Government is scaling up pilot initiatives in Champasak and Sekong provinces.			
SDG 7	Renewable Energy Development Strategy sets out the efficient utilization and development of			
SDG /	all energy resources. Policy priorities focus on small power development for self-sufficiency			
	and grid connection, biofuels production and marketing, and development of other clean			
	energies in the country			
	chorgies in the country			

### SDG 8 Significant expansion of skills training and development programs Labour Law 2013 Formulating the First National Rural Employment Strategy, to enhance collaboration and synergy among national and provincial authorities towards increasing rural incomes and employment, as well as strengthen labour and social protection in rural areas. The Government is developing national skills standards and testing and certification systems benchmarked with standards of other ASEAN economies and is seeking to make the TVET system more responsive to labour market needs. Government's One District, One Product Strategy aims to reduce poverty, create jobs, equip people with skills, and bring Lao products to regional & international markets SDG 9 Lao PDR Road Sector II Project (part of national program to build climate-resilient roads and infrastructure) SME Development Plan 2016-2020 **SDG 10** Revising banking laws & regulations moving towards compliance with int'l. standards. **SDG 11** Local disaster risk reduction strategies are being developed and revised. Vientiane Sustainable Urban Transport Project was approved in 2015. Bus Rapid Transit system will be developed for Vientiane Capital, followed by improved traffic management, paid parking systems, and better accessibility for pedestrians and non-motor traffic. 8th NSEDP includes programmes to enhance urban water & sanitation, improve public governance & admin., establish "Green & Clean Towns" (incl. climate-smart planning). The Department of Housing and Urban Planning, and the Ministry of Public Works and Transportation have adopted an urban sector strategy. It includes strategies on solid waste, water sector investment, urban sanitation, capacity development for urban planning and development authorities; improvement of the legal and regulatory framework for the urban sector; urban transport and housing development. The Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MoNRE) is developing 46 "Clean and Beautiful Guidelines" to promote environmental quality, (expect approval soon). MoNRE is also in the process of proposing the National Land Use Master Plan to the National Assembly for consideration. **SDG 12** The efficient use and sustainable management of natural resources is a priority for Lao PDR. This priority has been mainstreamed into the Eighth NSEDP. Ecotourism is also a national priority in the Eighth NSEDP Lao PDR Action Plan to implement the 2016 Pakse Declaration on ASEAN Roadmap for Strategic Development of Ecotourism Clusters & Tourism Corridors Green Growth National Steering Committee established in 2016 to develop the National Green Growth Strategy MoNRE is in the process of identifying Green Procurement guidelines **SDG 13** National law on Intended Nationally Determined Contribution passed in 2016. National Climate Change Strategy (2010) (also listed under SDG 15) Forestry Strategy to the Year 2020 of the Lao PDR (2005) (also listed under SDG 15) • Renewable Energy Development Strategy (2011) (also listed under SDG 15) Sustainable Transport Development Strategy (2010) (also listed under SDG 15) Climate Change Action Plan of Lao PDR for 2013-2020 (2013) (also listed under SDG 15) National Adaptation Programme of Action (2009) Investment and Financial Flows to Address Climate Change in Energy Agriculture and Water Sectors (2015). **SDG 14** (The VNR indicates that Lao PDR interprets this SDG in terms of freshwater resources since it is a landlocked country, but existing policies were not mentioned.) **SDG 15** Prime Minister's Order No. 15, 2016, imposes a ban on logging from production forests. It has been highly effective, making the forest sector more sustainable by implementing and testing more participatory models of forest management, and introducing important forest governance reforms including certification & timber legality assurance systems. National Climate Change Strategy (2010) (also listed under SDG 13) Forestry Strategy to the Year 2020 of the Lao PDR (2005) (also listed under SDG 13) Renewable Energy Development Strategy (2011) (also listed under SDG 13) Sustainable Transport Development Strategy (2010) (also listed under SDG 13) Climate Change Action Plan of Lao PDR for 2013-2020 (2013) (also listed under SDG 13) National Adaptation Programme of Action (2009) (also listed under SDG 13)

	National REDD+ Strategy (to be approved by June 2018)
	Forest Resource Development Fund
	Certification model testing has started.
<b>SDG 16</b>	• Law on Anti-Corruption (2012), anti-corruption action plan issued in 2013. Targets expected
	to be fulfilled by 2020.
	Declaration of assets for government officials at all levels
<b>SDG 17</b>	Improved legal framework for expanded census and generation of disaggregated data.
	Legislative amendments made in several areas, including tax, trade, intellectual property.
	Lao Services Portal contains information related to trade and investment services
	Establishment of a Regulatory Authority for the Telecommunication Sector
	• Adopted telecommunications sector regulations, in particular the framework for competition,
	interconnection, licensing regime and spectrum management.
	• To comply with the AEC integration process, Lao PDR is expected to reduce its tariffs on imports from other ASEAN countries to zero by 2018 and remove non-tariff barriers.
	Efforts are being made to enforce the Law on Intellectual Property and the associated
	implementation of trademarks, copyrights, and industrial patents.
	A National Science & Technology Strategy 2013-2020, & Vision 2030 were developed.
	Law on Science and Technology was presented to the National Assembly for approval.
	Key initiatives to improve science & technology's contribution to development include: making
	ICT work for education, private sector partnerships for ICT, connecting rural communities,
	linking research & farmers, establishing an online early warning system.
	• Various laws and decrees help shape the direction of private investment such as the Investment
	Promotion Law 2009 and its 2016 revision, and the Enterprise Law which set the framework
	for private sector investment.
	A strategic plan for capital market development covers the period 2016-2025.
	Government & partners developed a monitoring framework (Vientiane Declaration Country      No. (A.R.)      We have a support of the control of the cont
	Action Plan - VDCAP), in line with the global partnership for effective development cooperation to guide monitoring & reporting.
	<ul> <li>The Government with development partners' support is implementing a comprehensive Legal</li> </ul>
	Sector Master Plan. Efforts focus on strengthening institutional and human resource capacities
	to protect and advocate for people's rights, building stronger safeguards for the exercise of the
	rights of all citizens, improving people's access to law and justice institutions, developing
	clearer, more consistent, and responsive laws and regulations, and monitoring and reporting on
	international legal obligations.
<b>SDG 18</b>	A major national survey is underway to provide details on geographic areas contaminated by
	UXOs in the form of Confirmed Hazardous Areas (CHAs).
	UXO Victim Assistance Strategy
	Lao PDR UXO Survey Procedures, adopted on 15 January 2015  CDC  CDC  CDC  CDC  CDC  CDC  CDC  C

<sup>\*</sup> Some policies were listed under more than one SDG.

Source: (Lao PDR 2019)

**Budget:** Specific budget amounts were not mentioned in the VNR. Nevertheless, the SDGs are linked to the overall national development plans as well as many existing plans and policies, so presumably they have some allocation under the government budget. Therefore, it is likely that a significant share of the government budget is related to SDGs, even though the VNR also indicates that Lao PDR is aiming to attract substantial external funding for the SDGs. According to the VNR, "the Government estimates that implementing the National Socio-Economic Development Plan (NSEDP, 2016—2020) will require over USD 21.4 billion," with 40-49 percent from foreign and domestic private investment, 40-49 percent from financial institutions, 12-15 percent from the Government, and 15-24 percent from ODA (p. 66).<sup>2</sup>

**Overall:** Overall, Lao PDR's VNR indicates that the country is making substantial efforts on the SDGs. Even though the VNR does not have a section specifically listing policies, in fact, many existing policies, as well as some new policies under development, are mentioned in various places in the VNR. The list compiled here is quite extensive and indicates that a wide range of efforts is being made.

## 3.5 Malaysia

**Strategy:** Malaysia published its first VNR in 2017 (Government of Malaysia 2017). All of Malaysia's development plans have incorporated elements of sustainable development. The current plan is the Eleventh Malaysia Plan 2016-2020 (11MP), which was developed around the same time as the SDGs were agreed. "Anchoring growth on people" is the 11MP's theme. The VNR stated that "the 11MP is aligned to most of the SDGs" (p. iv) and presents a diagram mapping the SDGs to the 11MP (p. 46) which is summarized in Table 10. In addition to the 6 "strategic thrusts," the 11MP includes 6 "game changers" to shift the growth trajectory: 1) unlocking the potential of productivity, 2) uplifting B40 [bottom 40 percent of] households towards a middle class society, 3) enabling industry-led technical and vocational education and training, 4) embarking on green growth, 5) translation innovation to wealth, and 6) investing in cities. Achievements and progress as well as the SDG implementation framework and the enabling environment were major focuses of Malaysia's VNR. Directions for moving forward for further progress were also discussed for highlighted SDGs.

Despite the existence of the 11MP, Malaysia nevertheless also planned to develop a National SDG Roadmap for phase 1 (2016-2020). The process to develop the Roadmap started in 2017 and began with a mapping exercise to map Malaysia's existing policies with the SDGs.

Malaysia has a highly developed institutional structure for SDG implementation, as well as an extensive process of stakeholder consultation. The National SDG Council is chaired by the Prime Minister and supported by the National Steering Committee (NSC). The 5 Cluster Working Committees combine related SDGs and include stakeholder participation. Malaysia plans to implement SDGs in 3 phases corresponding to the 5-year Malaysia Plan periods, so the SDGs will be incorporated into the national development framework. The relationship between the strategic thrusts of the 11MP and the SDGs is indicated in Table 10.

Table 10: Comparison of Malaysia's Eleventh National Plan and SDGs

11MP	Strategic Thrust	Related SDGs
1	Enhancing inclusiveness towards an equitable society	1, 2, 5, 6, 10, 11
2	Improving well-being for all	3, 11, 16
3	Accelerating human capital development for an advanced nation	4, 8
4	Pursuing green growth for sustainability and resilience	6, 7, 12, 13, 14, 15
5	Strengthening infrastructure to support economic expansion	7,9
6	Re-engineering economic growth for greater prosperity	2, 8, 9, 17
(NA)	Transforming public service for productivity	16

Source: (Government of Malaysia 2017) (p. 46)

**Policies:** The VNR focused on Malaysia's achievements regarding the 6 SDGs which were highlighted at the HLPF in 2017, plus SDG 17 which has been highlighted each year at the HLPF, and SDG 15. Specifically, it discussed current status, key success factors, and remaining priorities for each. However, in another section, the VNR listed the main national policies and actions for each SDG which were identified by the mapping exercise in the process of formulating the National SDG Roadmap. These policies are listed in

Table 11. The VNR cautioned that the list of policies is "subject to further updates," (p. 47) so this table may not necessarily be complete.

Table 11: Policies Mentioned in Malaysia's VNR

SDC <sub>a</sub>		Dallaing			
SDGs	>	Policies  11MP Strategic Thrusts 1 & 3 & Game Changer "Uplifting B40 towards a middle-class society"			
SDG 1		National Poverty Data Bank keeps detailed information about poor households			
	•				
	•	BR1M Programme (RM 5 billion in 2015)			
	•	Universal education and skills training			
SDG 2	• >	Social safety nets			
SDG 2	>	11MP Strategic Thrusts 1, 2 and 6 National Plan of Action for Nutrition of Malaysia III 2016–2025 (NPANM III)			
	>	National Agrofood Policy (NAP)			
	•	National Agrofood Policy 2011–2020			
	•	National Commodity Policy 2011–2020			
	•	Rehabilitation Programme for Malnourished (1989)			
	•	Community Feeding Programme			
	•	Supplementary Feeding Programme for Pregnant and Lactating Mothers with poor weight gain			
		and anemia			
	•	Malaysia adopted a series of certification schemes of good agricultural practices, such as			
		Malaysia Good Agricultural Practices (myGAP), Malaysia Organic (myOrganic), and Malaysia			
		Sustainable Palm Oil (MSPO) certifications, among others, to ensure sustainable production and			
		keep fresh produce safe.			
	•	A good public healthcare system that also reached rural and remote areas			
SDG 3	>	11MP Strategic Thrust 2			
	>	National Strategic Plan for Non-Communicable Diseases 2010–2014			
	>	National Strategic Plan for Tobacco Control 2015–2020			
	>	National Strategic Plan for Communicable Diseases			
	>	National Strategic Plan Ending AIDS in Malaysia (NSPEA) 2016–2030			
	>	The National Plan of Action for Nutrition of Malaysia III 2016–2025 (NPANM III)			
	>	National Reproductive Health Education & Social Education (PEKERTI) Policy & Action Plan			
	>	Health Human Resource Master Plan			
	•	A universal healthcare system, from primary care to tertiary treatments, is available; basic			
CDC 4		healthcare reaches even remote settlements through "flying doctor" services.			
SDG 4	A A	11MP Strategic Thrust 3			
	>	Malaysian Education Blueprint 2013–2025 (MEB) Malaysia Education Blueprint (Higher Education) 2015–2025			
	>	National Higher Education Strategic Plan			
	۶	Blueprint on Enculturation of Lifelong Learning for Malaysia 2011–2020			
SDG 5	>	11MP Strategic Thrusts 1, 3, Game Changer "Uplifting B40 towards a middle-class society"			
2230	>	National Policy on Women 1989			
	>	Plan of Action for the Advancement of Women 2010–2015			
	•	Under the Federal Constitution, the supreme law of Malaysia, Article 8(2) was amended in 2001			
		to prohibit gender discrimination			
	•	Sexual Offences Against Children Act 2017			
	•	Various measures have been taken to encourage women to return to the workforce, including			
		career comeback programmes, grants for establishing childcare centres at workplaces,			
		increasing maternity leave and making flexible work arrangements.			
	•	Ongoing initiatives to increase women's representation on boards of directors in the private			
		sector include special programmes for women directors and a registry of women directors who			
an a	L.	have been groomed for board of director roles in publicly listed companies			
SDG 6	~	11MP Strategic Thrusts 1, 4 and 5			
CDC =	^	National Water Resource Policy (NWRP)			
SDG 7	^	11MP Strategic Thrusts 4 and 5			
	A	National Green Technology Policy and Action Plan 2009			
	A A	National Green Technology Policy 2009			
SDG 8	>	National Energy Efficiency Action Plan 2015  11MP Strategic Thrusts 3, 4 and 6 and Game Changers "Embarking on Green Growth" and			
ه صرد		"Unlocking the potential of productivity"			
	>	Occupational Safety and Health Master Plan 2016–2020			
	>	SME Master Plan 2012–2020			
	ı -				

	Malaysia Productivity Blueprint		
SDG 9	<ul> <li>Malaysia Productivity Blueprint</li> <li>11MP Strategic Thrusts 3, 4, 5 and 6 and Game Changers "Translating innovation to wealth"</li> </ul>		
5507	and "Embarking on Green Growth" (also under SDGs 12, 14, 15)		
	National Policy on Science, Technology and Innovation (NPSTI) 2013–2020		
	Strategic Information and Communications Technology (ICT) Roadmap		
	National eCommerce Strategic Roadmap		
	Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation Social Innovation Projects to promote		
	grassroots innovation benefiting local communities (2016). Social needs were met through		
	projects, services, capacity building in skills or innovative products by using existing sustainable		
	technology.		
	Grassroots innovation movements are actively promoted		
	Grassroots innovation movements are actively promoted     [Sustainable consumption and production initiatives]		
	Government Green Procurement (GGP)		
	SCP in Education		
	Recycling rate for solid waste		
	National Ecotourism Plan 2016-2025		
	National Transport Policy is being formulated.		
	Malaysian Carbon Reduction and Environmental Sustainability Tool (MyCREST)		
	Malaysia SCP Blueprint is being formulated.		
SDG 10	> 11MP Strategic Thrust 1		
	National Policy on Children and its Plan of Action		
	National Child Protection Policy and its Plan of Action		
	National Action Plan for Persons with Disabilities 2016–2020		
	Minimum Wage Policy		
SDG 11	> 11MP Strategic Thrusts 1, 2, 4 and 5 and Game Changer "Investing in competitive cities"		
	National Physical Plan 3 (NPP3)		
	National Urbanisation Policy 2 (NUP2)		
	Competitive Cities Master Plans		
	National Environmental Health Action Plan		
	National Housing Policy (DRN) 2013–2017 and DNR 2.0 2018–2022		
	Road Safety Plan of Malaysia 2014–2020		
GE S	National Solid Waste Management Policy		
SDG 12	> 11MP Strategic Thrusts 4 and 6 and Game Changer "Embarking on Green Growth"		
[	National Ecotourism Plan 2016–2025  National Policy for Riological Diversity 2016, 2025		
	National Policy for Biological Diversity 2016–2025  National Environmental Health Action Plan (NEHAP)		
	<ul> <li>National Environmental Health Action Plan (NEHAP)</li> <li>National Solid Waste Management Policy 2006</li> </ul>		
	<ul> <li>National Solid Waste Management Policy 2006</li> <li>Solid Waste and Public Cleansing Management Corporation Strategic Plan 2014–2020</li> </ul>		
	Department of National Solid Waste Management Strategic Plan 2016–2020		
	Construction Industry Transformation Programme (CITP) 2016–2020		
SDG 13	> 11MP Strategic Thrusts 2, 4 and 5		
.52 5 15	National Policy on Climate Change 2009		
	National Urbanisation Policy 2006–2020		
	National Physical Plan 3		
	National Green Technology Policy 2009		
SDG 14	> 11MP Strategic Thrust 4 and Game Changer "Embarking on Green Growth"		
	National Plan of Action for the Coral Triangle Initiative (NPOA-CTI) 2009		
i	National Policy for Biological Diversity 2016-2025		
	National Oil Spill Contingency Plan (NOSCP)		
	National Coastal Zone Physical Plan		
	National Ocean Policy 2011–2020		
	National Plan of Action to Prevent, Deter and Eliminate IUU Fishing		
	National Plan of Action for Management of Fishing Capacity in Malaysia 2014–2018		
	• As of 2016, Malaysia has established 63 marine protected areas covering 16,492.92 km <sup>2</sup> , or 3.36		
	per cent of the coastal and marine areas. Development in the protected areas is guided by their		
	own management plans.  A suggestial Management Planting Programma was initiated in 2005 to mitigate pollution coused		
i	A successful Mangrove Planting Programme was initiated in 2005 to mitigate pollution caused by solid waste disposed, and protect against tounamis and enrich coastel and marine hindiversity.		
<u> </u>	by solid waste disposal, and protect against tsunamis and enrich coastal and marine biodiversity.		

- An extensive network of marine monitoring stations has been established across the country to monitor marine water quality. Various programmes are being implemented to ensure sustainable fisheries and aquaculture activities in the country, including enforcing zoning regulations for fishing areas and promoting good aquaculture practices through certification schemes. Ecosystem Approach to Fisheries Management (EAFM) to improve income, livelihoods and food security in coastal communities through new sustainable coastal fisheries and poverty reduction initiatives by 2020. State governments have implemented 'No Plastic Bag' campaigns to reduce pollution. Good Agriculture Practice (MyGAP) certification to promote sustainable aquaculture practices with the introduction of a new standard Code of Practices for Seaweed Cultivation Good Aquaculture Practice (GAqP) – Aquaculture Farm General Guidelines **SDG 15** 11MP Strategic Thrust 4 and Game Changer "Embarking on Green Growth" National Policy for Biological Diversity 2016–2025 National Tiger Conservation Action Plans 2008–2020 Elephant Conservation Action Plans 2013–2022 National Forestry Policy 1992 National Action Plan on Peatlands 2011 Second National Mineral Policy 2009 Wildlife Conservation Act 2010 National Parks Act 1980 Biosafety Act 2007 Malaysia is drawing up a National Red Data List for threatened species and implementing innovative methods to pool resources to combat poaching, illegal wildlife trade and encroachment into protected areas. National Conservation Trust Fund for Natural Resources (NCTF) 1Malaysia Biodiversity Enforcement Operation Network (1MBEON) operating in Taman Negara since 2014 Tapir Conservation Action Plan is being formulated Central Forest Spine covers an area of 18,866 hectares of Permanent Forest Reserves in Peninsular Malaysia; Heart of Borneo covers 20 million hectares. Implementing sustainable forest management and the Malaysian Timber Certification Scheme 11MP Strategic Thrusts 1 & 2 & Ch. 9 on "Transforming public service for productivity" **SDG 16** National Policy on Children and its Plan of Action National Child Protection Policy and its Plan of Action ASEAN Regional Plan of Action on the Elimination of Violence Against Women and Children Plan of Action on Child Online Protection (PTCOP) [Recent approaches used to increase public participation in development] Lab Approach (lab sessions with participation from government, private sector, NGOs)
  - National Blue Ocean Strategy (NBOS) (to break down silos between organizations, unlocking underutilised resources, creatively deploying those resources to hotspots and allowing greater public participation in development. The strategy serves as the basis for the Malaysian National Development Strategy (MyNDS).
  - National Consultations using Open Space Technology (OST) Method (allows participants to determine the topics, schedules and length of group discussions in relation to the wider topic under discussion)

### **SDG 17** > 11MP Strategic Thrust 6

- Malaysia's foreign policies and trade policies
- ➤ AEC Blueprint 2025
- ➤ ASEAN Strategic Action Plan for SME Development 2016–2025

Note: Arrow bullets indicate policies identified by Malaysia's exercise to map existing policies with SDGs.

Round bullets indicate policies mentioned elsewhere in the VNR.

Source: (Government of Malaysia 2017)

**Budget:** Specific budget amounts were not mentioned in Malaysia's VNR. However, the VNR explained that "SDG programmes and projects are funded through existing Government budget and mechanisms" although "it is envisioned that funding and resources from the Government will be supplemented through collaboration with the private sector, NGOs, civil society and international agencies" (p. 44). The VNR included a long list of policies related to the SDGs, which were in turn closely linked with 11MP, including many overarching framework policies, so it is likely that a very significant part of the national budget is related to SDGs.

**Overall:** Malaysia's VNR indicated that it was making substantial efforts in terms of policies, implementation framework, and stakeholder involvement. It also highlighted significant achievements, concluding that "Malaysia is fast realising its vision of being a developed country by 2020" (p. 37). It did not specify specific budget amounts, but the total amount was probably a large part of Malaysia's national budget.

## 3.6 Myanmar

**Strategy:** Myanmar has not issued a VNR, but it has issued its "Myanmar Sustainable Development Plan (2018-2030) (MSDP) which has a similar form as VNRs (Government of the Union of Myanmar 2018). The MSDP is also linked to the SDGs. It notes that the government "is committed to the achievement of the SDGs with the objective of ensuring balance between development in the economic, social and environment spheres," so that "sustainability in all its forms shall be considered cross-cutting, to be mainstreamed into all aspects of MSDP implementation." It further states that "the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda will be used to guide Myanmar's achievement of the SDGs over that same timeline" (p. 3).

The MSDP's goal framework is different from SDGs, although it integrates the different dimensions of sustainable development. Three "pillars" are at the centre of the goal framework: 1) peace and stability, 2) prosperity and partnership, and 3) people and planet. The three pillars are further subdivided into 5 Goals as indicated in Table 12. Each Goal includes some "guiding documents" and "strategies," and the "strategies" are mapped to specific SDG targets.

**Policies:** The "guiding documents" for each Goal are major policies, plans and strategies. Small scale policies were not listed in the MSDP. There are several "strategies" under each goal, but these are basically broad policy objectives rather than actual policies. Similarly, each "strategy" has several "action plans" but these are also mostly policy objectives, which are more focused and concrete. In other words, the "strategies" and "action plans" mainly seem like plans to develop policies. There is a total of 34 policies ("guiding documents") listed under the 5 Goals, which are indicated in Table 12. Unfortunately, which policies are linked to which SDG targets cannot be determined; the SDG targets are linked to the "strategies," which are also not clearly linked with the "guiding documents."

**Budget**: Myanmar's MSDP did not include any specific budget figures, but it had a chapter on "implementation, coordination, prioritisation, and resource mobilisation." With respect to financing, there is only a general statement listing general sources of financing, including "domestic public finance," but also including domestic private finance, and international public and private finance. It also states that "as a first priority, the MSDP-IU [implementation unit] will develop a more complete MSDP financing strategy" (p. 63) (Government of the Union of Myanmar 2018).

Table 12: Policies Mentioned in Myanmar's Sustainable Development Plan (2018-2030)

Pillars	Goals	Policies	
1. Peace & Stability	1: Peace, National Reconciliation, Security & Good Governance  2: Economic Stability	<ul> <li>Myanmar Civil Service Reform Strategic Action Plan 2017-2020</li> <li>Myanmar National Drug Control Policy 2018</li> <li>Judicial Strategic Plan 2018-2022</li> <li>Rule of Law Strategic Plan 2015-2019</li> <li>Myanmar Union Election Commission Strategic Plan 2014-2018</li> <li>Internal Revenue Department Reform Journey: A Medium-</li> </ul>	
	& Strengthened Macroeconomic Management	Term Revenue Mobilisation Strategy 2017/18- 2021/22  • Myanmar Medium-Term Debt Management Strategy	
2. Prosperity & Partnership	3: Job Creation & Private Sector-Led Growth	<ul> <li>Myanmar Agriculture Development Strategy 2018/19-2022/23</li> <li>National Export Strategy 2015- 2019</li> <li>Myanmar Financial Inclusion Roadmap 2014- 2020</li> <li>Myanmar Industrial Policy 2016</li> <li>Private Sector Development Framework and Action Plan</li> <li>National Strategy for Rural Roads and Access 2016</li> <li>SME Policy 2015</li> <li>Myanmar National Transport Master Plan 2016</li> </ul>	
3: People & Planet	4: Human Resources & Social Development for a 21st Century Society	ment Strategic Plan for Reproductive Health 2014- 2018	
	5: Natural Resources & the Environment for Prosperity of the Nation	<ul> <li>Myanmar National Climate Change Policy 2017- 2030</li> <li>Myanmar National Action Plan on Disaster Risk Reduction 2017</li> <li>Myanmar Energy Master Plan 2015</li> <li>National Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan 2015- 20</li> <li>Myanmar Elephant Conservation Action Plan 2018- 27</li> <li>Marine Spatial Planning for Myanmar 2016</li> <li>Myanmar Plant Health System Strategy 2016- 2020</li> <li>Myanmar Tourism Master Plan 2013- 2020</li> <li>Myanmar Tourism Human Resource Development Strategy &amp; Action Plan 2017- 2020</li> <li>National Investment Plan for Rural Water Supply, Sanitation and Hygiene in Schools and WASH in Health Facilities 2016- 2030</li> <li>Green Economic Policy Framework</li> </ul>	

Source: (Government of the Union of Myanmar 2018)

# 3.7 Philippines

**Strategy:** The Philippines published its first VNR in 2016(Philippines 2016), and it published a second one for the 2019 HLPF. The first VNR focused mainly on overall national priorities, developing the institutional structure for SDGs, related stakeholder consultation processes, and issues relating to data and indicators (Philippines 2016). It did not discuss progress on individual SDGs, possibly because this was the first HLPF after the SDGs were adopted, and there might not have been enough time or resources. In contrast, the second VNR in 2019 did address progress on the specific SDGs highlighted at the HLPF that year, in addition to further discussion of the incorporation of SDGs into national frameworks and SDG monitoring (Philippines 2019). The VNR explained that "the country has employed a whole-of-government and whole-of-society approach to SDG implementation."

Moreover, with Executive Order No. 27s. 2017, the SDGs were "a basis for the Philippines' medium-term national development strategy. The PDP [Philippine Development Plan 2017-2022] serves as the implementation mechanism of the SDGs in the Philippines with the 17 goals integrated into the Plan. The country has taken an integrative approach in implementation, utilizing existing mechanisms and structures both at the national and local levels" (p. 10). The VNR mapped all SDGs with the PDP's priorities. In addition, the PDP was "accompanied by the Public Investment Program (PIP) 2017-2022 which contains a list of priority programs and projects, updated annually" (p. 13). SDGs were localized through Regional Development Plans (RDP).

Going beyond many countries, the Philippines will adopt numerical targets for the national SDG Tier 1 indicators. Final targets have already been set for 72 indicators for 12 SDGs, while 19 provisional targets have been set for indicators for 9 SDGs; there is some overlap among SDGs, but all are covered except SDG 12. In addition, 10 indicators have been identified for reporting only, and 55 indicators are being further reviewed.

**Policies:** The VNR listed current policies, actions, and important initiatives for the 6 SDGs highlighted by the 2019 HLPF, (including SDG 17). These are listed below in Table 13. The VNR dedicated a section to "policy mainstreaming" for each goal which lists most of the policies, but additional policies are also sometimes mentioned in other areas of the VNR, so all policies were not collected in one place. For each highlighted SDG, in addition to listing the main policies, the VNR also presented progress on the indicators, discussed gaps in achievement, and identified best practices as well as some ways to improve.

Table 13: Policies Mentioned in the Philippines' VNR

SDGs	Policies
SDG 4	• For quality education, the legal framework for institutionalizing the Alternative Learning
	System has been set.
	Indigenous Peoples' Rights Act of 1997
	Enhanced Basic Education Act of 2013
	Universal Access to Quality Tertiary Education, by virtue of RA 10931
	• TESDA Online Program and massive open online courses (MOOCs), through the Open
	Distance Learning Act
	DepEd school feeding program
	• Various government assistance, subsidies, including the Pantawid Pamilyang Pilipino Program
	(4Ps) or Conditional Cash Transfer.
	Philippine Professional Standards for Teachers (2016)

- In 2018, over 75,000 new teaching positions were created nationwide, with over 40,000 in kindergarten/elementary, 34,000 in junior high school, 356 in senior high school.
- "Adopt-A-School Program" gives tax incentives for donations from the private sector
- The annual Brigada Eskwela brings together nationwide voluntary efforts to prepare public school facilities for the opening of the school year.
- "K to 12 Plus Project" was launched by the Philippine Chamber of Commerce and Industry in partnership with the German Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development and the Philippine government (DepEd and TESDA). The project helps to implement and refine the new Senior High School technical-vocational-livelihood track.
- "Teach for the Philippines" partners with the government in addressing the uneven distribution of teachers across the country. It recruits and trains promising young leaders, to teach for two years in public schools, particularly in areas that lack teachers.

- "National Spatial Strategy" identifies geographic development challenges & opportunities. Its 3 core strategies are regional agglomeration, connectivity, and vulnerability reduction.
- Green Jobs Act (2016) fosters a competitive, low-carbon, and environmentally sustainable economy, through the promotion of green jobs.
- National Green Jobs Human Resource Development Plan lays down strategies to support the development of green skills.
- Philippine Sustainable Consumption and Production (SCP) Action Plan under preparation. (This is under SDG 12 but reported under SDG 8 this year.)
- Go Negosyo Act aims to establish Negosyo Centres in all provinces, cities, and municipalities, to provide venues for collaboration among and technology transfer to small and medium enterprises.
- Ease of Doing Business and Efficient Government Service Delivery Act of 2018 simplifies requirements & procedures to expedite transactions with government.
- Tourism Act of 2009 promotes sustainable tourism.
- National Tourism Development Plan 2016-2022 and National Ecotourism Strategy and Action Plan 2013-2022 aim to develop a globally competitive, environmentally sustainable, and socially responsible tourism industry.
- Wage Rationalization Act sets a mandatory minimum wage per region.
- Two-tiered wage system (TTWS) (2012) minimizes the unintended outcomes of the mandated minimum wages and to further improve coverage among the vulnerable sectors.
- First Time Job Seekers Assistance Act supports first time job seekers, especially youth, by waiving the government fees for many government documents.
- Expanded Maternity Leave (RA 11261) (2019) allows female workers to enjoy 105 days (from 60 to 78 days) of maternity leave in both the public and private sectors, with an option to extend to additional 30 days without pay. Solo working mothers are given additional 15-day paid leaves.
- Act Strengthening the Prohibition on Discrimination Against Women prohibits any employer from discriminating against female employees.
- Magna Carta of Women spells out every woman's right to protection from violence and disaster, participation and representation, equal treatment before the law, equal access to services, non-discrimination, comprehensive health services and information, and social protection, etc. (Also under SDG 10.)
- Telecommuting Act (RA 11165) allows private sector employees to work from an alternative workplace. Also helps encourage female labour force participation.
- Basic Deposit Account Scheme issued by the Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas in 2018 meets the
  needs of the unbanked as it will allow them to save without the burden of extensive
  documentary requirements and minimum deposit and maintaining balance.
- AlkanSSSya (introduced by the Social Security System) is a large metal safety deposit box with secure individual compartments where members can put their savings to pay for their monthly social security contributions.
- KaltaSSS-Collect (introduced by the Social Security System) allows national government
  agencies and the local government units (LGUs) to register their job order and contractual
  workers as self-employed members and remit their contributions and loan payments through
  automated salary deduction scheme.
- The Securities and Exchange Commission will also require Sustainability Reports for Publicly Listed Companies, beginning 2020.

- Private businesses, such as cosmetics manufacturer Human Nature, are adopting inclusive business models, such as a value chain that deliberately involves disadvantaged communities.
- The Mentor Me program of the Department of Trade and Industry further promotes mentoring and partnership between small and large enterprises.
- Alternative Learning System (also listed under SDG 4)
- Universal Access to Quality Tertiary Education Act of 2017 (also listed under SDG 4)

- Magna Carta on Women (RA 9710)
- Indigenous Peoples' Rights Act
- Expanded Senior Citizens Act
- Child and Youth Welfare Code
- Pantawid Pamilyang Pilipino Program (4Ps) seeks to improve human capital outcomes related to health and education.
- Magna Carta for Persons with Disability reserves employment for persons with disability.
- Social Protection Operational Framework
- Conditional Cash Transfer provides targeted interventions to disadvantaged families.
- Assistance to Disadvantaged Municipalities provides a support fund for poorer local governments to build access roads, water systems, and reproductive health services, etc.
- Composed of representatives from CSOs & government agencies, governmental bodies such as the Philippine Commission on Women, the National Commission on Indigenous Peoples, the Council for the Welfare of Children, and the National Council on Disability Affairs were established to ensure that sector-specific issues are considered. These Commissions and Councils formulate plans and policies for their respective sectors and raise sectoral concerns during development planning and programming committees and forums.
- National Anti-Poverty Commission (NAPC), chaired by the President, oversees the implementation of the Social Reform Agenda.
- Many LGUs have established local offices for senior citizens and persons with disability, among other sectors. These offices help ensure that their sectoral concerns are considered in local development planning, programming and budgeting.
- Responsible Parenthood and Reproductive Health (RPRH) Act (2012)
- The National Council on Disability Affairs (NCDA) has been utilizing opportunities presented by developments in ICT to spur the economic productivity of persons with disability.
- Integrated Livelihood Program of the Department of Labor and Employment provides the following support services: working capital for the purchase of raw materials, equipment, and tools; training on setting-up and operating livelihood undertaking; enrolment in Group Personal Accident Insurance of the Government Service Insurance System; and continuing technical and business advisory services to beneficiaries. Persons with disabilities have also been beneficiaries of livelihood grants and capacity building services.
- Local Government Support Fund Assistance to Municipalities (LGSF-AM) addresses policy and governance gaps in the implementation of local programs and projects through the harmonization with the existing systems of local governments.

- Climate Change Act of 2009 established the Climate Change Commission (CCC) and directed the formulation of national and local climate change actions plans
- National Disaster Risk Reduction and Management Act of 2010 provides for the overarching country policy for DRRM, and established the national and local DRRM funds
- People's Survival Fund Act of 2013 established a special fund of at least PHP2 billion (US\$45 million) from the 2013 to 2015 annual national budget to augment financial support for local adaptation projects.
- Sectoral & framework plans have also been updated to incorporate climate change and disaster risk parameters such as the Agriculture and Fisheries Modernization Plan, Philippine Energy Plan, Environment and Natural Resources Framework Plan, and river basin master plans.
- At the local level, Comprehensive Land Use Plans and Comprehensive Development Plans are also made climate and disaster risk-informed.
- The Cabinet Cluster on Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation (CCAM), and DRR was created in 2011 and strengthened in 2017 to lead the effective coordination, harmonization, and complementation of policies and programs on climate risk management, DRR, and sustainable development.

- The National Climate Risk Management Framework has also recently issued CCC Resolution 2019-001 to harmonize and integrate efforts of sectors and stakeholders in addressing the intensifying impacts of climate change.
- Energy Efficiency and Conservation Act of 2019
- Green Building Code of 2016
- GHG Inventory Management and Reporting System (2014)
- National Integrated Climate Change Database and Information Exchange System
- Green Jobs Act of 2016 (Also mentioned under SDG 8.)
- Securities and Exchange Commission Memorandum Circular No.4 s. 2019 that provides the Sustainability Reporting guidelines (Also mentioned under SDG 8.)
- The government is also working on the completion of high-resolution multi-hazard and risk maps that will be more useful for LGUs and communities in planning and preparing for disasters, including slow onset events.
- A National Color-Coded Agriculture Guide Map, which contains projected rainfall and temperature information, was launched in 2017 to better guide farmers in crop planning.
- Project NOAH exemplifies the partnership between the academe and government in providing timely weather information for disaster preparedness.
- Climate Budget Tagging System to track and monitor climate change-related expenditures of the national and local governments (2015)
- Risk Resiliency Program, which focuses on priority climate-vulnerable provinces
- Community-based Early Warning System (CBEWS) has been successfully replicated in several areas of the country.
- Green, Green program, funded under the Local Government Support Fund Assistance to Cities, to promote the development of public open spaces and create greener, and more sustainable cities.
- Public Utility Vehicle Modernization Program
- National Ecolabelling Program
- Government Energy Management Program
- Green Public Procurement
- Waste management programs such as rehabilitation of Manila Bay and other waterways in Metro Manila, and issuance of local policies related to single-use plastics.
- A Sustainable Consumption and Production Action Plan is now being formulated to provide a coherent framework for climate action. (Also listed under SDG 8)

- Participatory Governance Cluster, which aims to enhance citizen participation in governmental processes.
- Inter-Agency Committee on Good Governance (IAC-GG) facilitates coordination among government agencies.
- Philippine Open Government Partnership (OGP) National Action Plan to make the government more transparent, accountable, and responsive.
- National ID System promotes inclusion while ensuring security and privacy.
- Philippine Identification System Act streamlines private and public transactions and strengthen financial inclusion by establishing a single, valid government-issued identification document for Filipinos and resident aliens.
- The Ease of Doing Business and Efficient Government Service Delivery Act enforces shorter and simpler transaction periods in government agencies by reducing the processing time, number of signatories, and requirements, etc.
- A law on Freedom of Information is under consideration.
- Ratification of the Bangsamoro Organic Law, to address a conflict in the country's south.
- National Task Force to End Local Communist Armed Conflict (2018) institutionalizes a wholeof-nation approach in prioritizing and harmonizing the delivery of services and social development assistance to conflict-affected and conflict-vulnerable areas.

- SDG implementation is still mostly financed from domestic resources.
- Tax Reform for Accelerated Inclusion (TRAIN) (2017) provides higher revenue for the government, but also discourages bad health habits. It also provides an unconditional cash transfer program. The poorest 10 million households received cash transfer amounting to PHP 2,400 per household in 2018, and each will receive PHP3,600 in 2019 and 2020.
- Restriction on foreign ownership of financial companies were lifted (2016)

- Foreign Investment Negative List (FINL) was reduced in 2018 in 5 areas: internet businesses, investment houses, teaching at higher education, training centres engaged in short-term highlevel skills, and wellness centres.
- Three proposals pending in Congress Amendments to the Foreign Investment Act, Public Service Act, and the Retail Trade Liberalization Act are also expected to create a more favourable investment climate.

Source: (Philippines 2019)

**Budget**: The Philippines' VNR did not include any specific budget figures, although it indicated in general that "SDG implementation is still mostly financed from domestic resources." Therefore, a substantial part of the national budget could be linked to spending related to SDGs. The VNR reported a large number of major policies which relate to the 6 reported SDGs, so their budgets, at least to some extent, should be considered as SDG-related spending. The VNR does not mention any plan to specifically map the budget to the SDGs. Instead, it explained that a Sub-Committee on the SDGs will be established under the Development Budget Coordinating Committee (DBCC), chaired by NEDA, with the Department of Budget and Management (DBM) as the co-chair. This arrangement was expected to "provide a platform to link planning and budgeting to ensure that SDG-supportive programs and projects are adequately funded" (p. 47). The VNR showed that the Philippines hoped to attract more foreign assistance and cooperation to support SDG implementation rather than relying mainly on domestic resources.

**Overall:** Overall the Philippines appeared to be making a substantial effort to implement SDGs. It has many laws and policies addressing the 6 highlighted SDGs, and it may have a similar number of policies addressing the others. The VNR did not mention any specific budget allocations, but it may be assumed that many or most of the listed policies had existing budget lines. The VNR highlighted progress, but it also raised some challenges and discussed areas where the government has plans to improve.

# 3.8 Singapore

**Strategies:** Singapore presented its first VNR, which addressed all the SDGs, at the 2018 HLPF (Government of Singapore 2018). "Sustainable development has underpinned Singapore's policymaking since our independence" was the opening statement of the country's VNR, which also explained that policies are implemented in an integrated manner using a Whole of Government (WOG) approach (p. 3). Singapore has established an Inter-Ministry Committee on SDGs for the VNR and to review long term implementation of SDGs. Singapore's VNR covered all 17 SDGs, and it included discussion of challenges and opportunities as well as achievements. Many policies were listed, and in many cases, they were linked with specific achievements.

**Policies:** A significant number of policies were mentioned for each SDG as shown in Table 14. In many cases, the discussion of each SDG included policies on a range of areas, although they were not linked to specific targets. Generally, there was a mix of broad framework policies and strategies as well as more focused and smaller-scale policies listed under each SDG. The dates were indicated for many though not all policies; some policies began before the SDGs were adopted while others began at about the same time or later. Some SDG targets which Singapore had already achieved in the past were not necessarily a high priority, so in these cases, the VNR discussed the historical policies which contributed to these past achievements.

Table 14: Policies Mentioned in Singapore's VNR

SDGs	Policies
SDG 1	Retirement Adequacy
	<ul> <li>The Central Provident Fund (CPF) and Silver Support Scheme (created 1955), is the bedrock of Singapore's social security system, provides retirement, healthcare, housing.</li> <li>The Silver Support Scheme helps the bottom 20% of Singaporeans aged 65 and above who had</li> </ul>
	low incomes and little family support, with quarterly cash pay-outs to supplement retirement income.
	Employment Assistance
	• Workfare and Progressive Wage Model. Examples: Workfare Income Supplement (WIS)1 scheme tops up the CPF savings and wages of older low-wage workers in their working years. The Workfare Training Support (WTS)2 scheme encourages skills upgrading, and the Progressive Wage Model helps to increase wages of workers in the cleaning, security, and landscaping sectors by upgrading skills & improving productivity.
	Subsidized public housing.
	• Public housing is kept affordable through subsidies, the accessibility of individuals' CPF savings for the down payment and monthly mortgage payments, and a range of other housing grants and schemes for individuals or families in need.
	Affordable healthcare
	• Multi-tiered approach including extensive subsidies in public healthcare institutions, Medisave, and MediShield Life. Pioneer Generation Package.
	Access to quality education
	Major investments in preschools & school systems. Financial assistance and subsidies to lower income people.
	Social Safety Nets
	• Social safety nets provide targeted assistance to individuals in need, such as financial assistance for basic living expenses, and support for housing and healthcare needs.
	4 ComCare schemes help low-income Singaporeans to meet basic needs: Short-to-Medium-Term Assistance (SMTA), Long-Term Assistance (LTA), ComCare Interim Assistance, and Student Care Fee Assistance. Individuals are also linked with other services, such as Family Service Centres (FSCs), Medical Social Workers at Public Healthcare Institutions, Senior Activity Centres, etc. for further support as needed.*

- Medifund assists low-income patients who cannot pay their medical bills, even after receiving subsidies and drawing on other means of payments. Medifund Silver & Medifund Junior provide more targeted assistance for low-income elderly and the young.
- Public Rental Scheme -- Those who are unable to afford their own homes can apply for public rental flats. Rental costs are heavily subsidised and highly affordable. The Fresh Start Housing Scheme to help families with young children living in public rental flats to afford their own homes was introduced in 2016.

### Support for people with low incomes

- To strengthen service delivery and make social assistance more accessible, a network of 24 Social Service Offices (SSOs) were rolled out across the island.
- Many ground-up initiatives and community groups support the vulnerable. The government will continue to engage and partner with them. Volunteers and partners are mobilized through the "SG Cares" movement.
- Singapore will continue to invest heavily in education, including preschool education, expecting to spend S\$1.7 billion a year on early childhood education by 2022.
- The KidSTART pilot will strengthen the support ecosystem for children from low-income and vulnerable families through, and SkillsFuture will support people's growth.
- Support for low-income and vulnerable seniors has increased. A Community Network to support Seniors is being rolled out to strengthen coordination and collaboration between government agencies and community-based stakeholders.

### SDG 2

- Import Source Diversification -- Agri-Food and Veterinary Authority (AVA) conducts sourcing missions with industry to other countries to build networks with potential suppliers and accredit new sources.
- Optimising Local Food Production -- launched the "Farm Transformation Map" to spur sector transformation and worked with local producers to use smart technologies and innovations to optimise the use of space and improve productivity. This allows producers to grow more with less by reducing labour needs and better mitigating environmental risks.
- Agriculture Productivity Fund (APF) (S\$63 mil.) encourages farmers to invest in productive technologies and transform the agriculture sector, provides technical assistance and training to farmers, and conducts R&D with farms and research institutes.
- Rice Stockpile Scheme (RSS) requires rice importers to hold a two-month stockpile in government warehouses.
- Holistic food waste management strategy. A publicity & outreach programme "Love Your Food – Waste Less. Save More" encourages consumers to make smart and prudent choices in food purchase, preparation, and storage habits. Government works with local community organisations, grassroots leaders, and stakeholders on ground-up initiatives.
- AVA and the National Environment Agency (NEA), with industry stakeholders, developed food waste minimisation guidebooks for food retail establishments, supermarkets, and food manufacturing establishments.
- ComCare programme assists low-income households to meet their basic needs. This includes a monthly cash amount to cover food expenses.\*

#### SDG 3

## Accessible and improved healthcare

- Universal healthcare coverage to all Singaporeans in the form of the "3M" system Medisave, Medishield, and Medifund. Beyond the "3M" system, subsidies are available to keep costs down and ensure that basic services remain affordable.
- Medisave is a national medical savings scheme which helps individuals save some income for future medical fees.
- Medishield is a basic health insurance plan which helps to fund large hospital bills and selected costly outpatient treatments.
- Medifund is an endowment fund to help those with financial difficulties pay medical bills.
- There is tight regulatory supervision and control over all healthcare providers to ensure a high quality of healthcare services.
- Access to sexual and reproductive health services for women has improved. Screening for
  breast and cervical cancers, some of the most common cancers among Singaporean women, at
  all governmental clinics is heavily subsidised. A Women's Health Advisory Committee was
  also set up in 2012 to equip women with health knowledge and skills.
- Agency for Integrated Care (AIC) helps seniors access eldercare services and works with the eldercare sector to expand and improve services. AIC also conducts outreach to promote active ageing, and encourages community partners to befriend and care for vulnerable seniors

• Several funds support the elderly, such as the Seniors' Mobility and Enabling Fund, which subsidises assistive devices and home care consumables, and the eldercare sector.

#### Control of communicable diseases

- National Childhood Immunisation Schedule (NCIS), National Adult Immunisation Schedule (NAIS)
- Singapore-Field Epidemiology Training Programme (S-FETP) was set up within the Ministry of Health (MOH) to develop capability in conducting epidemiological surveillance, investigation, and response to outbreaks and public health emergencies.
- In 2016, the Healthcare Epidemiology Team was established within MOH to strengthen the national response to outbreaks of hospital-acquired infections, including Multi Drug Resistant Organisms (MDROs).

#### Control of non-communicable diseases

- An extensive suite of measures combats some of the most common non-communicable diseases in Singapore, such as diabetes and cardiovascular diseases. Also, several campaigns encouraged lifestyle changes (increased physical activity, healthier eating).
- Multi-pronged approach towards tobacco control, comprising strategies such as public
  education, provision of smoking cessation services, legislation controlling tobacco advertising
  and sales of cigarettes to minors, and taxation.
- Nationwide "War on Diabetes" launched in 2016 by MOH to help people avoid diabetes, and to assist those with diabetes to manage it. Related initiatives encourage healthy living & prevention, early detection & intervention, and better disease management. Public education, stakeholder engagement, and data analytics are also emphasized.

### **SDG 4** Quality, Affordable, and Accessible Education for All

- The Compulsory Education Act (since 2003), ensures that all Singapore Citizen children above 6 years old must be enrolled in national primary schools up to Primary Six.
- The six-year primary school education is heavily subsidised.
- Secondary school fees are heavily subsidised, and financial and bursary schemes are available to those who require additional support.

#### Early Childhood Development

• Preschool education quality was enhanced by several schemes including Ministry of Education (MOE) Kindergartens and the Nurturing Early Learners (NEL) Curriculum.

## Maximizing the Potential of Students with Special Needs

- Specialised curricula were introduced in the 20 Government-funded Special Education (SPED) schools run by Voluntary Welfare Organisations in close consultation with MOE.
- The Curriculum Framework for SPED schools, "Living, Learning, Working in the 21st Century," was introduced in 2012 to provide SPED schools with a common direction for designing and delivering a quality holistic education to meet the needs of these students.
- A Framework for Vocational Education in SPED Schools launched in 2010.

### Lifelong Learning

• SkillsFuture (established 2014): national movement to promote industry support for skill acquisition necessary for career progress and foster a culture of lifelong learning.

### Education for Sustainable Development

• Character and Citizenship Education (CCE) aims to inculcate values in children to become civic-minded and responsible individuals and citizens. CCE learning outcomes are also aligned with SDGs.

### Broadening Our Definition of Success

- Programme for Active Learning in primary schools, and increased emphasis on non-academic subjects such as Physical Education, Arts, and Music.
- MOE is also broadening the scoring system for the Primary School Leaving Examination.

#### SDG 5

• Article 12 (1) of the Constitution specifically provides that, "All persons are equal before the law and entitled to the equal protection of the law."

### End Discrimination Against Women and Girls

• An Inter-Ministry Committee (IMC) on CEDAW (United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women) was created to implement and monitor policies and initiatives to address women's needs. The IMC is supported by the Office for Women's Development (OWD) in the Ministry of Social and Family Development (MSF). The Office is also the national focal point for women's matters.

### Eliminate Violence Against Women and Girls

- Violence against women is addressed through: (i) a robust legislative framework; (ii) a multistakeholder approach; (iii) training & professional competency; and (iv) public education. Government agencies also work closely with NGOs and the community to foster a violence-free environment, especially to raise awareness against family violence.
- Hotline "Break the Silence Against Family Violence" campaign in 2016.

Promote Shared Responsibility Within the Household and the Family

- Introduced leave provisions for fathers, which have been enhanced over the years. For example, in 2017, legislation was amended to extend paid Paternity Leave to two weeks and increased Shared Parental Leave to four weeks (from one week previously).
- Childcare & infant care leave provisions extended equally to working fathers & mothers.
- Improved the quality, accessibility and affordability of pre-school services.
- All parents receive childcare and infant care subsidies.
- Introduced new Tripartite Standard in March 2018, to encourage employers to provide additional unpaid leave for employees with dependents who have unexpected care needs (e.g. pre-term births), regardless of their employees' gender.
- To help workers balance their career and familial commitments, companies are encouraged to offer and support flexible work arrangements, such as through the WorkPro Work-Life Grant to defray employers' costs of offering worklife benefits to employees.
- In 2014, the Tripartite Committee on Work-Life Strategy launched an Advisory on the implementation of flexible work arrangements. The tripartite partners also launched a Tripartite Standard on Flexible Work Arrangements in 2017 to further improve the adoption of such arrangements.

#### Women in Leadership

- The Women's Register was established by the Singapore Council of Women's Organisations (SCWO), to assist women who would like to volunteer their services.
- BoardAgender, an initiative of SCWO launched in 2011 with MSF's support, facilitates greater awareness of the benefits of gender-balanced business, and encourages and enables women to contribute their expertise in the boardroom and through committees.

#### Women's Health

- Singapore has also introduced more benefits for pregnant women and enhanced subsidies for women undergoing assisted reproduction technology treatments.
- MOH widely disseminates materials on various healthcare topics for mothers & children.

#### Women's Access to Economic Resources

• The Administration of Muslim Law Act (AMLA) was amended in 2017 to allow the court to permit women beneficiaries to be sole administrators of a deceased man's estate.

Policies & Legislation to Promote Gender Equality & Empowerment of Women & Girls

- Women's Health Advisory Committee was set up in 2012 to promote the health and well-being of women. The Committee was revamped in 2016 as the Women's Health Committee and focuses on key health issues among women in Singapore.
- Specific legislation protects the rights of women, including the Women's Charter, Penal Code, Children and Young Persons Act, and the Protection from Harassment Act.

### Support in Old Age

- Initiatives such as the Retirement and Re-employment Act enable seniors (who are willing and able) to continue working beyond retirement to boost their retirement savings.
- Singapore also has schemes such as the Silver Support Scheme and Pioneer Generation Package to further enhance financial assistance for older or retired women.

## SDG 6 Efficient Water Use

- Singapore provided funding to companies to implement water efficiency initiatives, such as consultations for solutions, and water stewardship.
- Several programmes promote higher private sector water efficiency (e.g. Mandatory Water Efficiency Management Plan, Water Efficiency Awards, Water Efficiency Fund).
- Mandatory measures requiring efficient water use by households and industries include maximum allowable flow rates for taps & mixers, and maximum allowable flushing capacities for flushing cisterns and urinal flush valves.
- Under the Water Efficiency Labelling Scheme, water efficiency labels are also required for water fittings and appliances.
- NEWater and desalinated water. Key pillars in water sustainability.
- Fish Activity Monitoring System (FAMS) quickly detects water contaminants.

Engaging Communities on the Value of Water and Sanitation

- Active, Beautiful, Clean Waters (ABC Waters) Programme (from 2006) to transform utilitarian drains and canals into attractive waterways, bring Singaporeans closer to water, and improve runoff quality using green cleansing features. Over 100 potential locations identified for implementation by 2030, and 36 sites were completed as of Jan. 2018.
- Individuals and organisations also contribute towards water-related activities and outreach under the Friends of Water Programme.
- Public awareness programs on water conservation target different community segments. Infrastructure Planning and Innovation
- Smart Water Grid, a network of wireless sensors installed in potable water supply mains across Singapore, functions as a real-time platform to monitor water pressure, flow and quality. The system provides decision support tools for network management.
- Deep Tunnel Sewerage System (DTSS), a wastewater superhighway of the future, is a network of linked sewers leading to 2 major tunnels.

- VNR discussed historical policies which achieved universal coverage of electricity & gas.
- Today, the Energy Market Authority (EMA) has put in place regulatory measures to further strengthen the reliability of Singapore's electricity supply.
- EMA also conducts regular reviews with industry players to enhance the emergency preparedness of the power sector.
- Addition of fourth storage tank in 2018 to the LNG terminal.
- Since 2001, the electricity generation and retail markets were opened to commercial players. A regulatory framework was established and introduced a wholesale electricity market with spot bidding every 30 minutes.
- Competition in the liberalised power generation sector has spurred power generation companies to switch from steam plants powered with fuel oil to more efficient Combined Cycle Gas Turbines (CCGTs) fuelled by natural gas.
- Recently the Energy Conservation Act was enhanced to strengthen energy efficiency practices among companies, and there are plans to implement Minimum Energy Performance Standards (MEPS) for common industrial equipment.
- The Government also provides grants and support to help companies perform energy audits, enhance energy efficiency and reduce emissions.
- Singapore will implement a carbon tax across all sectors without exemption from 2019. (Also under SDG 13.)
- o (The VNR noted that Solar PV has expanded but mentioned no specific policies.)
- o Utility-scale Energy Storage System (ESS) Two consortiums were appointed in Oct. 2017 to implement Singapore's first system.

## SDG 8

- Discussed historical policies related to economic development.
- Committee on the Future Economy (CFE) (established 2015) develops economic strategies, focusing on 5 areas: (i) future growth industries & markets; (ii) corporate capabilities & innovation; (iii) jobs & skills; (iv) urban dev. & infra.; (v) connectivity.
- "Adapt and Grow" initiative (Ministry of Manpower, 2016) helps people affected by economic slowdown & restructuring adapt to the labour market, supporting both employers and jobseekers.
- Singapore Tourism Board (STB) developed a Skills Framework (SF) in partnership with employers, training providers, industry associations and unions. The SF provides up-to-date information on employment, career pathways, job roles, existing and emerging skills and competencies, as well as relevant education and training programmes.
- STB provides various grants & schemes to support industry in workforce development.
- STB also partners industry and community stakeholders.

#### SDG 9

## Sustainable Industrialisation Supported by Innovation

- Public investment in R&D has increased nearly ten-fold from S\$2 billion under the 1991 five-year National Technology Plan to S\$19 billion under the Research, Innovation and Enterprise 2020 (RIE2020) Plan which spans 2016 to 2020.
- Agency for Science, Technology and Research (A\*STAR) consists of 23 Research Institutes and Centres to develop innovative technology to further economic growth and improve lives. Today, A\*STAR continues to bridge the gap between academia and industry through R&D, working with partners.
- Singapore's Future of Manufacturing (FoM) initiative aims to drive the adoption of advanced manufacturing technologies through public-private partnerships. One key programme is the

Model Factories, which allows the ecosystem of research performers, end users, technology providers and system integrators to jointly innovate, test and demonstrate FoM technologies. Infrastructure Building

- Singapore is making major investments to expand the airport and seaport, constructing a next generation mega container port, doubling current container handling capacity.
- Singapore has an extensive public transport network, with a well-connected rail network. By 2030, the rail network will expand from 230 kilometres today to 360 kilometres.
- Infocomm Media 2025 Plan will improve access to info-communications technologies.
- A fourth telecommunications provider was introduced through a New Entrant Spectrum Auction, and mobile virtual network operators were allowed to provide services.

Foster an Inclusive Environment For Small- And Medium-Sized Enterprises

- Enterprise Singapore (ESG), an economic agency offers a broad range of support, financing schemes & other programmes to SMEs to help them grow & internationalize.
- Centres of Innovation (COIs) have also been set up to assist SMEs with their technology and innovation ambitions.
- Start-ups are supported through various schemes such as the Start-up SG Founder and Start-up SG Tech schemes, which provide support to companies in their nascent stages.

## **SDG 10** Leaving No One Behind

• The Ethnic Integration Policy for public housing helped avoid large ethnic concentrations in particular neighbourhoods. Therefore, Singapore has no slums or ghettoes as neighbourhoods are designed with a mix of public & private housing for all income levels.

Reducing Inequalities and Ensuring Social Mobility

- Workfare Income Supplement (WIS) scheme supplements the wages of older low-wage workers in their working years and tops up their Central Provident Fund (CPF) savings.
- For workers in sectors that may require more help, the Progressive Wage Model (PWM) helps to increase wages of workers through upgrading skills and improving productivity.
- Increased the provision of quality and affordable preschool education, to ensure a good start for all children. Singapore is investing significantly in the early childhood sector and piloting a new early intervention programme for children in low-income and vulnerable families called KidSTART.
- To help students who need a conducive after-school care environment, Singapore will expand the number of school-based Student Care Centres (SCCs) and places.

#### Robust Social Security System

- Singapore's social security system comprises the four pillars of home ownership, healthcare assurance, retirement adequacy through the CPF system, and WIS and Silver Support schemes which are tax-financed transfers. In this regard, Singapore has increased its social spending in recent years in order to ensure that more Singaporeans can benefit.
- Lower- to middle-income Singaporeans are eligible for higher subsidies for subsidised treatment at public hospital specialist outpatient clinics (SOCs), and higher medication subsidies at subsidised SOCs and polyclinics. They can also apply for the Community Health Assist Scheme (CHAS), and receive subsidies for treatment at participating general practitioner (GP) and dental clinics.
- For Medishield Life coverage, Singapore has introduced structural premium subsides for lowerto middle-income Singaporeans, as well as Additional Premium Support for those who are unable to afford their premiums even after subsidies.
- ComCare financially assists low-income individuals and families to meet their basic needs, while helping families to improve their situation and regain self-reliance.
- Policies such as Workfare are also designed to encourage people to stay in the workforce and to keep building on their skills.

Empowering and Promoting the Social, Economic, and Political Inclusion of All

- To ensure that the minority ethnic groups in Singapore will always have a voice and be represented in Parliament, Group Representation Constituencies (GRCs) were established. GRCs are larger electoral divisions represented by between 3 and 6 Members of Parliament (MPs), of which at least one MP must belong to a minority ethnic group.
- Singapore also introduced the Nominated Member of Parliament (NMP) scheme to promote political inclusion of all Singaporeans, including those who may be potentially disadvantaged and marginalised.
- Third Enabling Masterplan (2017 2021) aims to improve the quality of life of persons with disabilities, support their caregivers, and build a more caring & inclusive community.

• The WorkPro scheme helps employers implement flexible work arrangements and age-friendly workplaces.

#### **SDG 11**

#### Integrated Land Use Planning

- Urban Redevelopment Authority (URA)'s Concept Plan is a long-term strategic land use and transportation plan that outlines broad strategies to guide development for the next 40 to 50 years. These broad long-term strategies are translated into the more detailed Master Plan, which lays out upcoming plans and developments in the next ten to 15 years.
- Over 80% of Singapore's resident population live in public housing built by the Housing and Development Board (HDB). Over 90 percent of these households own their flats. Public housing is heavily subsidised to ensure high affordability, and there is a progressive system of housing grants and subsidised purchase prices for new HDB flats.

#### **Building Safety**

- The Building and Construction Authority (BCA) champions a strong culture of safety awareness and regulation in the built environment sector. Through regular reviews, BCA upholds high safety standards while ensuring that the regulatory regime remains relevant even as projects grow in size and engineering complexity.
- The Building Control Act and Regulations regulate building design & construction. This includes a rigorous system of checks and controls throughout the entire building lifecycle of design, construction, commissioning the building before occupation, and maintenance.
- Under the Periodic Structural Inspection regime, regular inspections must be conducted on completed buildings by professional engineers to inspect and assess the building condition and recommend rectification measures if necessary.
- BCA regulates lifts and escalators. Owners must obtain a permit from BCA for each lift and escalator, carry out monthly maintenance, and test them annually. Lifts & escalators must be maintained according to manufacturers' recommendations & relevant standards.

### Transit-oriented Development and Planning

- The Land Transport Master Plan Land guides transport strategies and measures, with the long-term goal to make public transport the choice mode of transport through improved connectivity and better services. The Plan is reviewed every 5 years. Active mobility in terms of walking, cycling, and the use of personal mobility devices is promoted. Singapore aims for a mobility paradigm that is not centred on private transport.
- Singapore aims for 75% of morning and evening peak journeys to be made using public transport by 2030, and at least 85% by 2050. To achieve this, Singapore's rail network will be expanded from 230 kilometres today to 360 kilometres by 2030.
- In addition, Singapore will extend bus networks and enhance their service levels. The Bus Service Enhancement Programme, introduced in 2012, provides commuters with better connectivity, more comfortable journeys, and shorter waiting times. Between 2012 and 2017, 1,000 Government-funded buses were added, and 80 new bus services rolled out.
- "Walk Cycle Ride SG" is a vision to make walking, cycling, and riding public transport a way of life. To help realise this vision a Walking and Cycling Plan (WCP) for developments with high pedestrian and cyclist traffic was introduced. The WCP requires developers to ensure that their designs meet the needs of pedestrians and cyclists, instead of catering mainly to vehicular traffic. It also provides for the building of ramps for barrier-free access. Further, developers are incentivised to provide bicycle lots and supporting facilities through exemption of these spaces from the gross floor area calculation. In addition, more covered walkways are being constructed.
- Launched in 2010, the National Cycling Plan (NCP) envisions cycling as an integral part of Singapore's transport system. Intra-town off-road cycling paths connected to major transport nodes and key amenities were constructed and bicycle parking facilities enhanced in seven HDB towns. The NCP was revised in 2013 with more ambitious targets: provide every HDB town with a cycling path network and build an island-wide off-road cycling path network of over 700 kilometres by 2030.
- Since 2006, all train stations have been equipped with at least one barrier-free entrance with a lift, a tactile guidance system, and wheelchair-accessible toilets. More than 85% of train stations now have barrier free access routes from the station entrance to the station platforms. Priority queue zones for passengers in need for boarding of trains, public buses and lifts were introduced in 2015, and have been implemented in 20 train stations and nine bus interchanges to date. Since April 2017, public buses are equipped to allow parents to board with children in open strollers. By 2020, all public buses will be wheelchair accessible.

• 50 "Silver Zones" will be implemented by 2023 in areas with high senior resident populations, amenities which seniors frequent, or higher accident rates involving senior pedestrians. Silver Zones have road safety features, such as lower speed limits, centre dividers, and road humps and chicanes that slow down motorists and remind them to look out for pedestrians.

#### Green Buildings

• The BCA Green Mark Scheme paved the way for the formulation of Singapore's first Green Building Masterplan in 2006, which focused on new buildings. Following consultations with industry stakeholders, the Masterplan was revised twice in 2009 and 2014 to cover existing buildings and tenanted space and drive the built environment sector to meet the 80% green buildings target.

### Green Transport

- The Fuel Economy Labelling Scheme provides information on the fuel efficiency of each vehicle model.
- Rebate scheme for low-emission vehicles and surcharges for high-emission ones.
- In December 2017, we rolled out an electric car-sharing programme, BlueSG, which will introduce 1,000 shared electric cars and 2,000 charging kiosks island-wide by 2020.
- Singapore plans to deploy 50 hybrid buses by the first quarter of 2019, and 60 electric buses by mid-2020 for trials.

### Green Spaces

- Despite land constraints, close to 10% of land in Singapore is set aside for parks and nature conservation. Today, more than 80% of households live within 400 metres or a ten-minute walk to a park. Singapore aims to expand this to more than 90% of households by 2030, by creating more neighbourhood and regional parks.
- As Singapore continues its transformation into a City in a Garden, the National Parks Board (NParks) has identified 6 key areas to fulfil this vision: 1. Establish world-class gardens; 2. Rejuvenate urban parks and enliven our streetscape; 3. Optimise urban spaces for greenery and recreation; 4. Enrich biodiversity in our urban environment; 5. Enhance competencies of our landscape and horticultural industry; 6. Engage and inspire communities to co-create a greener Singapore.

#### New Opportunities

- New Growth Districts. Singapore is optimising space by transforming existing areas into new growth districts. This includes redeveloping our Greater Southern Waterfront region after the relocation of existing maritime ports to the western part of Singapore, and the redevelopment of the Paya Lebar region in the northeast, after the relocation of the existing military air base.
- Spatial Strategies. Singapore is applying spatial strategies to avoid overcrowding. This includes setting up economic centres outside the traditional business and financial district in the central region, such as Changi Business Park in the East and one-north in the West. In tandem, Singapore is planning for more residential spaces in central Singapore to enable more people to work nearer their homes.
- Underground Infrastructure. Singapore is exploring options to shift more transport & utilities infrastructure & storage facilities underground. Examples: an underground goods mover system to reduce freight transport on roads, underground electrical substations & rock caverns for storm water drainage and storage to increase water resilience.
- An Enabling City. Singapore aims to capitalise on this by transforming the city into an enabling place for seniors to live independently and comfortably while remaining integrated in the community. For example, Singapore introduced barrier-free accessibility, more seating and community spaces in housing estates, and a programme to equip flats with senior-friendly fittings such as grab bars and slip-resistant floor tiles.
- To better engage our seniors, Singapore integrated spaces with senior facilities such as day care, and health and community programmes in its estates, and enhanced parks with senior friendly amenities. Singapore will pilot a network of ten therapeutic pocket gardens based on horticulture therapy to support seniors with dementia and post-stroke patients through the provision of contemplative spaces and activity zones.
- Singapore helps seniors live close to their family and community with priority schemes for new HDB flats, a Proximity Housing Grant2 for resale flats, and purpose-built housing options such as three-generation "3-Gen" flats and short lease two-room "Flexi" flats. Singapore is also exploring integrating senior-friendly housing and senior care services, such as assisted living developments.

- Singapore has worked with industry stakeholders to develop the Design for Maintainability Checklist in 2016 and a Façade Access Design Guide in 2017 to motivate designers and developers to integrate suitable solutions at the design stage for safer, more labour-efficient and cost-effective maintenance regimes.
- Building owners are required to ensure that any exterior features (e.g. windows, claddings, plaster) are maintained and securely fixed. Singapore will introduce a Periodic Façade Inspection regime, focusing on buildings older than 20 years. Inspections will be required once every 7 years to allow early detection of façade deterioration.

#### SDG 12 | A Zero Waste Nation

• The Zero Waste Nation philosophy is integrated into Singapore's national plans and policies, such as the Sustainable Singapore Blueprint.

#### Waste reduction

- Singapore is working to increase the national recycling rate from the current 61% to 70% by 2030. Several related initiatives focus on e-waste, plastic & packaging waste, and food waste due to their significant potential for recycling.
- Mandatory e-waste management framework will be introduced based on the principle of Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR). Implementation is planned by 2021.
- To holistically tackle the issue (plastics & packaging) upstream and at source, Singapore will mandate that businesses report on the type and amount of packaging they put on the market and their plans for reduction by 2021. The Government will also step up engagement with stakeholders and businesses to cut down the excessive use of plastic bags and disposables like single-use food containers.
- An integrated waste management system is in place, including an efficient collection system to collect all municipal waste to prevent litter. Waste is then sent directly for incineration at waste-to-energy plants, which are equipped with air pollution control equipment to meet stringent emissions limits for pollutants such as sulphur dioxide, dioxins and furans.
- Food manufacturers, retail food establishments and supermarkets are encouraged to re-price or re-distribute unsold or excess food to consumers or donate them to charities.
- Consumers are encouraged to reduce food waste through publicity and outreach initiatives that encourage smart and prudent food purchases, preparation and storage habits.
- Where food waste is still generated, Singapore has also put in place efforts to convert this waste into a resource. Singapore supports on-site food waste treatment at commercial premises and hawker centres, as well as piloting district-level food waste treatment.
- Singapore strives to make recycling convenient. A recycling bin is provided for every public housing block and landed housing unit. Private residential developments are required to provide recycling receptacles. Since 2014, all new public housing projects are fitted with a dual-chute system on every floor for the separate collection of recyclables and general waste. This is also mandatory for new private non-landed residential developments taller than 4 storeys since April 2018, and private residential developments will be required to have a recycling bin for every block from Aug. 2018.
- National Environment Agency (NEA) collaborates with schools to set up recycling corners. A
  Preschool 3R Awareness Kit, consisting of a set of picture cards and a Teacher's Guide, assists
  kindergarten teachers in planning activities to interest pre-schoolers in practising the 3Rs and
  educating them on what and how to recycle.
- The Community 3R Outreach Programme (CROP) seeks to raise awareness of the 3Rs through public outreach initiatives.
- Developed various online 3R guidebooks for businesses.
- The 3R Awards for Hotels and Shopping Malls recognise outstanding 3R efforts to minimise and recycle waste.
- Mandated reporting waste data & waste reduction plans by large commercial premises from 2014
- The Singapore Packaging Agreement (SPA) was launched in 2007 as a joint initiative by the Government, industry and NGOs. SPA signatories are encouraged to redesign their products and processes to enjoy cost savings. This helps to reduce packaging waste.
- Under the SPA, an eco-label, the Logo for Products with Reduced Packaging (LPRP), has also been introduced to enable consumers to identify products with reduced packaging.
- Singapore is also investing in R&D to develop solutions to extract value and resources from key waste and residue waste streams. Singapore has also launched the Environmental Services

Industry Transformation Map to improve productivity, promote growth and create better jobs for the cleaning and waste management sectors.

Sound management of hazardous chemical and industrial waste

- Singapore implements stringent regulatory frameworks to ensure the environmentally sound management of hazardous chemicals & toxic industrial wastes throughout their life cycle, in accordance with international multilateral environmental agreements (MEAs).
- Singapore controls the import, export, transport, storage and use of hazardous substances, under the Environmental Protection and Management Act (EPMA) and the Environmental Protection and Management (Hazardous Substances) Regulations (EPM (HS) Regulations). Any individual planning to import, export, transport, sell, store or use hazardous substances locally must first obtain a HS licence or permit. Approval is also required to transport hazardous substances in quantities exceeding the limits in the EPM(HS) Regulations. Singapore also has requirements such as periodic inspections for bulk packaging, maximum allowable transportation quantities, approved transportation route and timing, as well as the submission of transportation emergency response plans to ensure the safe transportation of hazardous substances. Singapore conducts inspections to audit the records of hazardous substances maintained by entities with HS licences and permits, and electronically processes inward and outward declarations for the import and export of hazardous substances through the Whole-of-Government (WOG) TradeNet computerised network system.
- Singapore regulates the import, export and local use of products containing hazardous substances controlled under the EPMA, through the same regulatory framework and systems described above.
- Going beyond the scope of obligations under the various MEAs, Singapore also implemented the Restriction of Hazardous Substances ("SG-RoHS") framework which came into effect on 1 June 2017. This initiative restricts the amount of hazardous substances such as lead, chromium and cadmium entering the environment from Electrical and Electronic Equipment (EEE).
- The Environmental Public Health (Toxic Industrial Waste) Regulations require all toxic industrial waste collectors to be licensed to carry out treatment, reprocessing and disposal of toxic industrial wastes.
- Approval is also required to transport toxic industrial wastes exceeding the quantities stipulated
  in the Regulations. NEA also implements the Hazardous Waste (Control of Export, Import and
  Transit) Act to ensure that Singapore meets its obligations as a Party to the Basel Convention
  on the Control of Transboundary Movement of Hazardous Wastes and Their Disposal. This
  includes the implementation of the Prior-Informed Consent (PIC) Procedure under the
  framework of the Convention.

Encouraging Energy-Efficient and Water-Efficient Behaviour and Practices

- In January 2008, Singapore introduced the Mandatory Energy Labelling Scheme (MELS) for household air conditioners and refrigerators and extended to clothes dryers in 2009. MELS was further extended to televisions in 2014, and incandescent lamps and their direct replacements in 2015. In 2014, the design of the energy label and energy rating system were revised to better differentiate the more energy-efficient models in the market.
- Minimum Energy Performance Standards (MEPS) were introduced in 2011 to raise the average energy efficiency of products in the market. Currently, only household refrigerators, airconditioners, clothes dryers and lamps that meet the minimum energy efficiency standards can be sold in Singapore. MEPS will be extended to cover motors from October 2018. These performance standards are constantly reviewed.
- Mandatory Water Efficiency Labelling Scheme (WELS), introduced in 2009, required suppliers to label the water efficiency of their water fittings and appliances. Currently, mandatory WELS covers taps and mixers, dual-flush low capacity flushing cisterns, urinal flush valves and waterless urinals, and washing machines. To complement the mandatory WELS, minimum water efficiency standards were introduced to phase out the least water -efficient products. For example, all taps and mixers sold or supplied in Singapore are required to meet at least "1-tick" water efficiency standard. These mandatory requirements are periodically reviewed and updated. From October 2018 onwards, the mandatory WELS will be extended to dishwashers. Water fittings under mandatory WELS to be sold or supplied in Singapore have to meet at least "2-tick" water efficiency standard with effect from April 2019.
- The Water Efficiency Management Plan (WEMP) is a voluntary initiative introduced in 2010 for commercial and industrial users to improve water use efficiency. Since January 2015, all

- large water (over 60,000 cubic metres) must submit annual WEMPs and must install water meters to measure and monitor water consumption. The WEMP includes an analysis of current water usage and proposed water conservation measures.
- The Water Efficient Buildings (Basic) certification programme, introduced in 2004, encourages building owners to increase water efficiency. The WEB (Basic) certification can be obtained by installing water-efficient fittings and adopting water efficient flow rates/flush volumes. Certified buildings can typically save 5% of monthly water consumption. WEB (Basic) requirements are also recognised under the Green Mark Certification Scheme for buildings, which promotes environment-friendly buildings.
- The Water Efficiency Fund was introduced in 2007 to co-fund the implementation of water efficiency projects. Projects include feasibility studies, water audits, recycling efforts, use of alternate sources of water and community wide water conservation programmes.
- Introduced in 2006, the Public Sector Taking the Lead in Environmental Sustainability (PSTLES) initiative requires public agencies to implement measures for energy efficiency, water efficiency and recycling. Enhancement of PSTLES in 204 included requiring each Ministry to appoint a Sustainability Manager, set sustainability targets, and develop a resource management plan. These environmental sustainability efforts were outlined in the Public Sector Sustainability Plan 2017–2020, launched on 5 June 2017.
- Public agencies retrofitting major energy consuming equipment are encouraged to adopt the Guaranteed Energy Savings Performance (GESP) contracting model.

#### Finding Innovative Solutions

• The upcoming signature Integrated Waste Management Facility (IWMF), which will be integrated with the Tuas Water Reclamation Plant (TWRP) will allow for water-energy-waste synergies such as effluent water from wastewater treatment being used for cooling waste incineration equipment. Also, food waste can be co-digested with used water sludge to enhance biogas production to increase the overall plant thermal efficiency. Integrating the facilities will also reduce carbon emissions by more than 200,000 tonnes annually.

#### E-Waste Management System

• A mandatory e-waste management system will be implemented in 2021 to ensure the proper recycling of e-waste, where safety and environmental standards are adhered to. The system would be based on the EPR concept and entails the assignment of responsibilities to key stakeholders in the e-waste value chain. With the system in place, the public would have access to convenient avenues to recycle e-waste.

## **SDG 13** | Singapore's Climate Change Strategy

- Singapore uses a Whole-of-Nation approach to address climate change, and it set up the Inter-Ministerial Committee on Climate Change (IMCCC) in 2007 to enhance Whole-of-Government coordination. The IMCCC is headed by the Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security and includes Ministers from 7 key agencies.
- The National Climate Change Secretariat (NCCS) was set up in July 2010 under the Prime Minister's Office to support the IMCCC.
- Singapore's national strategy on climate change has been publicized through several publications, including the National Climate Change Strategy (2012), Singapore Sustainable Blueprint (last updated in 2015), and the two-pronged Climate Action Plan (2016): Take Action Today, for a Carbon-Efficient Singapore, and A Climate-Resilient Singapore, for a Sustainable Future.
- The Climate Action Plan outlines key mitigation strategies: (i) improving energy efficiency; (ii) reducing carbon emissions from power generation; (iii) developing and deploying cutting-edge low-carbon technologies; and (iv) encouraging collective action among government agencies, individuals, businesses, and the community.
- The public sector has adopted sustainability measures under the Public Sector Taking the Lead in Environmental Sustainability (PSTLES) programme. Under the Public Sector Sustainability Plan 2017-2020, the public sector will achieve an electricity savings of 15%, water savings of 5% and 100% green building adoption by FY2020.

### Transport

- Vehicle Emissions Scheme (VES) provides incentives to purchase less-polluting vehicles and imposes surcharges on polluting ones.
- Singapore's first electric car-sharing programme, BlueSG, was launched in Dec. 2017, aiming at 1,000 shared electric vehicles and 2,000 charging points island-wide by 2020.

### Buildings

• Singapore aims to green 80% of all buildings by 2030, up from 31% in 2016 in line with the vision of 'Positive-energy Low-rise, Zero-energy Medium-rise, Super Low-energy High-rise buildings in the tropics.' Measures to achieve this include enhancing the Building and Construction Authority of Singapore (BCA) Green Mark Scheme and encouraging retrofitting of tenanted spaces. One innovative financing scheme in this sector is the Building Retrofit Energy Efficiency Financing, where the BCA provides loan-loss guarantees on loans made by financial institutions for energy efficiency retrofits.

#### Carbon Tax

• Carbon tax of S\$ 5 (about USD 3.80) per tonne of CO2 equivalent emissions from 2019-2023. It applies to all sectors without exception, covering about 80 percent of emissions.

### Strengthening Resilience

Resilience Framework guides adaptation planning and identified 6 key risk areas: coastal
protection, water resources and drainage, biodiversity and greenery, public health and food
security, network infrastructure, and building structures and infrastructure. Strengthened local
capability in climate science and modelling, established the Centre for Climate Research
Singapore (CCRS).

Promoting Climate Change Public Awareness and Action

- Climate change is integrated into school curricula across subjects such as economics, geography and the sciences. Schools also conduct excursions to sites such as power stations, incineration plants, meteorological stations and green buildings.
- Climate Action SG Grant provides funds for local constituencies, NGOs and interest groups to organise events and activities that increase awareness on climate action.

Develop Options to Further Deploy Renewable Energy

- Housing and Development Board (HDB) initiative to install solar panels on rooftops of highrise public housing developments.
- Economic Development Board's (EDB) and PUB's floating photovoltaic PV project currently pilots ten systems of 1 MWp total floating solar panel installations on water surfaces at Tengeh Reservoir.
- As part of the Renewable Energy Integration Demonstrator, Singapore's first long-span wind turbine was installed at an offshore landfill in October 2017.
- SolarNova programme (EDB & HDB) aggregates solar demand of government agencies.

#### Further Enhance Resilience

- In 2011, the minimum reclamation level for new projects was raised from three metres to four metres above mean sea level.
- Minimum crest levels were set for entrances to underground facilities such as Mass Rapid Transit stations.
- Future Terminal 5 at Changi Airport will be built 5.5m above mean sea level. Significant upgrades to the drainage system are in progress.

- Singapore currently has four legally gazetted Nature Reserves and 20 other administratively protected Nature Areas that cover the majority of our natural habitats.
- Integrated Urban Coastal Management strategy has 4 guiding principles: 1. Proactive planning and management to safeguard our coastal and marine environment by optimising the use of coastal resources, including coastal spaces in a sustainable manner; 2. A Whole-of-Government approach to ensure consultative planning and coordination of policies between all stakeholders in coastal and marine land use and planning; 3. Active partnerships through community engagement & public awareness programmes; and 4. Science-based management through research, monitoring, restoration and enhancement programmes to conserve sensitive coastal habitats and their biodiversity and natural resources amidst coastal development.
- Sisters' Island Marine Park (SIMP) (established 2015) as Singapore's first marine park.
- Marine Conservation Action Plan (MCAP), guides Singapore's efforts at conserving marine habitats & biodiversity. Species recovery is a key activity, including programs on marine turtles, giant clams, Neptune's Cup Sponge, and several locally rare hard and soft coral species. More species are planned to be included.
- Biodiversity enhancement units were installed to help existing biodiversity within Singapore's coastal & marine habitats. These include the creation of inter-tidal pools and surface complexity enhancements along coastal seawalls, and the use of enhanced floating structures that increase visibility and bring marine biodiversity closer to the people.
- The Maritime and Port Authority of Singapore (MPA) also organises outreach programmes to raise awareness.

- MPA and the National University of Singapore's Centre for International Law (CIL) established the CIL-MPA Oceans Governance Research Programme in April 2016 to contribute to the greater understanding of maritime law and ocean governance.
- Maritime Singapore Green Initiative (MSGI) was launched in 2011 to reduce the environmental impact of shipping and shipping-related activities on the coastal and marine environment. The MPA pledged to invest up to S\$100 million over five years under the MSGI's three programmes: the Green Ship Programme, Green Port Programme and Green Technology Programme. In July 2016, the MSGI was extended to 31 December 2019 and further enhanced. Two new programmes were introduced: the Green Awareness Programme and the Green Energy Programme. MSGI also supports local maritime technology companies in developing and deploying green technologies through co-funding grants of up to 50% of the qualifying costs.
- MPA has in place the Marine Emergency Action Procedure to effectively manage oil and chemical spills, as well as other marine incidents. Regular emergency exercises are conducted to ensure our operational readiness in responding to such incidents.

- Singapore currently has four legally gazetted nature reserves and 20 other administratively protected nature areas.
- Singapore's National Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan, which outlines a holistic approach across various government agencies, was launched in 2009.
- Nature Conservation Master Plan (NCMP) consolidates, coordinates, strengthens and intensifies Singapore's biodiversity conservation efforts. It has 4 key thrusts: (i) conserving key habitats and habitat enhancement, (ii) restoration and species recovery, (iii) applied research in conservation biology and planning, and (iv) community stewardship and outreach.
- In 2015, Singapore initiated a species recovery programme to conserve native flora and fauna. It identified 60 endemic, rare or threatened native species of plants and animals as conservation priorities and seeks to increase their populations in Singapore though reintroduction, habitat enhancement and protection.
- Singapore has implemented habitat enhancement and restoration efforts in nature parks since 1993, and this continues to be an important element of the NCMP 2015. A Habitat Enhancement and Restoration Framework was adopted to standardise the approach.
- Strategic green corridors, also known as Nature Ways, are established along roadsides that connect areas of high biodiversity and link fragmented natural habitats.
- Eco-Link@BKE, an hourglass-shaped ecological bridge was constructed across the Bukit Timah Expressway to connect the once-contiguous Singapore's Bukit Timah and Central Catchment Nature Reserves to mitigate fragmentation effects due to the construction of the expressway in 2011.
- Community in Nature (CIN) initiative (launched in 2011) engages the community to conserve Singapore's natural heritage.
- Citizen Science programme. Volunteers conduct surveys of various animal groups, such as butterflies, birds and dragonflies. There are also more intensive citizen science surveys known as BioBlitzes, which target a specific natural area and are more comprehensive.
- To promote skyrise greenery, the Urban Redevelopment Authority and NParks introduced the Landscaping for Urban Spaces and High-rises (LUSH) programme and Skyrise Greenery Incentive Scheme. These complementary initiatives offer building owners and developers incentives such as additional gross floor area for rooftop greenery installation and co-funding for skyrise greenery installation. Singapore also recognises creative skyrise greenery designs through the Skyrise Greenery Awards.

- Children's and Young Persons Act (CYPA) safeguards the care, protection and rehabilitation of children and young persons below 16 years of age. The CYPA was amended in 2011 to improve the protection for children and young persons, such as exempting a child from attending court proceedings in cases where the child could be adversely affected and safeguarding a child's privacy.
- Protection from Harassment Act (in force from Nov. 2014), criminalises different forms of harassment such as sexual harassment and school or cyberspace bullying, enhances protections against harassment, and provides a range of self-help and civil remedies to victims.
- Prevention of Corruption Act (PCA).
- Corruption, Drug Trafficking and Other Serious Crimes Act (CDSA).
- Independent judiciary metes out harsh penalties for corrupt offenders.
- Public servants are guided by a strict Code of Conduct.

- Corrupt Practices Investigation Bureau (CPIB), is an independent national anti-corruption agency responsible for investigating and preventing corruption in Singapore.
- Pro bono legal services are provided through a partnership between the Government, the Law Society of Singapore, various volunteers and volunteer welfare organisations. For low-income individuals facing legal issues, the Legal Aid Bureau provides civil legal aid for most civil proceedings, including judicial reviews, while the Law Society Pro Bono Services runs the Criminal Legal Aid Scheme (CLAS). In a significant shift of policy, the Government started direct funding of criminal legal aid since 2015. This was supported by a significant increase in resources from volunteer lawyers and law firms.
- Government has also made significant efforts to strengthen citizen engagement through public feedback channels. The Government's main Feedback Unit, REACH (Reaching Everyone for Active Citizenry @ Home), is the lead agency facilitating WOG efforts to engage and connect with citizens on national and social issues.
- Specialised Councils under the Presidency have also been established to ensure that the voices
  of minority groups are taken into consideration in policymaking. For example, the Presidential
  Council for Minority Rights is tasked with examining legislation to ensure that they are not
  disadvantageous to any racial or religious community in Singapore.
- Financial institutions operating in Singapore are required to put in place robust controls to detect and deter the flow of illicit funds through our financial system.
- An Inter-Agency Taskforce was established in 2010 to ensure Whole-of-Government coordination on Trafficking in Persons (TIP) issues. In March 2012, the Taskforce launched the National Plan of Action (NPA) 2012-2015, which centres on a "4Ps strategy" of Prevention, Prosecution, Protection and Partnership. Thereafter, the Taskforce developed a new National Approach against TIP, launched on 10 March 2016.
- In 2015, Singapore enacted the Prevention of Human Trafficking Act.

- Singapore supports a multi-faceted, multi-stakeholder approach to implementing the SDGs. Agencies engage in wide-ranging consultations as part of the policymaking process. Stakeholders are engaged throughout the policymaking cycle.
- Youth video competition, "The Sustainable Development Goals What YOUth Can Do" to engage youth in SDGs.
- Singapore established public-private partnerships to implement several SDGs and supported the work of several international organisations and businesses in spreading the message of sustainable development. For example, Singapore's Temasek Foundation, a Singapore based non-profit philanthropic organisation, has been hosting annual "Ecosperity" Conferences in partnership with the Business and Sustainable Development Commission since 2014.
- The Monetary Authority of Singapore's green bond grant scheme has incentivized issuance by financial institutions such as the Development Bank of Singapore.
- Singapore National Co-operative Foundation (SNCF) has enacted measures in line with the SDGs in order to enhance their offerings. This includes ensuring price stabilisation of food supplies during crises, contributing to the provision of healthcare through its network of doctors, increasing women's access to economic opportunities, and facilitating access to education through providing awards, study grants and bursaries.

Source: (Government of Singapore 2018)

**Budget:** Singapore's VNR mentioned only 4 budget allocations as examples. One item was small, two were modest, while one example was very large, indicating Singapore's social spending as a share of GDP (8.2 percent in 2017). These examples are listed below in Table 15.

However, since the policies listed in the VNR were very broad-ranging and presumably had existing budgets, the actual related budget is likely to be substantial.

<sup>\*</sup> Listed under more than one SDG

Table 15: Budget Items listed in Singapore's VNR

SDG	Budget Item	Amount	
SDG 1	<ul> <li>Social spending as a percent of GDP (2017)</li> <li>Early childhood education (by 2022)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>8.2% of GDP (up from 5.2% in 2007)</li> <li>S\$1.7 bil. per year</li> </ul>	
SDG 2	Agriculture Productivity Fund (APF)	• S\$ 63 mil.	
SDG 9	• Research, Innovation and Enterprise 2020 (RIE2020) Plan which spans 2016 to 2020	• S\$ 19 bil.	

Source: (Government of Singapore 2018)

**Overall:** Singapore appears to be making considerable efforts on the SDGs based on its VNR. It has a large number and wide variety of policies, not only covering each SDG, but also a range of areas under each SDG. These were generally linked with achievements and/or targets. Regarding budgets, only a few specific items were mentioned, but since the scope of the policies listed was very wide, a similar scope of the national budget could be considered as linked to the SDGs.

### 3.9 Thailand

**Strategy:** Thailand published its first VNR in 2017 (Thailand 2017). It addressed each of the SDGs. The VNR emphasized that Thailand takes a holistic approach to the SDGs, and it has mainstreamed the SDGs into overall national policies and plans, including the 20-Year National Strategy Framework and the 12<sup>th</sup> National Economic and Social Development Plan (2017-2021). These were developed based on the core principle of Sufficiency Economy Philosophy (SEP) which was conceived by His Majesty the Late King Bhumibol Adulyadej. SDGs are coordinated by the National Committee on Sustainable Development (CSD), which is chaired by the Prime Minister, and its secretariat is the National Economic and Social Development Board. The Board is intended "to formulate policies and strategies on national sustainable development across economic, social and environment dimensions in a balanced and integrated manner, provide recommendations to improve economic, social and legal measures, as well as promote and support public and private agencies' activities related to sustainable development, and oversee the implementation of government agencies..." (p. 63). The VNR added that "every government agency has integrated SDGs into their strategies and action plans including the country's reform processes" (p. 6).

**Policies:** Thailand's VNR listed a significant number of policies and initiatives for all SDGs, which are shown below in Table 16. Many of them were related to broad policy frameworks and national strategies. Some policies were clearly implemented before SDGs, but others were implemented after SDGs were adopted. Many were implemented from 2017, the same year that Thailand's SDG VNR was issued. The VNR discussed Thailand's policies in the context of the country's achievements, challenges, and future policy directions regarding each SDG.

Table 16: Policies Mentioned in Thailand's VNR

SDGs	Policies							
SDG 1	SEP [Sufficiency Economy Philosophy] Model Villages (878)							
	Pracharath policy to promote social enterprises (in 76 provinces)							
	• Financial subsidy to low income families (about USD 85.71 per family, to 325,609 families							
	totalling almost USD 17 million.							
	• 10 Year Housing Development Plan (2016-2025)							
	o Pracharath housing project							
	o Improvement of the Homeless' Quality of Life Project							
	Social Assistance Centre 1300 (call centre and online channels)							
	Universal Health Coverage Scheme							
	15 years free basic education from kindergarten to high school & free bus & train services							
	• Childcare subsidy for poor families with children aged 0-3 (about USD 171.43/month)							
	• Senior citizens & disabled persons' monthly allowances (~USD 22.86 per person/ month)							
	• State Social Welfare Scheme - support for the poor (income less than about USD 2,857/yr.)							
	Job centres providing career consulting and training							
	Measures to protect and manage rights of laborers							
	Land management policy to address land encroachment and reallocate land for the poor							
	Now developing 2 <sup>nd</sup> National Disaster Prevention and Mitigation Plan							
	"Miss/Mister Early Warning" local people trained in early warning & disaster management							
	Community Welfare Fund of Umong Municipality, Lamphun Province							
SDG 2	20-Year National Strategy on Healthcare							
	Milk Code (to encourage breastfeeding)							
	Framework on the Promotion of Sustainable Agriculture 2017-2021							
	Organic Farming Improvement Project							
	New Theory Agriculture Project (capacity building for farmers & communities)							
	Master Plan on Integration of the Management of Biodiversity 2015-2021							
	Food Bank Royal Project, Mae Hong Son Province							
SDG 3	Maternal health care policy							

		7.0
	•	Infant care policy
	•	Improvement of public health care services
	•	Universal Health Coverage Service
	•	Health insurance for documented and undocumented migrant workers
	•	Migrant health volunteer program (to assist migrants)
	•	Tobacco Control Act
	•	Act for Prevention and Solution of the Adolescent Pregnancy Problem 2016
	•	Revision and enforcement of road safety laws, public awareness campaigns
SDG 4	•	Subsidies for basic education including primary education for all children.
	•	Per student budget to schools allocated to promote equality
	•	Education trust funds and scholarships (undergraduate)
	•	Government established schools for the underprivileged
	•	12 <sup>th</sup> Education Development Plan (2017-2021)
	•	Created SEP-guided schools and learning centres (21,185)
	•	Established Southeast Asian Ministers of Education Organization's Regional Centre for
		Sufficiency Economy Philosophy for Sustainability in Thailand
	•	Dual Vocational Education Initiative (merges normal & vocational education curriculums)
	•	Co-operative Education Initiative (stresses work experience)
	•	Support establishment of bilateral vocational education schemes with chambers of commerce.
	•	Measures to attract teachers
SDG 5	•	Women's Development Plan under the National Economic and Social Development Plan
	•	Strategy for Women's Development 2017-2021
	•	Government supported the ASEAN Women Entrepreneurs' Network
	•	Established the National Commission on Policy and Strategy for the Improvement of the Status
		of Women and the Gender Equality Promotion Committee
	•	Gender Equality Act 2015
	•	All ministries have a Chief Gender Equality Officer from 2001. Since 2015 this became the
		responsibility of permanent secretaries.
	•	Constitution of 2017 mandates gender responsive budgeting
	•	Measures to improve data collection
SDG 6	•	National Water Vision (2000)
	•	Water Resources Management Strategy 2015-2026
	•	Strategy for Green Growth (under the 20-Year National Strategy Framework)
	•	Strategy for Green Growth toward Sustainable development (under the 12 <sup>th</sup> National Economic
		and Social Development Plan)
SDG 7	•	Thai Integrated Energy Blueprint (20-year long term energy plan)
		o Power Development Plan
		o Energy Efficiency Plan
		Alternative Energy development Plan
		o Gas Plan
		o Oil Plan
	•	Alternative Energy Development Plan 2015
	•	Energy 4.0 Policy
	•	Application of SEP to support energy management in communities (working plans)
		o Create community researchers
		o Encourage local economy through reducing energy consumption in local companies
		o Public awareness through "Power Conservation Community" Project
		o Nationwide training for provincial level energy planners
		o Multiply the impact of community energy projects
a= a:	•	Energy labels
SDG 8	•	Strengthening Grassroots Economies under Pracharath Approach
	•	Emergency Credit for Farmers Affected by Drought
	•	Credit for One Tambol
	•	One SME in Agriculture
	•	2nd Phase of Credit Guarantee for Micro Entrepreneurs
	•	Adapting Supply Chains for Drought Resilience
	•	Smart Training Centre to enhance laborers' skill to raise productivity

- Development of Special Economic Zones with emphasis on 13 industries promoted by the Board of Investment of Thailand (BOI).
- Vocational training for groups with special needs
- "Smart Job Centres" were established in 44 provinces (11 centres in Bangkok)
- Capacity building and skills development had been provided to 14,639 workers (from the target of 12,000 persons) in the informal sector
- 4,918 persons received support to set up businesses, from a target of 3,620 (135.86 %)
- Persons with Disabilities' Quality of Life Promotion Act 2007
- Pracharath scheme to enhance income and employment of the elderly
- Thorough investigations of employers and employees to ensure protection for workers against wrongful practices
- Increased minimum wage
- Sufficiency Economy Business Standard (SEBS) as guiding principle with 7 core values: immunity, diligence, sufficiency, generosity, morality, social development and respect for stakeholders.

- 20-Year Draft Strategy for Transport Systems Development (2017-2036)
  - 3 rail system development plans including intercity rail and high-speed trains
- Ministry of Transport plans to procure NGV-fuelled public buses, electric public buses, replace diesel-powered locomotives
- Ministry of Transport launched many road safety programs, such school zones, road signs & road surface markings, outreach campaigns to at least 717 schools, bicycle paths.
- Measures to enforce traffic law in a stricter manner.
- Policy to apply Universal Design in developing the public transport system's infrastructure and public transport vehicles
- Development of human resources, technology, and research and development in utilizing innovation and effective management in the transport systems development process
- Ministry of Transport's Strategic Plan 2017-2021 is in line with the SDGs
- 20-Year Thailand 4.0 Industrial Development Strategy
- Provide entrepreneurs with education and consultation on how to improve production systems by using technology and innovation to increase productivity and efficiency, reduce energy and natural resources consumption
- Workshops to disseminate information on how to increase competitiveness, using new technology and innovation in their production
- Raising (industrial) product standards
- Programs to encourage cooperation of the local entrepreneurs and community in safeguarding the environmental and sustainable development of industry
- Pracharath SME Development Fund (public- Private-People Partnership mechanism to provide financial support to small and medium enterprises)
- Eastern Economic Corridor (EEC) project
- Established an eco-system for innovation or Innovation Cities
- Plans to build product testing facilities to improve product standards & manufacturing processes
- Reform of some government agencies to increase flexibility by delegating permit and licensing duties to third party organizations
- Transferred certain tasks and missions from the central agencies to regional bodies.
- Moreover, the Government has revised laws and regulations to facilitate industry
  entrepreneurs and investors, like the revision of the Sugar Cane and Brown Sugar Act to
  cover the process of developing sugar cane into a high-value bio-industry.
- National Competitiveness Enhancement for Target Industries Act of 2017 aims to encourage investment in targeted industries or in industries that use new or advanced manufacturing technologies
- The 9999 Industrial Standard (IS) balances economic, social, & environmental considerations

- Building capacity of communities by Public-Private-People Policy (PPPP) in accordance with the Pracharath Policy
- State Social Welfare Scheme
- Regulate informal lenders by allowing them to register their lending business as Nano finance and Pico finance services

- Expedited the enactment of law that prohibits lenders from charging excessive interest rates and increases the penalty for offenses
- Created new methods & channels that enhance access to credit, facilitate debt negotiation, revive jobs of people in debt, promote local community's financial mechanisms.
- Increased standard minimum wage from 300 Baht/day (about 8.57 USD) to 305 310 Baht (about 8.85USD) /day in 69 provinces (came into effect on 1 January 2017).
- Setup dedicated employment centres for the elderly.
- The Ministry of Labour also regularly dispatches onsite visits and inspections to ensure compliance with labour protection laws and to safeguard labour rights.
- Strategic Plan for the Integration of Sufficiency Economy Philosophy in Development 2014 2017
- In 2016, the Government established a social enterprise "Pracharath Rak Samakee" in each province nationwide.
- "Thanyaburi Model" Project by the Ministry of Social Development and Human Security assists beggars and homeless people.
- "Tor-Fan" (Dream Weaving) Project produces products sold to the public from different vocational programs for the elderly, persons with disabilities, women, homeless, & victims of human trafficking, under the Ministry of Social Development & Human Security.

- 12<sup>th</sup> National Economic and Social Development Plan. Includes the shift towards low-carbon, smart, and inclusive city, local culture and identity preservation, environmentally friendly infrastructure and technology, and disaster risk management.
- Department of Public Works and Town & Country Planning reformed the spatial planning system with broad participation of all stakeholders.
- Draft Progressive Land Tax Act, Land Bank Act, and Community Rights in Land and Resource Management Act are being considered and pushed forward.
- 10-Year Strategic Plan for Housing Development (2016-2026) was developed, focusing on two groups of low-income population.
- Draft 20-Year Strategic Plan for Housing Development (2017-2037) containing the vision "Housing for all Thai People by 2037" with 5 key strategies: 1) promoting strong and sustainable community, 2) strengthening housing finance 3) promoting integrated housing management 4) developing and promoting good quality housing and 5) managing environment for good quality of life.
- Government Housing Bank is providing concessional housing loan for low- and medium-income population. As of September 2016, 22,434 million Baht (approximately 650 million USD) has been approved.
- City development companies were established in many provinces aiming to raise capital for infrastructure development and to promote the transition towards smart city.
- Thailand has integrated National Disaster Prevention and Mitigation Plan 2015 and Climate Change Management Master Plan 2015-2050 to develop prevention and preparation system and enhance resilience.
  - o Community Disaster Risk Management (CBDRM) to create warning and evacuation systems for communities to be self-reliant. (972 communities/villages in 2016)
  - o Capacity building for the prevention and mitigation of large-scale disasters
  - O Use of disaster prevention and mitigation plans at provincial and district levels
  - o Compiling a list of risk areas
  - o Disaster prevention and mitigation training according to each area's risk profile.
- The Government is currently restructuring land tax by replacing the Building and Land Tax Act 1932 and Local Maintenance Tax Act 1965 with the draft Land and Building Tax Act in order to empower local governments to efficiently and adequately collect taxes.
- Ministry of Transport has developed the Universal Design concept, enacted laws and regulations aiming to provide basic facilities for elder and persons with disabilities, and developed transportation service buildings that incorporate concepts of Universal Design and Service Design in order to eliminate barriers to access to public transport.

- Led by the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment, 27 government agencies jointly formed the Taskforce for SDG12 under the Steering Committee on Natural Resources and Environment for the Implementation of SDGs.
- The Task Force has put forward the "Sustainable Consumption and Production Roadmap 2017 2036" which was built on the pre-existing Thailand SCP Roadmap developed under the SWTICH-Asia Program of the Thailand-EU Policy Dialogues Support Facility.

- Modal shift in the public transportation systems, moving towards low-energy and energy-efficient systems such as rail, water and multimodal transport.
- Product labels to promote environment-friendly products
- Green Industry Policy
- Range of projects on environmentally sustainable cities & green cities such as the Smart Cities Clean Energy Project, promoting energy efficiency, renewable energy, reducing carbon emissions, the Green Procurement Project, promoting green procurement among government agencies, local governments, state enterprises, and other public entities
- National Master Plan on Waste Management 2016 2021 (One objective is to create an integrated waste management plan.)
- The Stock Exchange of Thailand (SET) has formulated the Corporate Governance Code as a guideline to integrate the concept of sustainability into the business sector.
- Capacity-building and building knowledge base in science and technology

- Thailand's Nationally Determined Contribution Roadmap on Mitigation 2021 2030
- Climate Change Management Master Plan 2015-2050
- "Support to the Development and Implementation of the Thai Climate Change Policy" Project
  provided knowledge & capacity training to local actors in pilot areas (16 provinces and 32
  municipalities). Currently, all provinces and municipalities in the pilot areas have successfully
  created climate change adaptation action plans.
- National Disaster Prevention and Mitigation Plan 2015 2019
- Thailand is in the process of preparing the National Adaptation Plan (NAP).
- Climate Change International Training Centre (CITC) established.
- Relevant agencies integrated the climate change aspect into their policies and plans such as the Alternative Energy Development Plan 2015-2036, the Energy Efficiency Plan 2015-2036, the Power Development Plan 2015-2036, the Thailand Smart Grid Development Master Plan 2015-2036 and Environmentally Sustainable Transport System Master Plan.

- 2015 Marine and Coastal Resources Management Act
- National Committee on Marine and Coastal Resources Management established
- "Provincial Committees on Marine and Coastal Resources Management" (multi-stakeholder platforms to propose management plans for local marine & coastal resources)
- Clean-up activities have also been operated in 24 coastal provinces.
- Waste reduction measures are also implemented in 7 selected pilot areas.
- "Red Tide Program" to monitor water quality and eutrophication in marine & coastal areas
- Measures and programs to preserve the marine ecosystems and enhance biodiversity.
  - Restoration of degraded marine and coastal ecosystems
  - Establishment and improvement of fishing measures in line with responsible fishery
  - o Declaration of marine and coastal conserved and reserved areas
  - O Adopt marine spatial planning as integral part of marine & coastal zone management.
- Marine protected areas (MPA). Up to 9 additional MPAs to be created from 2016 2023
- Under the IOCWESTPAC and GOA-ON, Thailand has set up 2 permanent monitoring sites for carbonate chemistry of seawater and biodiversity in the coral reef ecosystem.
- The Command Centre for Combating Illegal Fishing (CCCIF) was set up in May 2015 to coordinate the efforts of all state agencies.
- National Plan of Action to Prevent, Deter and Eliminate IUU Fishing 2015 2019 (Thailand NPOA-IUU)
- Fisheries Management Plan 2009-2018 (FMP).
- Surveyed all existing Thai-flagged fishing vessels
- Fleet-reduction measures to gradually reduce the number of the Thai fishing fleet
- E-license scheme and fishing day scheme based on MSY, which marks a transition from open-access to limited access fisheries
- Entry / Exit Scheme which controls and manages commercial fishing vessels entering and exiting Thai waters.
- Port in/Port out (PIPO) Scheme
- Vessel Monitoring System (VMS)
- Fishery Monitoring Centre (FMC)
- National Plan of Fishery Control and Inspection (NPFCI)
- Database for Fishing Vessels and Laborers
- Fisheries Act 2015

- "One Map" initiative to harmonize the scale of all maps to address the issue of overlapping concession areas and as a basis for policy planning
- The 20-year National Strategy Framework contains a green growth strategy.
- National Reserved Forest Act was revised in 2016
- Accelerated implementation of laws and regulations to tackle forest encroachment covering 191 square kilometres in 2015.
- Encouraged reforestation in conservation forest and national reserved forest to replace degraded forest land and accelerate recovery of forest structure
- Community forests, which are managed in a participatory manner by local citizens and communities, have been established.
- Promoting long-term economic plantations such as teak, Ormosia, and Siamese rosewood
- Financial mechanisms for reforestation such as forest bonds, tree banks, reforestation fund
- Research & development on sustainably growing crops in forest areas, such as agroforestry
- Total conserved area for biodiversity protection is approximately 116,800 square kilometres (22.76 percent of total land area)
- Thailand has formulated national plan for the conservation and sustainable use of biological diversity in accordance with the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020 and the Aichi Biodiversity Targets covering 31 targets on conserving, restoring and protecting biodiversity and ecosystems, raising public awareness, and understanding the roles and importance of biodiversity to human well-being and collaboration among all relevant sectors in integrated management.
- Master Plan for Integrated Biodiversity Management 2015 2021
  - Setting more comprehensive targets under the Convention of Biological Diversity (CBD) or the Aichi Biodiversity Targets
  - O Conserving Habitats for Globally Important Flora and Fauna in Product Landscape Project
- Since 2016, Thailand has been developing a Land Degradation Neutrality (LDN) Strategy
- National Ivory Action Plan (NIAP) was revised in 2014.
- As part of NIAP, many related laws were revised, such as the Wild Animals Reservation and Protection Act 2014, and the Ivory Trade Act 2015, and more than 30 subordinate laws were enacted concerning reservation and protection of wild animals and ivory. Thailand has also added African elephants as protected species under Thai law.
- Three ivory-related registration systems were improved: (1) registration system of ivory traders and ivory products list, (2) registration system for legal ivory possession from domesticated and African elephants and (3) registration system for confiscated ivory.

- Framework for Effective Crime Prevention (2017)
- Promoting legal aid and access to justice through the establishment of the justice fund and the reform of pro bono legal service, public defenders and legal counsellors
- "Zero tolerance" policy against all forms of human trafficking, while providing assistance and protection measures for the victims.
- National Anti-Corruption Committee and the Thailand Anti-Corruption Coordination Centre (TACC) have been set up as national administrative bodies
- The Organic Act on Counter Corruption 2015 (3rd version) is being revised to broaden the level of punishment for government officers who accept bribes and to extend its application to cover the business sectors involved
- New specialized Criminal Court for Corruption and Misconduct Offences (Nov. 2016)
- Measures related to dissemination of information and new procurement system have also been introduced to enhance the transparency of the public sector's projects.
- Integrity Pact
- Construction Sector Transparency Initiative (CoST)
- Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI)
- "Alternative Development" -- a balanced solution to reduce opium cultivation, also reduces the demand and output of the narcotic drugs in parallel with law enforcement.
- Kamlangjai (Inspire) Project (2006) helps people who committed crimes to reintegrate back into society
- "Legal identity" assures rights and access to public services as stipulated in the law, minimizes risk of being violated or not sufficiently protected by law. Implemented through birth registration and the Royal Project on DNA Testing (2013)
- Thai constitution's (1997) provisions to ensure citizens' rights to access to information

	Development Model "Happy Village based on 9 Virtues," Buriram Province							
<b>SDG 17</b>	• Public Private Steering Committee or the "Pracharath Mechanism" established in 2015							
	between the government, private sector, and civil society.							
	• "Net Pracharath" program to expand affordable high-speed broadband system nationwide							
	<ul> <li>National Committee for Sustainable Development (CSD) is a national mechanism to</li> </ul>							
	formulate polices and strategies on national sustainable development across economic, social							
	and environment dimensions in a balanced and integrated manner, provide recommendation							
	to improve economic, social and legal measures, as well as promote and support public and							
	private agencies' activities related to sustainable development, and oversee the							
	implementation of government agencies.							
	• Driving SDGs in the public sector mainly uses annual budget that the Government has							
	allocated to agencies.							
	• Thailand has set targets in expanding the country's R&D expenditures from 0.62% in 2015 to	)						
	1.5% by 2021 and increasing the number of R&D personnel from 13.6 researchers per 10,000	)						
	people in 2015 to 25 researchers per 10,000 populations by 2021.							

Source: (Thailand 2017)

**Budget:** Thailand's VNR indicated that "plans and budgeting of all government agencies will be in line with SEP [Sufficiency Economy Philosophy] and SDGs" (p. iv). In discussing means of implementation, the VNR further clarified that SDGs mainly use the "annual budget that the Government has allocated to the agencies," (p. 54) since SDGs have been integrated into the 20-Year National Strategy Framework and the 12<sup>th</sup> National Economic and Social Development Plan.

The VNR mentioned only three specific budget amounts, for 2 programs under SDG 1 and 1 fund under SDG 9, totalling over USD 3 billion. These are mentioned below in Table 17. The VNR also mentioned that some national and local institutions and organisations have adopted the SDG framework and integrated it into their policies and budgets.

However, probably most or nearly all of Thailand's government budget was in some way associated with SDGs. Therefore, these 3 specific items should be considered only as examples. Thailand's list of policies related to SDGs was very large and broad-ranging, probably including most or nearly all of Thailand's policies. Therefore, is seems safe to assume that their related budgets were also linked with SDGs.

Table 17: Budget Allocations Mentioned in Thailand's VNR

SDGs	Budget Item	Amount (USD)
SDG 1	• Financial subsidy to low income families (7.34 million senior citizens	• 2.09 billion
	and 1.67 million disabled people)	• 499 million
	• State Social Welfare Scheme supporting poor people (2016 amount))	
SDG 9	Pracharath SME Development Fund (public- Private-People Partnership	• 571 million
	mechanism to provide financial support to small and medium enterprises)	
Total		• 3.16 billion

Source: (Thailand 2017)

**Overall:** Thailand's VNR listed numerous concrete laws, policies, and strategies for each SDG. Many appeared to be rather substantial. The VNR presented Thailand's policies as closely related to SDGs. The VNR had very little information on budgets, but it indicated that the policies listed were supported by corresponding government budgeted funds. Overall, Thailand's VNR gave the impression that most or nearly all government policy and the budget were related to SDGs.

#### 3.10 Viet Nam

Strategy: Viet Nam published its VNR in 2018. It addressed all 17 SDGs, and it recognized the importance of interlinkages among the goals. Viet Nam has developed its own national SDG plan, the "National Action Plan for Implementation of the 2030 Agenda," with 115 targets. Viet Nam has also mainstreamed SDGs into its "2011-2020 Social and Economic Development Strategy" (SEDS) and the "2016-2020 Social and Economic Development Plan" (SEDP), and "many SDGs" are "also being integrated into the national development policy system, including laws, socio-economic development strategies and plans as well as action plans of ministries, agencies and provinces." Moreover, the VNR indicated that SDGs will be "fully and further integrated into Viet Nam's 2021-2030 SEDS and 2021-2025 SEDP." The VNR included a detailed explanation of the country's SDG implementation arrangements, including coordination mechanisms.

**Policies:** Relevant policies were highlighted in the discussion of each SDG. These policies and actions are listed in Table 18 below. Many of the policies were adopted before the SDGs, but nevertheless, they still addressed the contents of the SDGs and influenced Viet Nam's progress. The list of laws and policies compiled from the VNR also demonstrated that Viet Nam has made significant efforts in all the SDG areas. Even though only two policies were indicated under SDG 1, it seems clear that many policies listed under the other SDGs were also intended to address poverty. The VNR discussed the policies in the context of the results, and it indicated remaining gaps. Moreover, in many cases, the text provided concrete suggestions for how the country could achieve better results through strengthening laws and policy frameworks and/or enhancing enforcement. The text also expressed an intention to develop future policies and plans more directly in line with SDGs in order to make further progress.

Table 18: Concrete SDG Implementation Policies Listed in Viet Nam's VNR

SDG	Policies						
SDG 1	(Policies are said to be "relatively comprehensive in terms of content and supported targets.")						
	NTP on Sustainable Poverty Reduction						
	2011-2020 Development Strategy of the Viet Nam Bank for Social Policies						
SDG 2	Resolution 80/NQ-CP on sustainable poverty reduction						
	Decision 899/QD-TTg approving a project on agricultural restructuring						
	Scheme on development of hi-tech agriculture until 2020						
	National Nutrition Strategy 2011-2020						
	NTP on New Rural Development in 2016-2020						
	Integrated Coastal Management Programme						
SDG 3	Law on Health Insurance						
	Law on Medical Examination and Treatment						
	Law on Children						
	Law on HIV/AIDS						
	Law on Tobacco Control						
	Law on the Elderly						
	National Strategy for Protection, Care, and Promotion of People's Health in 2011-2020						
	National Population and Reproductive Health Strategy in 2011-2020						
	Viet Nam Youth Development Strategy in 2011-2020						
	National Strategy on Malaria Elimination and Prevention in Viet Nam in 2011-2020 and						
	Orientation to 2030						
	National Strategy for Prevention and Control of Tuberculosis in Viet Nam by 2020 and						
	Vision to 2030						
	National Strategy on Cancer, Cardiovascular Disease, Diabetes, Chronic Obstructive						
	Pulmonary Diseases, Bronchial Asthma & Other Non-Communicable Diseases in 2015-25						
	Non-Communicable Disease Prevention Plan in 2015-2020						

	National Pood Safety Strategy to 2020 and Vision to 202
	<ul> <li>National Road Safety Strategy to 2020 and Vision to 203</li> <li>Some resolutions and Action Plans of the MOH, other ministries and provinces</li> </ul>
SDG 4	("Education is defined as the top national priority")
5204	Law on Education
	Law on Vocational Education
	Law on Vocational Training
	XI Party Central Committee Resolution of reformation, inclusivity of education and training
	Education Development Strategy 2011-20
	2011–2020 TVET Development Strategy
	Vocational Training for Rural Workers to 2020
	Viet Nam Human Resources Development Strategy 2011-2020
	Viet Nam Youth Development Strategy 2011-2020
	Decree No. 20/2014/ND-CP on Education Universalization and Illiteracy Eradication
	Action Plan on Gender Equality in Education 2016-2020
	• Framework on Building a Learning Society for the period 2012-2020
	Scheme on Stamping out Illiteracy by 2020
	Exemption from tuition fees for five-year-old children in socio-economically disadvantaged areas from 2018
	National Law on Persons with Disabilities 2012
	Inclusive Education Guidelines for Persons with Disabilities 2006
SDG 5	Gender equality principles are mentioned in the Constitution
~_ 0 0	Gender Equality Law
	Law on the Election of Deputies to the National Assembly and People's Council
	Law on Support to Small and Medium Enterprises
	Law on Promulgation of Legal Documents
	National Strategy on Gender Equality for the period 2011-2020
	• Directive 18/CT-TTg dated 16 May 16 2017 on Enhancing Measures to Prevent Violence and
	sexual abuse against Children
	Specific measures to address sexual harassment are also provided for in Labour Code 10/2012/QH1
	Program for Prevention and Response to Gender-Based Violence in the 2016-2020 and Vision to 2030
	NAP on Prevention of Domestic Violence 2014-2020
	Project on the Reduction of Domestic Violence in Rural Areas of Viet Nam in 2015-2020
	Annual Plan to Minimize teen marriage & consanguineous marriage in ethnic minorities in
	2018
	Programme on Support to gender equality among ethnic minorities in 2018-2025
SDG 6	Law on Environmental Protection
	Law on Construction  By 15 and 1
	<ul> <li>Law on Biodiversity</li> <li>Law on Water Resources</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Law on Water Resources</li> <li>Resolution No.24-NQ/TW of the Central Committee on pro-active climate change adaptation</li> </ul>
	and strengthening of natural resources management and environmental protection
	Resolution No.142/2016/QH13 on the five-Year SEDP in 2016-2020 with important
	environmental indicators
	National Strategy on Water Resources to 2020
	National Strategy for Environmental Protection up to 2020 with a vision to 2030
	National Programme on Safe Water Supply 2016-2025
	National Plan of Action to improve efficiency of water resource management, protection and utilization during 2014-2020
	NTP on new rural development during 2016-2020
	• Given the target of improved water use efficiency, in addition to the Law on Water
CDC 5	Resources adopted in 2012, the GOVN approved four other decrees.
SDG 7	Law on Electricity     Electricity Plan VIII
	Electricity Plan VII     Renewable Energy Development Strategy to 2030 with a Vision to 2050
	Renewable Energy Development Strategy to 2030 with a Vision to 2050

Law on Economic and Efficient Use of Energy and Viet Nam National Energy Development until 2020 with a Vision to 2050 Strategy of cleaner production in the industry sector by 2020 2013-2020 programme on electricity supply to rural, mountainous and island areas SDG 8 Labour Code Law on Employment Law on Labour Safety and Sanitation Law on Supporting Small and Medium Enterprises • Law on Planning National Green Growth Strategy 2011-2020 and Vision to 2050 Overall Plan for economic restructuring associated with the transformation of the growth model towards improved quality, efficiency and competitiveness capacity during 2013-2020 National Action Program on Sustainable Production and Consumption by 2020 with a vision National Program on Industrial Promotion until 2020 Scheme for Supporting Small and Medium enterprises in the development of sectoral linkage Strategy for Labour and Social International Integration until 2020 with a vision to 2030 Youth Development Strategy 2011-2020 Viet Nam ILO National Cooperation Program for Sustainable Employment 2017-2021 Tourism Development towards Sustainability which is promoted through the Viet Nam Tourism Development Strategy to 2020 with a vision to 2030 Master Plan of Viet Nam Tourism Development to 2020 with a vision to 2030 Resolution No. 142/OH13/2016 of the National Assembly setting out the 5-year Socio-Economic Development Plan 2016-2020 has integrated the target of reduced energy consumption per GDP into the national socioeconomic index system. SDG 9 Viet Nam Transport Development Strategy to 2020 Viet Nam Railway Transport Development Strategy to 2020 with a vision to 2050 Resolution No.13-NQ/TW, 16 January 2012 on Building a Comprehensive Infrastructure System to make Viet Nam a Modern Industrialized Nation by 2020 The formation of a comprehensive infrastructure system is considered one of the three breakthroughs of the 2011-2020 Socio-Economic Development Strategy and is also an important factor that has promoted and restructured the economy. Sustainable and inclusive industrialization is also one of the main focuses of the Socio-Economic Development Strategy, Viet Nam Sustainable Development Strategy, and Viet Nam Industrial Development Strategy to 2025 with a vision to 2035. **SDG 10** Article 16 of the Constitution 2013 Civil Code Law on Access to Information **Budget Law** Public Investment Law Law on Legal Aid Law on Religion and Folk Beliefs Decision 225/QD-TTg on administration reforms during 2016-2020 was issued on 4 February 2016 to promote greater transparency and participation of people in national and local socio-The Prime Minister has issued many Decrees and Decisions related to supporting policies for education, health care, preferential credit, housing, legal aid, production development, science & technology development, ethnic minorities, vocational training and employment. Viet Nam ratified the UN Convention on Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) in Feb. 2015 Plan for the Implementation of the Convention and the Disability Support Program for the period 2012-2030 A network of social assistance facilities has been established and developed in 63 provinces/cities with 418 public and non-public social support facilities, including 195 public facilities and 223 non-public facilities. **SDG 11** Law on Housing National Strategy for Housing Development until 2020 and Vision to 2030

- Decisions to adjust the Transport Development Strategy of Viet Nam to 2020 and Vision to 2030 and the Project on Restructuring of the Transport Sector for Industrialization, Modernization and Sustainable Development until 2020 are aimed at developing a sustainable transport system.
- The Law on Natural Disaster Prevention and Control, particularly the Master Plan on Disaster Response, Search and Rescue to 2020, has concretized disaster prevention and control, response, search and rescue.
- The National Strategy for Environmental Protection up to 2020 and Vision to 2030 aims at reducing environment-related damage to people.
- The Orientation for the Development of Urban Drainage and Industrial Parks in Viet Nam by 2025, with Vision to 2050, has specified water drainage issues in urban areas and industrial zones for action.
- Law on Urban Planning and Master Plan Orientation for Viet Nam's Urban System Development to 2025 and Vision to 2050
- National Strategy on Climate Change
- Scheme of Urban Development in response to Climate Change during 2013-2020
- The goal of sustainable rural development is also one of the priority orientations for sustainable development in the Strategy of Sustainable Development during 2011-2020 and is concretized through the NTP for New Rural Development during 2010-2020.

- National Strategy for Sustainable Development in 2011-2020
- National Strategy on Green Growth in 2022-2020 and Vision to 2050
- Strategy on Cleaner Industrial Production until 2020
- Law on Economical and Efficient Use of Energy
- NAP on Sustainable Production and Consumption until 2020 and Vision to 2030
- Green labels
- Compulsory energy labels for some cars
- Compulsory roadmap for energy labelling for motorbikes
- Sustainable public procurement
- Natural resources taxes of mineral mining and water
- Environmental protection tax and environmental protection fees on wastewater
- Law on Environmental Protection 2010
- Law on Natural Resources 2009
- Abolished direct subsidies on fossil fuels and phasing out indirect subsidies
- Public awareness communication for sustainable consumption and production
- SWITCH Asia Programme (with the EU)

- Party Central Committee's Resolution 24-NQ/TW on active response to climate change
- National Strategy on Climate Change
- National Strategy on Green Growth
- Resolution 120/NQ-CP on sustainable development of the Mekong Delta in adaptation to climate change
- NTP to Respond to Climate Change and Green Growth in 2016-2020
- Plan for the Implementation of the Paris Agreement on Climate Change
- Scheme for managing GHG emissions and carbon credit trading in the world market
- Law on Natural Disaster Prevention and Control
- Law on Irrigation
- Law on Water Resources
- Law on Economical and Efficient Use of Energy
- Law on Environmental Protection
- Some ministerial level guiding documents (including action plans to respond to climate change issued by MARD, MONRE, MOTC and MOC) harmonized contents of national strategies & action plans with these Ministries' and sectors' mandates and tasks.
- National Committee on Climate Change was established.
- Apart from MONRE as the lead agency for climate change, most ministries, related agencies and provinces have already set up specialized climate change agencies and units.
- Viet Nam has developed climate change impact scenarios for different regions and is continuing to update these scenarios.

- In accordance with the Law on Environmental Protection 2005 (implemented in 2006), climate change has been integrated in most strategies, planning and plans through strategic environmental assessment tools.
- Flash flood risk zoning maps, landslide maps
- NAP on GHG emissions mitigation
- REDD+

- Law on Environmental Protection
- Law on the Sea of Viet Nam.
- Law on Natural Resources and Environment of Sea and Islands
- Law on Fisheries
- The 11th Party Central Committee's Resolution No. 24-NQ/TW dated 3 June 2013 on active response to climate change and improved management of natural resources and environmental protection.
- Strategy for Sustainable Exploitation and Use of Natural Resources and Protection of Marine Environment
- National Strategy on Biodiversity
- Viet Nam Fisheries Development Strategy until 2020
- Planning of Viet Nam's Marine Protected Area System up to 2020
- Planning of Systems of Inland Water Conservation Zones up to 2020
- Systems of marine protected areas and inland water conservation zones have been developed.
- Participatory and community-based management models have been scaled up
- Mechanisms and policies for effective and sustainable management of inland fisheries exploitation and fisheries management have been established.
- To tackle illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) fishing, Viet Nam has codified all the related content in the Law on Fisheries which was passed by the National Assembly on 21 November 2017, and issued the NAP to prevent, mitigate and eliminate IUU until 2025.
- Viet Nam has established 10 marine protected areas (MPA). Their total area is 270,272 ha, accounting for 0.24 percent of the total sea area of Viet Nam.

- Law on Biodiversity
- Law on Environment Protection
- Law on Forest Protection and Development
- Law on Forestry
- Resolution 24-NQ/TW dated 3 June 2013 of the 11th Party Central Committee on active responses to climate change, improved natural resource management and environmental protection
- Strategy of Environmental Protection
- Strategy of Viet Nam Forestry Development 2006-2020
- Strategy of Special-use Forests Management and National Strategy on Biodiversity up to 2020 with a vision to 2030
- National Action Plan to Combat Desertification in 2006.
- Master Plan for the Biodiversity Conservation up to 2020 and Orientation to 2030. This is the
  basis for the development and approval of biodiversity conservation plans at provincial
  level in 18 provinces. Other 13 provinces are currently formulating their plans.
- Eight Ramsar Sites and six ASEAN Heritage Parks
- Viet Nam has established 164 special use forests, including 31 national parks, 57 nature reserves, 45 landscape protected areas and 20 forests for scientific research and experiments on 2.2 million hectares.
- According to the National Master Plan of Special Use Forest System, the protected area system will be expanded to cover 2.4 million hectares or 176 protected areas. In addition, 16 MPAs and 45 inland water conservation areas (including special-use forests) have been included in the master plan.
- Viet Nam and the European Union (EU) concluded negotiations and entered a Voluntary Partnership Agreement on EU Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade (VPA/FLEGT) in 2017.
- Forest environmental services payment, which helps generate income for households participating in forest protection and improves values of forestry products and forest protection efficiency

	•	Viet Nam has established a National Coordination Board for implementation of the United							
		Nations Convention to Combat Desertification in 2003.							
<b>SDG 16</b>	•	Viet Nam has ratified seven conventions related to human rights, including five conventions							
		related to the labour-social sectors.							
	•	Within the framework of ILO, Viet Nam has acceded to 21 conventions.							
	•	The guarantee of equity to all citizens is enshrined in the Constitution 2013.							
	•	Criminal Code							
	•	Law on Prevention of Money Laundering							
	•	Law on Civil Status							
	•	Law on Citizen Identification							
	•	Law on Children							
	•	Law on Access to Information							
	•	Law on Management and Use of Weapons, Explosives and Combat Gear							
	•	Law on Legal Aid and related policies							
	•	The government proposes to add "the Law amending and supplementing some articles of the							
		Law on Promulgation of Legislative Documents" in the law and ordinance making program							
		so as to reach target 16.7 on ensuring that decision-making processes are responsive,							
		inclusive, participatory and representative at all levels.							
	•	Major judicial and legislative reforms (including the Criminal Code, Code of Civil Procedure,							
		Law on Enforcement of Custody and Temporary Detention, Law on Anti-Corruption, Law on Access to Information, Law on Religion and Folk Beliefs) have been implemented to ensure							
		Access to Information, Law on Religion and Folk Beliefs) have been implemented to ensure people's full enjoyment of human rights.							
		The Politburo issued Decision 217-QD/MT on "the Regulation on monitoring and social							
		commentary of Viet Nam Fatherland Front and political-social organizations," Inter-							
		ministerial Resolution 403, and documents to strengthen monitoring and social commentary							
		by Viet Nam Fatherland Front and socio-political organizations							
<b>SDG 17</b>	•	Law on Investment							
	•	Overall Strategy for International Integration to 2020 with a Vision toward 2030							
	•	Export-Import Strategy 2011-2020 with a Vision to 2030							
	•	CPTPP							
	•	MOIT is formulating the Strategy for Domestic Trade Development to 2025 with a Vision to							
		2035, with structural shifts in four areas: (i) institutional reform from a planned economy to a							
		market economy; (ii) transformation from agriculture to processing and services; (iii) solving							
		problems related to migration from rural to urban areas; and (iv) shifting from an export-							
		based economy to an economy with in-depth integration							
	•	Development of institutions and legal frameworks to facilitate PPP since 1992							
	•	As at the end of 2016, Viet Nam had signed, implemented and was negotiating 16 FTAs.							

Source: (Viet Nam 2018)

**Budget:** Viet Nam's VNR stated that "the majority of funding for medium-term public investment plans (2016-2020) is being channelled towards implementing the SDGs." This amount totals VND 2,000,000 billion. Budget amounts for specific SDGs, targets, or programs are not mentioned, although for SDG9, the share of state spending on science and technology as a share of overall state spending was indicated (ranging from 0.6 to 0.8 percent annually from 2014-2016). Nevertheless, the previous section indicates that many of Viet Nam's existing laws and policies are related to SDGs, so presumably their associated budgets are similarly related.

**Overall:** The analysis of Vietnam's VNR shows that the country has many laws and policies related to the SDGs, and that sustainable development principles are incorporated into the main development plans. Many of these laws and plans were adopted before SDGs were decided, but they nevertheless contribute to SDG implementation. Although the VNR said little about budgets, it seems clear that the budgets related to the existing SDG-related laws and policies are similarly related to the SDGs.

# 4. COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

This section compares the ASEAN countries in terms of their 1) overall strategy, 2) policies to implement the SDGs and SDG prioritization, and 3) budget allocation for SDGs. This comparison only includes the countries which submitted VNRs as of 2019 and is based only on the information contained in these VNRs, as summarized above.

# 4.1 Comparison of Countries' Overall Strategy and Approach to VNRs and SDGs

ASEAN countries adopted generally similar approaches to the structure of their VNRs. Table 19 summarizes the overall approaches of the ASEAN and G20 countries. Most of the reporting ASEAN countries (7 of 9) adopted the most comprehensive and straightforward approach, which was to report on all the SDGs in order. Two ASEAN countries (Indonesia and the Philippines) only reported on the SDGs which were highlighted at the HLPF during the year that the VNR was prepared. Indonesia and the Philippines also prepared two VNRs. Myanmar has not indicated any plan to issue a VNR.

Table 19: Overall Situation and Strategy for Reporting SDGs in the VNRs of the ASEAN Countries

Reported all SDGs individually	Reported all SDGs in clusters	Reported only SDGs highlighted at HLPF	2 VNRs issued	VNR not planned
[7 countries]	[None]	[2 countries]	[2 countries]	[1 country]
Brunei		Indonesia	• Indonesia	Myanmar
• Cambodia		• Philippines	<ul> <li>Philippines</li> </ul>	
Lao PDR				
<ul> <li>Malaysia</li> </ul>				
Thailand				
<ul> <li>Singapore</li> </ul>				
• Viet Nam				

Source: Overall, this table is based on countries' respective VNRs and the Voluntary National Reviews Database of the UN's Sustainable Development Knowledge Platform.<sup>3</sup>

## 4.2 Policy Comparison

Policies are an important means to implement the SDGs, but they are very difficult to compare, since they differ in many respects such as scale, scope, legal status, degree of implementation, and overall significance (Elder and Bartalini 2019). Moreover, countries may have differed in terms of the how comprehensively they listed their policies in their VNRs. Still, the number of policies may provide at least some indication of effort and relative prioritization, and the information is easily available from the countries' VNRs.

This section examines two aspects of policies reported in VNRs. First, it compares the number of policies in the VNRs of the ASEAN countries, as well as their distribution among SDGs. Second, it compares the number of policies reported by the ASEAN with the levels of their GDP, GDP per capita, and the year of their VNR.

The ASEAN countries reported a total of 1,573 policies in their VNRs as indicated in Table 20, which is an average of almost 175 policies per country. The number of policies related to each SDG is also indicated. This table combines the policies listed in Indonesia's 2017 and 2019 VNRs, which mainly addressed the focused SDGs highlighted at the HLPF in those years.

The Philippines also issued two VNRs, but specific policies were only listed in the second one (and these were only related to the SDGs highlighted at the HLPF that year), and these are recorded here. An 18<sup>th</sup> SDG on land mines was added by two countries, Cambodia and Lao PDR. Brunei listed the largest number of policies (270), followed by Singapore (235), Indonesia (225), and Thailand (215). If Myanmar's 34 policies are added, the total would be 1,607.

The total number of policies is probably underreported in the ASEAN countries' VNRs, despite the apparently large number of policies listed. Indonesia and the Philippines did not report on all SDGs, even though they submitted 2 VNRs, but it is safe to assume that both countries have policies relating to the SDGs which were not covered in their VNRs.

Moreover, underreporting of policies is likely even in the case of some SDGs for which countries already listed some policies. This can be seen when considering some specific targets. Of course, it may be difficult to expect all countries to have policies for all 169 targets. However, some targets for which most countries have policies were often not addressed, especially relating to the environment. Air pollution is a major example: three SDG targets under SDGs 3 (health), 11 (cities), and 12 (sustainable consumption and production) are directly related to air pollution, while another six targets are indirectly related to air pollution (Elder and Zusman 2016). However, even though all ASEAN countries mentioned here clearly have air pollution policies (Elder 2015), these policies were not mentioned in the countries' VNRs, except for Cambodia. Similarly, all ASEAN countries have various waste management policies (Drafting Committee 2018), but they do not appear to be listed very systematically in the SDGs which have targets directly or indirectly related to waste management, especially SDGs 6 and 11. In some cases, some of the targets may be addressed by various overarching national strategies and action plans, which most ASEAN countries have. However, while these national plans and strategies were repeated by some countries for some SDGs, they may not necessarily have been applied consistently to all SDGs with related targets.

Under reporting of policies is not limited to the ASEAN countries. A similar study of the G20 found that their policies are also probably under reported (Elder and Bartalini 2019).

Table 20: Comparison of Number of Policies by SDG for ASEAN Countries

SDG	Indonesia	Indonesia	Indonesia	Brunei	Cambodia	Lao PDR	Malaysia	Philippines	Singapore	Thailand	Viet Nam	Total
VNR YR=>	2017	2019	(total)	2020	2019	2018	2018	2019	2018	2017	2018	
1	24	1	25	27	6	1	5		15	16	2	97
2	18		18	13	5	3	10		7	7	6	69
3	10		10	13	4	1	9		14	9	15	75
4		28	28	19	13	0	5	13	11	11	16	116
5	20		20	15	14	12	7		20	8	13	109
6				3	5	3	2		11	4	12	40
7				9	1	1	4		10	15	6	46
8		20	20	31	9	5	4	23	6	17	16	131
9	10	1	11	10	8	2	13		10	21	5	80
10		9	9	21	11	1	5	16	14	12	12	101
11				24	14	6	8		28	15	10	105
12		1	1	14	7	5	8		33	9	16	93
13		24	24	10	8	8	5	26	19	7	20	127
14	8	2	10	10	8	0	17		9	26	15	95
15				17	4	10	16		10	18	16	91
16		22	22	34	5	2	8	9	13	15	14	122
17		27	27	0	3	14	4	5	5	5	7	70
18					3	3						6
Total	90	135	225	270	128	77	130	92	235	215	201	1,573

Source: Author's compilation from countries' VNRs based on the country tables above.

Note: The number of policies from Indonesia's 2 VNRs were added together.

The distribution of policies among SDGs may be somewhat unexpected. Table 21 lists the SDGs in order of the total number of policies listed by the ASEAN countries. SDG 13 (climate) had the largest number of policies followed closely by SDGs 8 (economic growth and decent work), 4 (education), and 5 (gender equality). In contrast, SDGs 6 (water) and 7 (energy) had the smallest number of policies. SDG 1 on poverty reduction, the highest priority in global negotiations to establish the SDGs, had a medium number of policies.

The number of policies listed under each SDG could be more related to the year they were highlighted at the HLPF and the year of countries' VNRs rather than each SDG's actual prioritization by countries (see Table 21). Indonesia and the Philippines only listed policies for the SDGs highlighted at the HLPF during their reporting years, and neither country reported in the year when SDGs 6 and 7 were highlighted. Moreover, while Indonesia issued two VNRs, the Philippines issued only one (in 2019). Therefore, the SDGs highlighted in 2019 had the most policies listed. SDG 1 was highlighted early, in 2017, a year in which only 2 ASEAN countries reported VNRs. Also, many developing countries planned to use SDGs as a way to attract more external development financing, so to some extent the prioritization may reflect areas which countries believe might interest donors.

The issues addressed by SDGs are not new, so most countries' existing policies may be related to SDGs. It is not an easy task for any country to summarize all its policies and reclassify them into the SDG framework, and it may be especially difficult for developing countries.

Table 21: Total Number of Policies of ASEAN Countries by SDG

SDG	HLPF Year*	Number of policies
8	2019	131
13	2019	127
16	2019	122
4	2019	116
5	2017	109
11	2018	105
10	2019	101
1	2017	97
14	2017	95
12	2018	93
15	2018	91
9	2017	80
3	2017	75
17	All	70
2	2017	69
7	2018	46
6	2018	40

\*Highted at the HLPF Source: Table 20

# 4.3 Budget Comparison

ASEAN countries reported very little specific budget information in their VNRs. Four countries reported a few specific examples: Indonesia (9 examples from 6 SDGs), Brunei (7 examples from SDG 1), Singapore (4 examples), Thailand (3 examples), and Cambodia (1 example).

Nevertheless, it is evident that the ASEAN countries have been allocating significant funds to the SDGs from their national budgets. Some countries mentioned this directly in their VNRs: Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines, and Thailand. Viet Nam's VNR states that funding from "public investment plans" is used. All ASEAN countries listed many policies in their VNRs. These policies included major national development policies or major strategies in various policy areas, for which national government budgets are clearly key funding sources.

SDGs are very broad-ranging and are related to most policy areas and related government spending including agriculture, transport, health, pensions, education, energy, infrastructure, water, environment, employment support, etc. It is not easy to think of policy/budget areas which are not related to SDGs other than interest payments on government debt or possibly military spending. Therefore, it is reasonable to assume that a major part of many countries' national budgets in fact is already being spent on SDGs, regardless of whether national governments have officially recognized it or mapped their budget to the SDGs.

This report looks at government revenues and spending as a share of GDP in order to see how much national governments are potentially already spending on the SDGs. These figures are indicated below in Table 22. The total GDP of the 10 ASEAN countries is nearly USD 3 trillion, while the average share of government expenditures in GDP is about 20 percent. Therefore, the government spending of these ASEAN countries totals nearly USD 600 billion. It could be speculated that 50 to 75 percent of government spending might already be contributing to the countries' current levels of achievement of SDGs. The share of government spending contributing to SDGs could be more accurately estimated if governments conduct mapping exercises, as some G20 countries are doing (Elder and Bartalini 2019).

Table 22: Number of SDG Policies Compared to GDP, GDP per capita, and Government Revenues and Expenditures/ GDP

Country	Total GDP (2018) (W. Bank)	GDP Per capita (2018) (W. Bank)	Gov. revenue/ GDP (2016) (IMF)	Gov. expenditure/ GDP (2016) (IMF)	Total SDG Policies	Latest VNR Year
	USD (mil)	Current USD	Percent	Percent	Number	
Brunei	13,567	31,628	NA	NA	270	2020
Singapore	364,157	64,582	19.8	14.4	235	2018
Indonesia	1,042,173	3,894	14.4	16.9	225	2019
Thailand	504,993	7,274	21.9	21.3	215	2017
Vietnam	244,948	2,564	21.8	27.5	201	2018
Malaysia	354,348	11,239	17.3	20.3	130	2018
Cambodia	24,572	1,512	19.7	20.0	121	2019
Philippines	330,910	3,103	15.2	17.4	92	2016
Lao PDR	18,131	2,568	16.2	21.1	77	2018
Myanmar	71,215	1,326	16.5	22.2	34**	NA
Average	296,901	12,969	18.1	20.1	161	
Total	2,969,014				1,607	
Average*	321,978	14,263	18.3	19.9	175	2018
Total*	2,897,799		529,935***	575,575***	1,573	

<sup>\*</sup> Includes only the countries which submitted VNRs (excluding Myanmar)

Sources: World Bank, IMF, (Elder and Bartalini 2019), author's calculation.

<sup>\*\*</sup> Policies included in Malaysia's Development Plan, which was not submitted as a VNR.

<sup>\*\*\*</sup> Average percent of the total of the 8 countries (excluding Brunei and Myanmar)

## 5. CONCLUSIONS

Regarding the overall situation and strategy of the VNRs, seven ASEAN countries reported progress and policies on all SDGs. Two ASEAN countries, Indonesia and the Philippines, reported only on the SDGs highlighted at the HLPF during the year of each VNR; both of these countries each issued a total of 2 VNRs in separate years. Indonesia reported detailed efforts on specific SDGs in both VNRs, so Indonesia covered most of the SDGs, while the Philippines reported on detailed policies for specific SDGs only in its second VNR, and these were limited to the ones highlighted at that year's HLPF. Myanmar did not report a VNR, but its Myanmar Sustainable Development Plan (2018-2030) is similar to a VNR; it mentions specific policies and is linked to SDGs.

Regarding policies, all ASEAN countries which issued VNRs reported a substantial list of specific policies, ranging from 77 (Lao PDR) to 270 (Brunei) with an average of about 175 policies per country. The 9 ASEAN countries listed a total of 1,573 policies (1,607 including Myanmar's).

An important implication is that countries are probably under reporting their policies, especially countries which listed fewer policies. However, some existing policies also seem to be missing in some areas (for example, air pollution), even in countries which reported many policies. This may be due to various factors such as the wide scope of the SDGs (covering most or all of each countries' policies), the SDGs' complexity which makes it difficult to see their complex interlinkages and determine how many targets each policy applies to, and limited time and resources for preparing VNRs. Later VNRs tend to have more policies than earlier ones.

It is also difficult to determine to what extent the SDGs are encouraging new policies. Some policies were in place before SDGs were adopted, and for others, it is not clear what date they were adopted. However, even in the case of policies which were clearly adopted during the SDG period, it is difficult to determine to what extent SDGs influenced their adoption. In some cases, countries indicated that SDGs influenced the policies' adoption, but in other cases it is not clear. In many cases, the differences between new and old policies was not explained. Moreover, many countries regularly update major plans and strategies after a fixed number of years (such as 5-year plans, 10-year plans, etc.). In many cases, these plans would have been updated anyway, with or without SDGs. SDGs may have influenced them in some cases, but not necessarily all cases. More detailed research is needed to determine to what extent SDGs are influencing the development of policies.

Regarding budgets, ASEAN countries reported very little specific budget information in their VNRs. Despite this, it is likely that they are devoting substantial budget resources to the SDGs. The large number of policies listed by the ASEAN countries include many broad national strategies, plans, and policies, which clearly receive major budget allocations. For whatever reason, the ASEAN countries did not indicate the related budget amounts in their VNRs for the many policies which they listed.

A major part of national government budgets (except for spending on items such as interest payments and defence) may be considered related to SDGs. The SDGs are so broad that they cover most policy areas addressed by government budgets. ASEAN countries' national government expenditures averaged about 20 percent of GDP totalling USD 600 billion. Thus, the actual level of spending on SDGs is probably quite significant.

It is important to recognize the substantial limitations of using the number of policies to indicate effort. Policies come in many shapes and sizes, some policies are better funded than others,

and many policies are not implemented very well or at all. It was sometimes difficult to distinguish between existing and new policies.

Nevertheless, policies are a key means of implementation for national governments, which generally made major efforts to discuss them in their VNRs. Moreover, the lists of policies in the VNRs indicated that the countries were indeed making at least a certain amount of effort to implement the SDGs. Many countries clearly had a range of policies addressing all SDGs. Other countries which reported only selected SDGs were clearly making significant efforts on them. However, if it is assumed that most or all government policies were related to SDGs, then even countries that did not report on all SDGs were nevertheless likely to have policies relating to the unmentioned SDGs as well. Therefore, it suggests that many VNRs probably underestimated policy efforts.

Recommendations for preparations of VNRs going forward are basically the same as the study by Elder and Bartalini (2019) on the G20 countries. This is natural since the conclusions of the previous research on the G20 countries were quite similar to the conclusions reached by this study of the ASEAN countries.

The key point is that there should be more explanation of which efforts are new and/or additional, and how they are linked with progress on outcomes. This means that countries should report policies and budgets indicating which are existing, continuing, and new. Budgets should be clearly linked to the related policies.

It is important and reasonable to indicate existing policies because they are related to countries' existing levels of achievement of SDGs. It is also important to recognize that the issues addressed by SDGs are not really new, and most countries long ago adopted some policies to address these issues well before anyone labelled them as "SDGs." Thus, countries should get credit for their efforts which have contributed to their current level of achievement.

It is not intended to encourage countries to simply list a large number of policies. Clearly, the number of policies is not a good indicator of effort. Nevertheless, the analysis of this report shows that generally, countries already have a large number of existing policies which are related to the SDGs (and many of them existed even before the SDGs). Therefore, in order to assess the degree of effort as well as the progress of implementation of the SDGs, it is useful for countries to list the most important policies in their VNRs more systematically and discuss their effectiveness.

The research community needs to make more efforts to analyse policy effectiveness, not just measure levels of SDG attainment. This would be greatly enhanced by better reporting of policies and budgets in VNRs. Nevertheless, this report shows that even current listings of policies in countries' VNRs already provide a good basis to begin the analysis of policy effectiveness by identifying a range of major policies organized by SDG. Likewise, such analysis could help countries to improve the effectiveness of their policies, thereby raising their level of SDG achievement.

To facilitate this, the research community could also develop guidelines for reporting policies and budgets in VNRs in a more systematic and comparable manner. This could include definitions and classifications of types of polices and budgets. Such guidelines would make it easier to understand countries' actual priorities and levels of effort.

## REFERENCES

- ASEAN-Thailand. 2018. Progress Report: Promoting Complementarities Between the ASEAN Community Vision 2025 and the UN 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. Bangkok, Thailand: Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Thailand. http://www.mfa.go.th/asean/contents/files/news-20180806-173758-211968.pdf.
- Bertelsmann Stiftung, and Sustainable Development Solutions Network. 2018. "SDG Index and Dashboard Report 2018 Global Responsibilities Implementing the Goals."
- CCIC Canadian Council for International Co-operation. 2018. "Progressing National SDGs Implementation: An Independent Assessment of the Voluntary National Review Reports Submitted to the United Nations High-Level Political Forum on Sustainable Development in 2017," 189.
- Drafting Committee. 2018. State of the 3Rs in Asia and the Pacific: Experts' Assessment of Progress in Ha Hoi 3R Goals. Nagoya, Japan: UN Centre for Regional Development (UNCRD), Institute for Global Environmental Strategies (IGES), and the Ministry of Environment of Japan. https://www.iges.or.jp/en/pub/state-3rs-asia-and-pacific-experts-assessment/en.
- Elder, Mark. 2015. "Air Pollution and Regional Economic Integration in East Asia: Implications and Recommendations." In *Greening Integration in Asia: How Regional Integration Can Benefit People and the Environment*, edited by IGES, 117–47. Hayama, Japan: Institute for Global Environmental Strategies. http://pub.iges.or.jp/modules/envirolib/upload/6054/attach/IGESWhitePaperV2015\_C07.pdf.
- Elder, Mark, and Anna Bartalini. 2019. Assessment of the G20 Countries' Concrete SDG Implementation Efforts: Policies and Budgets Reported in Their 2016-2018 Voluntary National Reviews. Hayama, Japan: Institute for Global Environmental Strategies. https://iges.or.jp/en/pub/assessment-g20-countries'-concrete-sdg.
- Elder, Mark, and Eric Zusman. 2016. "Strengthening The Linkages Between Air Pollution And The Sustainable Development Goals." *IGES Policy Brief*, July 2016. http://pub.iges.or.jp/modules/envirolib/view.php?docid=6678.
- Government of Brunei Darussalam. 2020. 2020 United Nations High-Level Political Forum on Sustainable Development Voluntary National Review Report of Brunei Darussalam. Ministry of Finance and Economy, Government of Brunei Darussalam. https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/26410VNR\_2020\_Brunei\_Report.pdf.
- Government of Malaysia. 2017. *Malaysia Sustainable Development Goals Voluntary National Review 2017*. Putrajaya, Malaysia: Economic Planning Unit, Prime Minister's Department. https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/15881Malaysia.pdf.
- Government of Singapore. 2018. Towards a Sustainable and Resilient Singapore: Singapore's Voluntary National Review Report to the 2018 UN High Level Political Forum on Sustainable Development. Singapore: Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Singapore. https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/19439Singapores\_Voluntary\_National Review Report v2.pdf.

- Government of the Union of Myanmar. 2018. *Myanmar Sustainable Development Plan* (2018-2030). Govrenment of the Union of Myanmar, Ministry of Planning and Finance. https://themimu.info/sites/themimu.info/files/documents/Core\_Doc\_Myanmar\_Sustaina ble Development Plan 2018 2030 Aug2018.pdf.
- ILO. 2019. *Time to Act for SDG 8: Integrating Decent Work, Sustained Growth and Environmental Integrity*. Geneva: International Labour Organization. https://www.ilo.org/global/publications/books/WCMS 712685/lang--en/index.htm.
- IMF. 2018. ASEAN Progress Towards Sustainable Development Goals and the Role of International Monetary Fund. Bali, Indonesia: International Monetary Fund. https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/Policy-Papers/Issues/2018/11/07/pp101118asean-progress-towards-sdgs.
- Independent Group of Scientists. 2019. *Global Sustainable Development Report 2019*. New York: United Nations. https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/24797GSDR\_report\_2019.pdf...
- Kingdom of Cambodia. 2019. Cambodia's Voluntary National Review 2019 on the Implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. Phomh Penh, Cambodia: Ministry of Planning. https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/23603Cambodia\_VNR\_Publis hingHLPF.pdf.
- Lao PDR. 2019. Lao People's Democratic Republic Voluntary National Review on the Implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/19385Lao\_Final\_VNR\_19\_June\_2018\_web.pdf.
- Partners for Review. 2018a. *Comparative Analysis of 43 VNRs Submitted to the HLPF 2017*. http://www.partners-for-review.de/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/P4R-Comparative-analysis-of-2017-VNRs.pdf.
- ——. 2018b. Voluntary National Reviews Submitted to the 2018 High-Level Political Forum for Sustainable Development: A Comparative Analysis. Bonn and Eschborn, Germany: GIZ. http://www.partners-for-review.de/wp-content/uploads/2019/01/P4R-Comparative-Analysis\_2018-VNRs-OCT-2018.pdf.
- ——. 2019. Voluntary National Reviews Submitted to the 2019 High-Level Political Forum for Sustainable Development: A Comparative Analysis. Bonn and Eschborn, Germany: GIZ. http://www.partners-for-review.de/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/P4R-Analysis-VNRs-2019.pdf.
- Philippines. 2016. Voluntary National Review at the 2016 High-Level Political Forum on the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).
- ——. 2019. The 2019 Voluntary National Review of the Philippines. https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/23366Voluntary\_National\_Review\_2019\_Philippines.pdf.
- Republic of Indonesia. 2017. "Voluntary National Review (VNR): Eradicating Poverty and Promoting Prosperity in a Changing World."
- ——. 2019. Voluntary National Reviews (VNR): Empowering People and Ensuring

- Inclusiveness and Inequality.
- https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/2380320190708\_Final\_VNR\_2019\_Indonesia\_Rev3.pdf.
- Sachs, J., Schmidt-Traub, G., Kroll, C., Lafortune, G., Fuller, G., Woelm, F. 2020. Sustainable Development Report 2020: The Sustainable Development Goals and Covid-19. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. https://s3.amazonaws.com/sustainabledevelopment.report/2020/2020\_sustainable\_development\_report.pdf.
- Sachs, Jeffrey D., Guido Schmidt-Traub, C. Kroll, G. Lafortune, and G. Fuller. 2019. Sustainable Development Report 2019. New York: Bertelsmann Stiftung and Sustainable Development Solutions Network (SDSN). https://s3.amazonaws.com/sustainabledevelopment.report/2019/2019\_sustainable\_development report.pdf.
- Sarwar, Moizza Binat, and Susan Nicolai. 2018. "Briefing Note What Do Analyses of Voluntary National Reviews for Sustainable Development Goals Tell Us about 'Leave No One Behind'?"
- Thailand. 2017. *Thailand's Voluntary National Review on the Implementation of the 2030 Agenda*. https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/16147Thailand.pdf.
- Together 2030. 2017. "Voluntary National Reviews: What Are Countries Prioritizing? A Review of 'Main Messages' from Volunteer Countries Presented for the 2017 Session of the UN High Level Political Forum on Sustainable Development," 15.
- UN DESA. 2017. "Synthesis of Voluntary National Reviews 2017."
- ——. 2018a. Analysis of the Voluntary National Reviews Relating to Sustainable Development Goal 7 2018. New York: United Nations Division for Economic and Social Affairs.
  - https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/index.php?page=view&type=400&nr=2583&men u=35.
- ——. 2018b. "Handbook for the Preparation of Voluntary National Reviews."
- ——. 2018c. "Syntesis of Voluntary National Reviews 2018."
- ——. 2019. *Synthesis of Voluntary National Reviews 2019*. High Level Political Forum on Sustainable Development.
  - https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/252302019\_VNR\_Synthesis\_Report\_DESA.pdf.
- UN Secretary General. 2017. "Repositioning the United Nations Development System to Deliver on the 2030 Agenda: Our Promise for Dignity, Prosperity and Peace on a Healthy Planet (Advance Unedited Version)." *Report of the Secretary General, 72nd Session*, December 2017.
  - https://www.un.org/ecosoc/sites/www.un.org.ecosoc/files/files/en/2018doc/Advance copy of the Report of the Secretary-General on the UNDS repositioning %2B Annex %2821 December 2017rev%29.pdf.
- UNESCAP. 2019. Asia and the Pacific SDG Progress Report 2019. Bangkok, Thailand.
- ——. 2020. *Asia and the Pacific SDG Progress Report 2020*. Bangkok, Thailand: UNESCAP. https://doi.org/10.1017/s0165115300023056.

- UNESCAP, Kingdom of Thailand, and ASEAN. 2017. Complementarities between the ASEAN Community Vision 20205 and the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development: A Framework for Action. Bangkok, Thailand: UNESCAP. https://asean.org/storage/2017/11/FINAL\_Complementarities-Report-no-graphic-oncover.pdf.
- United Nations. 2020. *The Sustainable Development Goals Report 2020*. United Nations. https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/report/2020/The-Sustainable-Development-Goals-Report-2020.pdf.
- Viet Nam. 2018. "Viet Nam's Voluntary National Review of the Sustainable Development Goals."
- Wagner, Lynn. 2018. "Getting to 2030: Tracking SDG Indicators for Evidence of Implementation Progress." *IISD*.

# **ENDNOTES**

<sup>1</sup> Myanmar has not submitted a VNR. This study examines Myanmar's Sustainable Development Plan since it has a similar form as SDGs and it refers to the SDGs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Note: these figures appear to total more than 100 percent, although perhaps some categories are overlapping. Anyway, these are the figures that were reported in the VNR.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Available at <a href="https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/vnrs/">https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/vnrs/</a> (accessed Nov. 29, 2019).

